2	in a high-elevation pine network across the Pyrenees
3	
4	J. Diego Galván ^{1,2*} , Ulf Büntgen ² , Christian Ginzler ² , Håkan Grudd ³ , Emilia Gutiérrez ⁴ ,
5	Inga Labuhn ^{3,5} and J. Julio Camarero ^{4,6}
6	
7	¹ Instituto Pirenaico de Ecología (IPE-CSIC), Avda. Montañana 1005, Apdo. 202, E-50192 Zaragoza,
8	Spain
9	² Swiss Federal Research Institute WSL, Zuercherstrasse 111, 8903 Birmensdorf, Switzerland
10	³ Bolin Centre for Climate Research, Department of Physical Geography and Quaternary Geology,
11	Stockholm University, 10691 Stockholm, Sweden.
12	⁴ Departament d'Ecologia, Universitat de Barcelona, Avda. Diagonal 643, 08028 Barcelona, Spain
13	⁵ Laboratoire des Sciences du Climat et de l'Environnement (LSCE), Gif-sur-Yvette, France.
14	⁶ ARAID, Instituto Pirenaico de Ecología (IPE-CSIC), Avda. Montañana 1005, Apdo. 202, E-50192
15	Zaragoza, Spain
16	
17	*Corresponding author at: Instituto Pirenaico de Ecología (IPE-CSIC), Avda.
18	Montañana 1005, Apdo. 202, E-50192 Zaragoza (Spain). Tel. (+34) 695053174 / (+34)
19	976 369 393, fax 974 363 222, e-mail: jgalvan@ipe.csic.es (J. Diego Galván)
20	

Drought-induced weakening of growth-temperature associations

22 ABSTRACT

The growth/climate relationship of theoretically temperature-controlled high-elevation 23 forests has been demonstrated to weaken over recent decades. This is likely due to new 24 tree growth limiting factors, such as an increasing drought risk for ecosystem 25 functioning and productivity across the Mediterranean Basin. In addition, declining tree 26 growth sensitivity to spring temperature may emerge in response to increasing drought 27 28 stress. Here, we evaluate these ideas by assessing the growth/climate sensitivity of 1500 29 tree-ring width (TRW) and 102 maximum density (MXD) measurement series from 711 and 74 Pinus uncinata trees, respectively, sampled at 28 high-elevation forest sites 30 across the Pyrenees and two relictic populations of the Iberian System. Different 31 32 dendroclimatological standardization and split period approaches were used to assess the high- to low-frequency behaviour of 20th century tree growth in response to 33 34 temperature means, precipitation totals and drought indices. Long-term variations in 35 TRW track summer temperatures until about 1970 but diverge afterwards, whereas MXD captures the recent temperature increase in the low-frequency domain fairly well. 36 On the other hand summer drought has increasingly driven TRW along the 20th century. 37 Our results suggest fading temperature sensitivity of Iberian high-elevation P. uncinata 38 forest growth, and reveal the importance of summer drought that is becoming the 39 emergent limiting factor of tree ring width formation in many parts of the 40 Mediterranean Basin. 41

42

Key-words: climate change; drought; growth response; high-elevation forest; Pyrenees;
summer temperature

45

- 46 *Highlights:*
- 1500 TRW and 102 MXD series were collected at 30 sites across the Pyrenees
- Growth/climate relationships were assessed on high- to low-frequency domains
- Summer temperatures and MXD increased after the 1970s, whereas TRW decreased
- 50 Warming-induced drought constrains on TRW formation increased along the 20^{th}
- 51 century
- 52

53 **1. Introduction**

54 Trees growing in cold-limited environments such as high-latitude forests and the arctic and alpine ecotones can record temperature variations in their annual ring width (TRW) 55 and maximum latewood density (MXD) (Fritts, 2001). In fact, temperature might be the 56 main climatic driver of tree growth and thus it constrains wood formation during overall 57 short growing seasons (Körner, 2012). Old growing treeline species, are therefore 58 regarded as reliable proxy archives that enable annually resolved temperature 59 reconstructions to be continuously developed for several centuries to millennia (Briffa 60 et al., 1990; Esper et al., 2002). At the European-scale, several examples from the high-61 62 northern latitudes in Fennoscandia (Briffa et al., 1990; Grudd, 2008), and higher elevations along the Carpathian arc (Büntgen et al., 2007, 2013; Popa and Kern, 2008) 63 and the Alps (Rolland et al., 1998; Büntgen et al., 2005, 2006; Corona et al., 2010) have 64 65 demonstrated the palaeoclimatic potential of tree rings.

Mid-latitude areas are, however, affected by different climatic influences 66 derived from tropical air-masses moving towards the poles and polar air-masses moving 67 towards the equator; this causes most of the mid-latitude areas being alternately 68 influenced by arid and humid conditions, with periodic droughts. Complex 69 70 growth/climate relationships are therefore known for areas like the Mediterranean Basin or the Sierra Nevada in California (Tardif et al., 2003; Bunn et al., 2005; Carrer et al., 71 2010; Büntgen et al., 2012). In these ecosystems, daily to seasonal precipitation changes 72 73 can mediate intra and inter-annual patterns of forest growth, and summer drought can be strong enough to even interrupt cell formation (Nicault et al., 2001; De Luis et al., 74 2007). It remains unknown if such drought-induced growth responses also occur in 75 high-elevation forests of the Mediterranean mid-latitudes and may even affect water-76

saturated upper treeline sites. If true, such hydroclimatic stressors would question the
consistency of temperature reconstructions based on tree rings from high-elevation areas
at mid-latitudes.

Spatiotemporal instability in growth/climate relationships, the so-called 80 divergence phenomena (D'Arrigo et al., 2008), may indeed be magnified by predicted 81 future drought across the Mediterranean Basin (Lebourgeois et al., 2012), which would 82 dampen the temperature control of tree growth. Testing the hypothesis of recently more 83 complex growth/climate relationships in Mediterranean mountain forest ecosystems is, 84 however, complicated by the scarcity of high-elevation sites that were temperature-85 86 controlled in this area (Körner, 2012). The Pyrenees constitutes the only mountain system where undisturbed temperature-driven upper treelines can be found south of the 87 Alpine arc. 88

89 Here we seek to assess if the growth/climate relationship in a high-elevation network of *Pinus uncinata* forest sites across the Pyrenees changed over the last century 90 91 and, if so, to pinpoint the relevant drivers. We compile TRW chronologies from 30 sites 92 and MXD measurements from six of these sites between 1750 and 2451 m asl. Various tree-ring detrending and chronology development techniques, together with split-period 93 94 approaches and multiple intra-annual intervals are evaluated to assure that the observed 95 associations between tree growth and climate are not artificially induced or spatiotemporally biased. 96

97

- 98 **2.** Materials and methods
- 99 2.1. Study species and sites

Pinus uncinata Ram. is a long-lived, slow-growing and shade-intolerant conifer with a 100 large ecological amplitude concerning topography and soil type (Ceballos and Ruiz de 101 la Torre, 1979). In this species ca. 80% of the annual width is formed during June and 102 103 July and latewood formation lasts from July up to October (Camarero et al., 1998). Warm autumn and spring temperatures before and during ring formation enhance P. 104 uncinata radial growth in Pyrenean forests (Tardif et al., 2003). We sampled 30 P. 105 uncinata sites of which 27 sites are located in the Pyrenees, one site is in the Pre-106 107 Pyrenean Sierra de Guara and two southern relict populations are located in the Iberian System (Fig. 1). Data cover the whole geographical range of the species in the Iberian 108 109 Peninsula and thus capture most of the ecological variability experienced by this species (Table 1). Most of the Pyrenean sites (18 sites) were located within or near protected 110 areas, ensuring that these populations are not likely to have been logged for much of the 111 20th century. Specifically six sites were sampled within or near the Ordesa y Monte 112 Perdido National Park (PNOMP; 42°40'N, 00°03'E; established in 1918), and twelve 113 114 sites were sampled in the Aigüestortes i Estany de Sant Maurici National Park area 115 (PNAESM; 42°35'N, 00°57'E; established in 1955). Pyrenean P. uncinata forests are usually low-density open-canopy stands located in steep and elevated sites forming 116 isolated patches near the alpine treeline. The macroclimate of the Pyrenees is strongly 117 influenced by east-west and north-south gradients with increasing Mediterranean 118 conditions (e.g. warm and dry summers) eastwards and southwards, whereas continental 119 120 conditions (e.g. cold winters) prevail in the Central Pyrenees. These diverse climatic 121 influences explain the high climatic heterogeneity of this area (López-Moreno et al., 2008). Mediterranean summer drought is more prevalent at PNOMP than at PNAESM 122 sites (Balcells and Gil-Pelegrín, 1992). Mean annual temperature and total precipitation 123

in the studied sites ranged from 2.0 to 4.9 °C and from 1200 to 2000 mm, respectively,
with January and July as the coldest (mean -2.0 °C) and warmest (mean 12.5 °C) months
respectively (Camarero, 1999). The relict populations of Teruel and Soria and the
Prepyrenean site Guara are subjected to typically Mediterranean conditions such as
warm and dry summers.

129

130 **2.2.** Field sampling and dendrochronological methods

We sampled 711 living trees between 1994 and 2011. At each site, five to 65 dominant 131 (i.e. with crowns above the general level of the canopy) trees (mean \pm SD = 24 \pm 14 132 sampled trees per site) were randomly selected. The number of sampled trees per site 133 depended on the availability of suitable trees within each site. All trees were cored with 134 a Pressler increment borer taking two or three cores per tree (n = 1500 cores, mean \pm 135 136 $SD = 47 \pm 27$ sampled cores per site). Each core was mounted and sanded with progressively finer grain until tree rings were clearly visible (Stokes and Smiley, 1968). 137 138 Samples were then visually cross-dated and measured to a precision of 0.01 mm using a 139 LINTAB measuring device (Rinntech, Germany). Cross-dating was evaluated using the program COFECHA (Holmes 1983), which calculates cross correlations between 140 141 individual series of each core and a master chronology. For the MXD measurements, we 142 cored a subsample (n = 74 trees) by taking cores perpendicular to the stem from 6 sites (4 sites located in PNAESM plus 2 sites from PNOMP) with a thicker Pressler 143 increment borer (10 mm diameter); MXD cores were glued onto wooden supports and 144 145 thin wooden laths (1.2 mm) were cut with a twin-bladed saw. Density was measured with an Itrax MultiScanner from Cox Analytical Systems (http://www.coxsys.se), where 146 147 laths are scanned using a focused high-energy x-ray beam. The radiographic image is

analyzed with the software WinDendro (Regent Instruments, Canada), which performs alight calibration of the grey values using a calibration wedge (Grudd, 2008).

- 150

151 **2.3.** Tree-ring data and detrending

Since we only collected MXD data from the Pyrenees (Tables 1 and 2), we combined all 152 the MXD series in one single chronology set called *Pyrenees*. For its part, TRW was 153 assigned three different chronology subsets depending on the geographical location of 154 155 the sampled sites: (i) the whole network of 30 sampled sites, (ii) the 27 Pyrenean sites, and (iii) the 15 PNAESM sites; hereafter called AllSites, Pyrenees and Aigüestortes 156 subsets respectively. As explained before, PNOMP is more influenced by 157 Mediterranean and drier conditions than PNAESM; therefore, and in order to assess 158 possible Mediterranean drought influences, we used an additional TRW subset called 159 160 Ordesa, derived from a compilation of the series coming from the six PNOMP sites. Apart from the geographical reason, the Aigüestortes subset was taken considering also 161 162 the relative robust convergence of the principal components scores of the PNAESM 163 sites in the two dimensional space of a principal component analysis, based on the covariance matrix of the chronologies of all sampled sites, and considering their 164 common period 1901-1994 (see yellow symbols in Figure A1). The first and second 165 166 principal components explained 47.2% and 8.1% of the whole site growth variability, respectively. Sites near the distribution limits of the species (e.g. GU, TE, CN, PA) are 167 arranged at relatively lower altitudes (i.e. PC1 scores). Although the chronologies 168 169 showed different loadings with the PC1, all of them had positive correlations within it, 170 showing that they shared a common variance.

171

To remove tree-age related, non-climatic growth trends from the raw TRW and 172 173 MXD measurement series (Cook and Kairiukstis, 1990), and to assess the effects of 174 different standardization techniques on the final chronology shape, we applied several detrending methods using the ARSTAN program (Cook and Holmes, 1986). 175 176 Specifically, we preserved variability at inter-annual to multi-decadal scales detrending each TRW and MXD individual series by means of cubic smoothing splines with 50% 177 frequency-response cutoffs equal to 150 and 300 years (Cook and Peters, 1981). A 178 179 negative exponential function detrending was also applied together with an alternative linear regression of slope of any sign (detrending called hereafter 'negative exponential 180 181 1') or with an alternative linear regression of negative slope ('negative exponential 2'). We also applied the age-aligned regional curve standardization (RCS; Esper et al., 182 183 2003) for preserving inter-annual to centennial-scale variability.

For these different detrendings, dimensionless indices were calculated as 184 185 residuals from the estimated growth curves after power transformation (pt) of the raw 186 measurements (Cook and Peters, 1997), and as ratios after using the raw measurements 187 without any transformation (nt). Summarizing, we applied ten different detrending methods (see table A1). We performed a variance stabilization technique to every 188 chronology for minimizing the putative effects of changing sample size throughout time 189 190 (Frank et al., 2007). Mean chronologies were then calculated using a bi-weight robust mean (Cook, 1985). We applied the Expressed Population Signal (EPS) calculated over 191 30-year windows lagged by 15 years to estimate signal strength of these records 192 193 (Wigley et al., 1984). Throughout the paper, unless otherwise stated, we refer to TRW chronologies derived from the whole sampled network (i.e. AllSites TRW subset). 194

195

196 **2.4.** Instrumental target data and growth-climate response analyses

Monthly temperature (mean, maximum and minimum) and precipitation data 197 (CRUTS3.10; Harris et al., 2013) were used for growth/climate response analysis. We 198 considered 0.5° resolution grid-box data covering the different sampled sites. We also 199 200 used the standardized precipitation evapotranspiration drought index (SPEI; Vicente-Serrano et al., 2010), calculated from the CRUTS3.20 dataset. Drought conditions are 201 influenced by factors like temperature, relative humidity, evapotranspiration, wind 202 203 speed, etc. The Standardized Precipitation Index (SPI) only takes on account the precipitation, thus neglecting the importance of other influential variables. The use of 204 205 drought indices that include temperature data in their formulation, such as the Palmer 206 Drought Severity Index (PDSI) seems to be preferable to identify warming-related drought impacts on ecological systems (Vicente-Serrano et al. 2010), specially taking 207 208 on account the global temperature increase of recent decades. However, drought is a 209 multi-scalar phenomenon since the time period from the arrival of water inputs until the 210 water is available differs considerably (McKee et al. 1993). Thus, the time scale over 211 which water deficits accumulate becomes important. The PDSI lacks the multi-scalar character of the SPI; the SPEI, first proposed by Vicente-Serrano et al. (2010) 212 overcomes this limitation, combining in its formulation the sensitivity of PDSI to 213 changes in evaporation demand caused by temperature with the multi-temporal nature 214 of the SPI. Negative (positive) SPEI values correspond to dry (wet) conditions. 215

All the TRW and MXD chronologies (derived from the different detrendings and subsets) were correlated against monthly and seasonal means of maximum, mean, and minimum temperatures and totals of precipitation. We restricted the analyses to the period 1901-2009, which covers the available CRU data period. We used monthly data

from October of the previous year to September of the current year and seasonal means 220 performed from March to September, including therefore the growing season. We also 221 222 correlated the chronologies to the SPEI index for the 12 months of the year at different 223 time scales from 1 to 24 accumulated months, covering the same period. In order to assess the temporal stability in the growth/climate relationships along the second half of 224 the 20th century, we performed the correlations with climate in two independent 40-year 225 subperiods: 1930-1969 and 1970-2009. We quantified spatial correlation fields between 226 227 the tree-ring series and monthly and seasonal climatic variables for different periods using the web Climate Explorer (http://climexp.knmi.nl). We further evaluated 228 instability in the growth/climate relationship by calculating 31-year moving correlations 229 between growth (TRW, MXD) and climate variables (temperature, SPEI). 230

231

3. Results

233 **3.1.** Chronology characteristics

234 TRW (MXD) chronologies span from 1270 to 2010 AD (1407 to 2009 AD), with a 235 mean length of 240 (192) years. TRW (MXD) series have a mean ± SD annual value of $0.66 \pm 0.11 \text{ mm} (0.77 \pm 0.39 \text{ g cm}^{-3})$ and a series inter-correlation of 0.44 (0.40). In both 236 TRW and MXD, the eight different spline and exponential detrendings showed a very 237 238 similar shape (Fig. A2); hence we averaged them in a single chronology, hereafter 239 abbreviated as TRWmean and MXDmean. Raw and RCS TRW chronologies show the typical negative exponential trend until ~1450; from then on, RCS chronologies grow 240 241 with a long and steady positive trend (Fig. 2a). From the 1950s onwards, all the TRW chronologies decline until the present. Raw and RCS MXD chronologies show a 242 243 negative trend until ~1700, and then they rise up to the 1950s before decreasing again.

Since the 1970s all the MXD chronologies start trending upwards up to the present. 244 (Fig. 2b). These results are essentially the same as the ones observed in the Pyrenees 245 246 and Aigüestortes subsets (not shown). This MXD pattern is related to the temperature trends found over the 20th century in Europe: increasing temperatures until the 1950s 247 followed by a decrease until the 1970s and a second increase from the 1970s until 248 nowadays (IPCC 2013). These patterns are consequently observed in series of tree ring 249 proxies (e.g. MXD) of temperature sensitive sites like the Alps, Scandinavia or the 250 251 Pyrenees, and also in the temperature series of their subsequent climatic reconstructions (Corona et al. 2010; Büntgen et al. 2008a, 2011; Dorado-Liñán et al. 2012). The RCS 252 253 chronologies highlight the decrease in TRW in the transition between the warm Medieval Climatic Anomaly and the cold Little Ice Age (LIA) starting in 1300 AD and 254 255 lasting until 1850 AD, where temperatures started to increase again (Moreno et al., 256 2012). Both TRW and MXD chronologies display a valley shape in 1816 following the 257 eruption of Mount Tambora in 1815, which caused the "year without summer" (Trigo et 258 al., 2009). There is another sharp decrease in TRW and MXD around 1700 AD. The 259 decrease in growth in the last 50 years is not unprecedented and lower growth rates occurred in some periods over the LIA, for instance during the fifteenth century (Fig. 260 2a). Expressed population signal (EPS) and signal-to-noise ratio (SNR) are very 261 262 consistent among the 10 different detrendings (Table 3). TRW (MXD) chronology stays above the 0.85 EPS threshold since 1500 (1777) AD (Figs. A3 and A4). Mean segment 263 lengths of the TRW site chronologies show how aging trees display a decreasing growth 264 265 rate (Fig. A5), and proves the existence of a single biological-growth population portrayed by the sampled sites (Esper et al., 2003). 266

267

268 **3.2.** Growth-climate responses patterns

TRW and MXD are mainly influenced by previous-year November, May and September temperatures (Fig. 3). Similar results were found for the *Pyrenees*, *Aigüestortes* and *Ordesa* subsets (not shown). Among the different detrendings applied, RCS shows a smaller or even negative correlation between TRW chronologies and temperature . This indicates that a divergent behaviour in the recent decades between TRW and temperature is more evident when using RCS chronologies than with the other detrendings.

MXD displays higher correlations with temperature than those for the TRW. 276 Monthly correlation analysis highlights the main influences of previous-year November 277 278 and current-year May, June and September temperatures on MXD, with May being the most prominent month (Fig.3b). Contrary to the TRW, the different MXD detrendings 279 280 display the same sign and behaviour in their climate correlation functions (Table 3), although RCS detrending brings the highest correlations with temperature for MXD in 281 282 the second subperiod. This, and the fact that TRW RCS chronologies record a divergent 283 behaviour with temperature more clearly than other detrendings, caused us to focus our analyses mainly on the RCS chronologies. 284

Growth/precipitation correlations are found to be minor compared with those found for temperature, in both TRW and MXD data sets (not shown). Contrastingly, SPEI gives higher correlations than precipitation (Fig. 4). The main drought driver of TRW of Iberian *P. uncinata* forests is the SPEI for June and July accumulated at scales from one to two months, specially for the period 1901-2009 and the sub-period 1930-1969 (Fig. 4). As we pointed out before, PNOMP area has stronger Mediterranean influences than PNAESM area. Correspondingly, TRW from the *Ordesa* subset shows this Mediterranean background in the TRW-SPEI relationship (using SPEI data covering the PNOMP area), where the influence of drought on growth extends until August and, in general, correlation coefficients with summer SPEI are stronger than in the case of *Aigüestortes* and *Pyrenees* subsets, consecutively (Fig. A6). These observations are consistent among the different detrending methods (Fig. A6 and Fig. A7).

In the case of MXD for the first subperiod, the highest negative (~ -0.4) and positive (~ 0.2-0.3) correlations occur with the May SPEI for 4 to 5 months, and with July SPEI at 2-month scale, respectively. This greatly changes for the second subperiod, when the highest positive MXD/SPEI correlations (~0.4) are found in the period from previous September to current January (Fig. 4). Both TRW and MXD showed higher correlations with SPEI in the second than in the first subperiod, which indicates an increase in drought influence on growth in recent decades.

Finally, spatial correlations displayed between MXD values and temperature were stronger and more spatially coherent across SW Europe than those observed with TRW (Fig. A8).

308

309 3.3. Proxy-temperature divergence

Our results show a temporal instability of the growth/climate relationships of *P*. *uncinata* forests along the 20th century. In the low-frequency domain, divergent trends for TRW and maximum temperature are found since the 1970s (Fig. 5b), while TRW displays a convergent trend with SPEI (Fig. 5e). Similar results are observed for the *Pyrenees* and *Aigüestortes* subsets (not shown). For its part, MXD low-frequency trend parallels with the low-frequency temperature warming, which started in the 1970s (Fig.6b), but it diverges from SPEI (Fig. 6e).

A steady negative (positive) trend in the moving correlation record is displayed 317 318 with temperature (SPEI) in the low-frequency range (Figs. 5b,e). In the high-frequency 319 domain, stronger correlations with temperature are obtained after the 1950's (Fig. 5c), and a negative trend in the moving correlations with SPEI is found (Fig. 5f). MXD 320 moving correlations display an increase with temperature and a decrease with SPEI in 321 322 low-frequency domains (Fig. 6b,e). Low-frequency moving correlations in TRW seem more stable than in MXD, where we can observe cyclic increases and decreases in the 323 moving correlations along the 20th century (Fig. 6b,e). 324

Focusing on the growing season, May temperature shows a direct correlation 325 with TRW and MXD while summer months usually show a smaller or negative one 326 327 (Fig. 3). To find out if the divergence phenomenon is due to a loss of temperature 328 sensitivity or to an increase in this negative summer drought effect, we repeated the 329 moving correlation analyses with summer (June-July) and May temperatures. Results 330 are very similar to the ones obtained with the maximum temperature of May-September period (Fig. A9 and A10), again highlighting a TRW-temperature divergence and also a 331 332 recent increase in the correlation between MXD and temperature.

To gain insight into potential differences in the divergence occurrence along the altitude we compared high- (>2150 m, 15 sites, 940 series) and low-elevation (< 2150 m, 15 sites, 572 series) TRW chronologies with June-July SPEI and MJJAS maximum temperature series. In both high- and low-elevation chronologies the divergence phenomenon with temperature in the low-frequency range is clear and the convergent trend with MXD in the low-frequency range too (Figures A11 and A12). In the highelevation chronology the low-frequency divergence with temperature seems to appearshortly delayed compared with the low-elevation chronology.

341

342 **4. Discussion**

343 Our results show low frequency trend offsets between the TRW series and temperature records since the second half of the 20th century (Fig. 5b). This suggests a weakening of 344 the theoretically temperature-sensitive proxies (TRW) to capture recent warming trends 345 346 such as those observed since the 1970s. Such 'divergence' phenomena between climatic and dendrochronological variables have also been displayed in other temperature-347 constrained high-elevation and boreal forests (Büntgen et al., 2006; Wilmking et al., 348 2004, 2005; D'Arrigo et al., 2004; Briffa et al., 1998). Nevertheless, this low-frequency 349 350 offset between growth and temperature is not found in the high-frequency (i.e. year-to-351 year) climate sensitivity of our TRW series, which increasingly parallels temperature anomalies along the 20th century (Fig. 5c). Hence, the trend offset between the TRW 352 353 series and temperature records is mainly restricted to the long-term trend, whereas 354 coherency between productivity and temperature persists in the high-frequency (year-toyear) domain. 355

Spring cambial resumption in *P. uncinata* starts in May, and typically the tree growth is faster or slower depending mainly on the temperatures prevailing during this month. The moving correlations between May temperatures and TRW highlight that this spring temperature sensitivity is fading during recent decades (Fig. A9b). Contrary to TRW, MXD low-frequency positive trends follow the warming trend started in the 1970s. This is in agreement with data from the European Alps that suggest that the divergent behaviour is expected to occur in TRW more often than in MXD (Büntgen et

al., 2006). Furthermore, MXD shows higher correlations with temperature over the 363 growing season compared to TRW, which is in agreement with former observations 364 from the same area and species (Büntgen et al., 2010). This can be explained because 365 366 TRW is more strongly autocorrelated, incorporating previous-year climatic and ecological conditions, together with ecological carryover effects and temperature 367 forcing over a wider (seasonal or annual) time window (Fritts, 2001). In fact, our results 368 369 show a significant correlation between TRW and previous November temperatures, 370 which indicates that warmer conditions in late autumn might enhance carbohydrates storage and synthesis used for the formation of earlywood (i.e. increase of TRW) the 371 following growing season. 372

The divergence phenomenon has been attributed to various causes including 373 nonlinear growth-climate thresholds (Loehle, 2009), methodological issues techniques 374 375 including "end effects" of chronology development (Esper and Frank, 2009; Briffa and 376 Melvin, 2011; Briffa et al. 2013; Melvin et al. 2013), biases in instrumental data or 377 additional anthropogenic influences (see D'Arrigo et al., 2007, and references therein), 378 or temperature-induced drought stress (D'Arrigo et al., 2004) Our sampled sites are located within the drought-prone Mediterranean region, so we hypothesize a possible 379 380 temperature-induced drought explanation of the TRW-temperature divergence observed. The aforementioned TRW-temperature divergence of the second half of the 20th 381 century is opposite to the relationship between TRW and SPEI trends, with low-382 383 frequency moving correlations steadily rising and reaching a maximum level after the 384 1970s (Fig. 5e). Mean temperatures during the growing season have increased during the last century and especially over the last decades, meantime precipitation regimes 385 386 have not significantly changed (Figure A14). These results suggest that warming-

induced summer drought is increasingly influencing TRW in the 20th century in 387 388 Pyrenean high-elevation forests, which agrees with observations from other Iberian mountain forests (Andreu et al., 2007; Macias et al., 2006). This can be due to a 389 potential loss in the positive thermal response of trees when some temperature 390 functional threshold is exceeded, leading to an increase in the influence of other 391 potential factors like soil moisture or drought (D'Arrigo et al., 2004). This TRW-392 393 drought parallelism present in our high-elevation study disagrees with results from low-394 elevation drought sensitive tree-ring central European sites, where growth/drought or growth/precipitation relationships weaken after the 1970s (Wilson and Elling, 2004). 395 Consequently, emerging elevation-specific factors influencing tree growth can be acting 396 differently between high and low elevation sites or between central and southern 397 European forests, producing these contrasting responses in recent decades. 398 Contrastingly, our comparison between high- and low-elevation chronologies does not 399 400 show important differences (Figs. A11 and A12).

401 Summer drought is becoming less influential on MXD instead, specifically since 402 the 1970s, when low-frequency moving correlations between SPEI and MXD begin to fall and both trends diverge (Fig. 6e). In any case, the moving correlations of MXD-403 404 drought and MXD-temperature relationships show in general more instability than in 405 the case of TRW along time (Fig. 6b,e). When it is too hot or dry for tracheid enlargement to occur, the rate of tracheid production decreases and a denser wood 406 (higher MXD) is formed because of the formation of tracheids with thicker cell walls 407 408 and narrower lumens (Jyske et al., 2009). This thickening and lignification of the cell walls, illustrated by latewood tracheids, improves the mechanical strength of stems but 409 410 also allows tracheids to withstand higher xylem tension due to lower water potential

(Hacke et al., 2001). Specifically, MXD development is directly linked to climate 411 conditions during spring and mainly during late summer to early autumn, when the 412 latewood is formed (Briffa et al., 1998). During the first part of the growing season, 413 414 when the earlywood is formed, climatic variations affect radial tracheid enlargement, whereas during the later part of the growing season climate mainly affects the cell wall 415 thickening process of latewood (Camarero et al., 1998) (Fig. A13). For the subperiod 416 1930-1969, the strongest negative correlation (~ -0.4) of MXD with SPEI were found 417 418 for May SPEI (Fig. 4). This means that wet and cool spring conditions could enhance earlywood formation potentially leading to more and wider tracheids with thinner cell 419 420 walls and a subsequent delayed summer lignification producing a less dense latewood, i.e. lower MXD values. The strongest positive correlation (~ 0.2-0.3) for the same 421 period corresponds to July SPEI which suggests that wet late summers will entail denser 422 423 latewood production through enhanced lignification and carbohydrates synthesis at the 424 end of the growing season.

425 In the sub-period 1970-2009 the highest positive MXD-SPEI correlations (~0.4) 426 are found in January considering the cumulative drought since the previous September (5-month SPEI scale), which means that wet conditions in the previous autumn and 427 428 winter of a specific year would imply the production of a dense latewood during the late 429 summer of the next year. This is an unexpected observation since we unveil not only influences of late summer/early autumn conditions of the current year on MXD but also 430 of lagged climatic conditions of the previous year as is usually the case in TRW (Tardif 431 432 et al., 2003; Fritts, 2001). The interpretation may be the same as in TRW since previous wet conditions might enhance carbohydrates synthesis and storage later used for 433 434 lignifying and thickening latewood cells the following growing season. Note that these

indirect influences of previous winter conditions on latewood production were also 435 observed in xeric Pinus halepensis stands, which constitute typical lowland 436 Mediterranean forests (Pasho et al., 2011). Overall, the SPEI drought index provided a 437 superior signal of tree growth than precipitation data in the study forests. Differences in 438 responses between sub-periods could be due to different drought stress intensities from 439 one sub-period to the other, different temperature conditions or climatic variability (e.g. 440 the first half of the 20th century was climatically less variable than the second half) or 441 442 indirect effects of other global or local drivers like increasing atmospheric concentrations of CO₂ and rising N deposition. 443

Current data support the occurrence of climate warming and its effects on various 444 forest ecosystem services in the Pyrenees during recent decades. From 1880 to 1980 AD 445 at least 94 glaciers disappeared in the whole Pyrenees, 17 of them on the Spanish side 446 447 since 1980 (Morellón et al., 2012). Camarero and Gutiérrez (2004) observed an increase in tree establishment and density within the treeline ecotone over the 20th century. In a 448 449 European context there is a positive trend in temperatures (+0.90°C) from the beginning of the 20th century and, although lower than in central and northern Europe, the 450 warming trend in the Mediterranean region has intensified since the 1970s (IPCC 2013). 451 The Pyrenees are more likely to be vulnerable against climate warming and drying 452 453 trends than other Mediterranean and European ranges (Schröter et al., 2005) due to two 454 main ecological drawbacks. First, the Pyrenees are east-west arranged, i.e. perpendicularly to the expected northern (or upward) migratory routes. Second, they are 455 456 influenced by Mediterranean climatic conditions characterized by a summer drought. The negative effects on forest growth under the forecasted scenarios of climate change 457

458 could be even worse than expected if drought stress plays a complementary role459 together with the rising temperatures.

studies have focused on growth-climate Several dendrochronological 460 461 relationships at Pyrenean high-elevation forests (e.g. Gutiérrez 1991, Rathgeber and Roche 2003, Tardif et al. 2003, Andreu et al. 2007, Büntgen et al. 2008a, Esper et al. 462 2010). Our study constitutes a step forward in the sense that (i) we use a larger dataset 463 covering a broad biogeographical gradient including the southern and western 464 465 distribution limits of this species and that (ii) we find a weakening in the TRWtemperature relationships possibly connected to an increasingly important role of 466 467 drought as a growth driver during recent decades. The divergence phenomenon here exposed should be considered in the assessment and performance of Pyrenean climate 468 reconstructions from tree rings, which are based on short calibration periods. Trees are 469 470 showing increasing drought and decreasing temperature sensitivities in recent decades even in these high-elevation ecosystems where we would expect a strong temperature 471 472 response. This would imply that a Pyrenean climate reconstruction based on present-day 473 growth-climate relationships should take on account the role of additional climatic factors that could be potentially limiting tree growth in an increasing degree. According 474 475 to our results, temperature reconstructions performed in the Pyrenean range using MXD 476 (Büntgen et al. 2008a, Dorado-Liñán et al. 2012) are reliable since they are based on MXD/temperature relationships where no divergence was found. 477

This divergence phenomenon has been mainly explained here in terms of temperature-induced drought stress, but we should not ignore additional factors potentially influencing the degree and intensity of the growth/climate offset. For instance, nitrogen fertilization or increasing atmospheric CO_2 concentrations may enhance radial growth thus leading to the formation of a less dense earlywood (Lundgren, 2004). Our next research step would be a site-level study of the low- and high-frequency signals in the growth/climate correlations, which would allow us to draw conclusions for larger scales in a more accurate way (Büntgen et al., 2008b). A more exhaustive MXD sampling of several tree species should be also necessary to make a more accurate comparison between TRW and MXD responses.

488

489 **5.** Conclusions

This study comprises 1500 tree-ring width (TRW) and 102 maximum density 490 (MXD) measurement series from 711 and 74 trees, respectively, which were sampled at 491 492 30 high-elevation *Pinus uncinata* forest sites across the Iberian range of the species. Rising temperatures led to an increase in drought stress of Pyrenean high-elevation 493 494 forests as has been observed in other Mediterranean mountain forests (Jump et al., 2006; 495 Piovesan et al., 2008). Therefore, these high-elevation forests, growing in typically 496 temperature-limited conditions, are becoming more limited by water availability. This 497 growth limitation driven by the amount of available water could be particularly strong in steep sites with rocky substrates where soil shows a poor water holding capacity. We 498 499 may be witnessing how tree physiological thresholds in terms of optimal temperature 500 for growth are surpassed, reinforcing the role of drought as a growth-limiting factor of high-elevation forests during recent decades. 501

502

503 Acknowledgements

We thank the personnel of the PNOMP and PNAESM National Parks, A.Q. Alla and G. 504 Sangüesa-Barreda for their help during the sampling and in dendrochronological 505 analyses and also in making the Figure 1. We thank Loïc Schneider (WSL) for his 506 507 collaboration in making the Figure A12. This study was supported by projects 012/2008 and 387/2011 (Organismo Autónomo Parques Nacionales, MMAMRM, Spain) and by a 508 509 JAE-CSIC grant to J.D.G. J.J.C. acknowledges the support of ARAID. We also 510 acknowledge funding by projects, which further contributed to build this data set 511 (FoRmat EU ENV4-CT97-0641, CiCyTAMB95-0160). We thank the editor and two 512 anonymous reviewers for their constructive comments, which helped us to improve the 513 manuscript. 514

516 **References**

- Andreu, L., Gutiérrez, E., Macias, M., Ribas, M., Bosch, O., Camarero, J.J., 2007.
 Climate increases regional tree-growth variability in Iberian pine forests. Global
 Change Biology 13, 804–815.
- Balcells, E., Gil-Pelegrín, E., 1992. Consideraciones fenológicas de las biocenosis de
 altitud en el Parque Nacional de Ordesa y Monte Perdido, acompañadas y
 apoyadas mediante estudio preliminar de los datos meteorológicos obtenidos
 desde 1981 a 1989 en el observatorio de Góriz. Lucas Mallada 4, 71–162.
- Briffa, K.R., Bartholin, T.S., Eckstein, D., Jones, P.D., Karlén, W., Schweingruber,
 F.H., Zetterberg, P. 1990. A 1400-year treering record of summer temperatures
 in Fennoscandia. Nature 346, 434–439.
- Briffa, K.F., Schweingruber, F.H., Jones, P.D., Osborn, T. 1998. Reduced sensitivity
 of recent tree growth to temperature at high northern latitudes. Nature 391, 678–
 682.
- Briffa, K.R., Melvin, T.M., 2011. A closer look at Regional Curve Standardisation of
 tree-ring records: Justification of the need, a warning of some pitfalls, and
 suggested improvements in its application. In: Hughes, M.K., Diaz, H.F.,
 Swetnam, T.W. (Eds.), Dendroclimatology: Progress and Prospects. Springer
 Verlag, pp. 113–145.
- Briffa, K.R., Melvin, T.M., Osborn, T.J., Hantemirov, R.M., Kirdyanov, A.V.,
 Mazepa, V., Shiyatov, S.G., Esper, J., 2013. Reassessing the evidence for treegrowth and inferred temperature change during the Common Era in Yamalia,
 northwest Siberia. Quaternary Science Reviews, 72, 83–107.

539	Bunn, A.G., Waggoner, L.A., Graumlich, L.J., 2005. Topographic mediation of
540	growth in high elevation foxtail pine (Pinus balfouriana Grev. et Balf.) forests in
541	the Sierra Nevada, USA, Global Ecology and Biogeography 14, 103–114.

- 542 Büntgen, U., Esper, J., Frank, D.C., Nicolussi, K., Schmidhalter, M., 2005. A 1052543 year tree-ring proxy for Alpine summer temperatures. Climate Dynamics 25,
 544 141–153.
- Büntgen, U., Frank, D.C., Nievergelt, D., Esper, J., 2006. Summer temperature
 variations in the European Alps, AD 755-2004. Journal of Climate 19, 5606–
 5623.
- Büntgen, U., Frank, D.C., Kaczka, R.J., Verstege, A., Zwijacz-Kozica, T., Esper, J.,
 2007. Growth/climate response of a multi-species treering network in the
 western Carpathian Tatra Mountains, Poland and Slovakia. Tree Physiology 27,
 687–702.
- Büntgen, U., Frank, D.C., Grudd, H., Esper, J., 2008a. Long-term summer temperature
 variations in the Pyrenees. Climate Dynamics 31, 615–631.
- Büntgen, U., Frank, D.C., Wilson, R., Carrer, M., Urbinati, C., Esper, J., 2008b.
 Testing for tree-ring divergence in the European Alps. Global Change Biology
 14, 2443–2453.
- Büntgen, U., Frank, D.C., Trouet, V., Esper, J., 2010. Diverse climate sensitivity of
 Mediterranean tree-ring width and density. Trees, Structure and Function 24,
 261–273.
- Büntgen, U., Raible, C.C., Frank, D., Helama, S., Cunningham, L., et al., 2011. Causes
 and Consequences of Past and Projected Scandinavian Summer Temperatures,
 500–2100 AD. PLoS ONE 6(9): e25133. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0025133

564

sensitivity of Alpine tree growth at its Mediterranean margin and associated 565 566 effects on large-scale climate reconstructions. Climatic Change 114, 651–666. Büntgen, U., Kyncl, T., Ginzler, C., Jacks, D.S., Esper, J., Tegel, W., Heussner, K.U., 567 Kyncl, J., 2013. Filling the Eastern European gap in millennium-long 568 temperature reconstructions. Proceedings of the National Academy of Science, 569 570 USA doi: 10.1073/pnas.1211485110. Camarero, J.J., 1999. Dinámica del límite altitudinal del bosque en los Pirineos y su 571 relación con el cambio climático. PhD Thesis, Universitat de Barcelona, 572 Barcelona. 573 Camarero, J.J., Guerrero-Campo, J., Gutiérrez, E., 1998. Tree-ring growth and 574 575 structure of *Pinus uncinata* and *Pinus sylvestris* in the Central Spanish Pyrenees.

Büntgen, U., Frank, D.C., Neuenschwander, T., Esper, J., 2012. Fading temperature

576 Arctic and Alpine Research 30, 1–10.

- 577 Camarero, J.J, Gutiérrez, E., 2004. Pace and pattern of recent treeline dynamics:
 578 response of ecotones to climatic variability in the Spanish Pyrenees. Climatic
 579 Change 63, 181–200.
- Carrer, M.P., Nola, P., Motta, R., Urbinati, C., 2010. Contrasting tree-ring growth to
 climate responses of Abies alba toward the southern limit of its distribution area.
 Oikos 119, 1515–1525.
- 583 Ceballos, L., Ruiz de la Torre, J., 1979. Árboles y arbustos de la España Peninsular.
 584 Escuela Técnica Superior de Ingenieros de Montes, Madrid, Spain.
- 585 Cook, E.R., 1985. A Time Series Analysis Approach to Tree-Ring Standardization.
- 586 PhD Thesis, Lamont-Doherty Geological Observatory, New York.

- 587 Cook, E.R., Peters, K., 1981. The smoothing spline: a new approach to standardizing
 588 forest interior tree-ring width series for dendroclimatic studies. Tree-Ring
 589 Bulletin 41, 45–53.
- Cook, E.R., Holmes, R.L., 1986. Program ARSTAN, Version 1. Laboratory of TreeRing Research, The University of Arizona, Tucson, USA, 72 pp.
- Cook, E.R., Kairiukstis, L.A., 1990. Methods of dendrochronology: applications in the
 environmental sciences. International Institute for Applied Systems Analysis,
 Boston, MA, USA: Kluwer Academic Publishers.
- Cook, E.R., Peters, K., 1997. Calculating unbiased tree-ring indices for the study of
 climatic and environmental change. Holocene 7, 359–368.
- 597 Corona, C., Guiot, J., Edouard, J.L., Chalié, F., Büntgen, U., Nola, P., Urbinati, C.,
 598 2010. Millennium-long summer temperature variations in the European Alps as
 599 reconstructed from tree rings. Climate of the Past 6, 379–400.
- D'Arrigo, R., Kaufmann, R., Davi, N., Jacoby, G., Laskowski, C., Myneni, R.,
 Cherubini, P., 2004. Thresholds for warming-induced growth decline at
 elevational treeline in the Yukon Territory. Global Biogeochemical Cycles 18,
 GB3021, doi: 10.1029/2004GB002249.
- D'Arrigo, R., Wilson, R., Liepert, B., Cherubini, P., 2008. On the 'divergence
 problem' in northern forests: a review of the tree-ring evidence and possible
 causes. Global and Planetary Change 60, 289–305.
- De Luis, M., Gričar, J., Čufar, K., Raventós, J., 2007. Seasonal dynamics of wood
 formation in *Pinus halepensis* from dry and semi-arid ecosystems in Spain.
 IAWA Journal 28, 389–404.

- Dorado-Liñán, I., Büntgen, U., González-Rouco, F., et al., 2012. Estimating 750 years
 of temperature variations and uncertainties in the Pyrenees by tree-ring
 reconstructions and climate simulations. Climate of the Past 8, 919–933.
- Esper, J., Cook, E.R., Schweingruber, F.H., 2002. Low-frequency signals in long treering chronologies and the reconstruction of past temperature variability. Science
 295, 2250–2253.
- Esper, J., Cook, E.R., Krusic, P.J., Peters, K., Schweingruber, F.H., 2003. Tests of the
 RCS method for preserving low-frequency variability in long tree-ring
 chronologies. Tree-Ring Research 59, 81–98.
- Esper, J., Frank, D.C., 2009. Divergence pitfalls in tree-ring research. Climatic Change
 94, 261–266.
- Esper, J., Frank, D.C., Battipaglia, G., Büntgen, U., Holert, C., Treydte, K., Siegwolf,
 R., Saurer, M., 2010. Low-frequency noise in ð¹³C and ð¹⁸O tree ring data: A
 case study of *Pinus uncinata* in the Spanish Pyrenees. Global Biogeochemical
 Cycles 24, doi:10.1029/2010GB0037772.
- Frank, D., Esper, J., Cook, E.R., 2007. Adjustment for proxy number and coherence in
 a large-scale temperature reconstruction. Geophysical Research Letters 34, doi:
 10.1029/2007GL030571.
- Fritts, H.C., 2001. Tree Rings and Climate. Blackburn Press, Caldwell.
- Grudd, H., 2008. Torneträsk tree-ring width and density AD 500-2004: a test of
 climatic sensitivity and a new 1500-year reconstruction of northern
 Fennoscandian summers. Climate Dynamics 31, 843–857.
- Gutiérrez, E., 1991. Climate tree-growth relationships for *Pinus uncinata* Ram. in the
 Spanish pre-Pyrenees. Acta Oecologica 12, 213–225.

- Hacke, U.G., Sperry, J.S., Pockman, W.T., Davis, S.D., McCulloh, K.A., 2001. Trends
 in wood density and structure are linked to prevention of xylem implosion by
 negative pressure. Oecologia 126, 457–461.
- Harris, I., Jones, P.D., Osborn, T.J., Lister, D.H., 2013. Updated high-resolution grids
 of monthly climatic observations the CRU TS3.10 Dataset. In press,
 International Journal of Climatology, doi: 10.1002/joc.3711.
- Holmes, R.L., 1983. Computer-assisted quality control in tree-ring dating and
 measurement. Tree-Ring Bulletin 43, 68–78.
- IPCC 2013. Climate Change 2013: The Physical Science Basis. Contribution of
 Working Group I to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel
 on Climate Change [Stocker, T.F., D. Qin, G.-K. Plattner, M. Tignor, S.K.
 Allen, J. Boschung, A. Nauels, Y. Xia, V. Bex and P.M. Midgley (eds.)].
 Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, United Kingdom and New York, NY,
 USA, 1535 pp
- Jump, A.S., Hunt, J.M., Peñuelas, J., 2006. Rapid climate change-related growth
 decline at the southern range edge of *Fagus sylvatica*. Global Change Biology
 12, 2163–2174. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-2486.2006.01250.x
- Jyske, T., Hölttä, T., Mäkinen, H., Nöjd, P., Lumme, I., Spiecker, H., 2010. The effect
 of artificially induced drought on radial increment and wood properties of
 Norway spruce. Tree Physiology 30, 103–115.
- Körner, Ch., 2012. Alpine Treelines. Springer, Basel.
- Lebourgeois, F., Mérian, P., Courdier, F., Ladier, J., Dreyfus, P., 2012. Instability of
 climate signal in tree-ring width in Mediterranean mountains: a multispecies
 analysis. Trees 26, 715–729.

- Loehle, C., 2009. A mathematical analysis of the divergence problem in
 dendroclimatology. Climatic Change 94, 233–245.
- López-Moreno, J.I., Goyette, S., Beniston, M., 2008. Climate change prediction over
 complex areas: spatial variability of uncertainties and predictions over the
 Pyrenees from a set of regional climate models. International Journal of
 Climatology 28, 1535–1550.
- Lundgren, C., 2004. Microfibril angle and density patterns of fertilized and irrigated
 Norway spruce. Silva Fennica 38, 107–117.
- Macias, M., Andreu, L., Bosch, O., Camarero, J.J., Gutiérrez, E., 2006. Increasing
 aridity is enhancing silver fir (*Abies alba* Mill.) water stress in its south-western
 distribution limit. Climatic Change 79, 289–313.
- McKee, T.B.N., Doesken, J., Kleist, J., 1993. The relationship of drought frecuency
 and duration to time scales. In *Proceedings of the 8th Conference of Applied Climatology, 17-22 January, Anaheim, CA*. American Meterological Society,
 Boston, MA. 179-184.
- Melvin, T.M.,, Grudd, H., Briffa, K.R., 2013. Potential bias in "updating" tree-ring
 chronologies using Regional Curve Standardisation: re-processing the
 Torneträsk Maximum-Latewood-Density data. The Holocene, 23, 364–373.
- Morellón, M., Pérez-Sanz, A., Corella, J.P., et al., 2012. A multi-proxy perspective on
 millennium-long climate variability in the Southern Pyrenees. Climate of the
 Past 8, 683–700.
- Moreno, A., Pérez, A., Frigola, J., et al., 2012. The Medieval Climate Anomaly in the
 Iberian Peninsula reconstructed from marine and lake records. Quaternary
 Science Reviews 43, 16–32.

- Nicault, A., Rathgeber, C.B.K., Tessier, L., Thomas, A., 2001. Intra-annual variations
 of radial growth and ring structure. Annals of Forest Science 58, 769–784.
- Pasho, E., Camarero, J.J., De Luis, M., Vicente-Serrano, S.M., 2011. Spatial
 variability in large-scale and regional atmospheric drivers of *Pinus halepensis*growth in eastern Spain. Agricultural and Forest Meteorology 151, 1106–1119.
- Piovesan, G., Biondi, F., Di Filippo, A., Alessandrini, A., Maugeri, M., 2008.
 Drought-driven growth reduction in old beech (*Fagus sylvatica* L.) forests of the
 central Apennines, Italy. Global Change Biology 14, 1265–1281. doi:
 10.1111/j.1365-2486.2008.01570.x
- Popa, I., Kern, Z., 2008. Long-term summer temperature reconstruction inferred from
 tree-ring records from the Eastern Carpathians. Climate Dynamics 32, 1107–
 1117 doi:10.1007/s00382-008-0439-x
- Rathgeber, C., Roche, P., 2003. Spatio-temporal growth dynamics of a subalpine *Pinus uncinata* stand in the French Alps. Comptes Rendus Biologies 326, 305–
 315.
- Rolland, C., Petitcolas, V., Michalet, R., 1998. Changes in radial tree growth for *Picea abies, Larix decidua, Pinus cembra* and *Pinus uncinata* near the alpine
 timberline since 1750. Trees 13, 40–53.
- Schröter, D., Cramer, W., Leemans, R., et al., 2005. Ecosystem service supply and
 vulnerability to global change in Europe. Science 310, 1333–1337.
- Stokes, M.A., Smiley, T.L., 1968. An Introduction to Tree-ring Dating. The University
 of Chicago Press, Chicago, IL.

- Tardif, J., Camarero, J.J., Ribas, M., Gutiérrez, E., 2003. Spatiotemporal variability in
 tree growth in the Central Pyrenees: climatic and site influences. Ecological
 Monographs 73, 241–257.
- Trigo, R.M., Vaquero, J.M., Alcoforado, M-J., Barriendos, M., Taborda, J., GarcíaHerrera, R., Luterbacher, J., 2009. Iberia in 1816, the year without a summer.
 International Journal of Climatology 29, 99–115.
- Vicente-Serrano, S.M., Beguería, S., López-Moreno, J.I., 2010. A Multiscalar Drought
 Index Sensitive to Global Warming: The Standardized Precipitation
 Evapotranspiration Index. Journal of Climate 23, 1696–1718.
- Wigley, T.M.L., Briffa, K.R., Jones, P.D., 1984. On the average of correlated time
 series, with applications in dendroclimatology and hydrometeorology. Journal of
 Climate and Applied Meteorology 23, 201–213.
- Wilmking, M., Juday, G., Barber, V., Zald, H., 2004. Recent climate warming forces
 contrasting growth responses of white spruce at treeline in Alaska through
 temperature thresholds. Global Change Biology 10, 1724–1736.
- 719 Wilmking, M., D'Arrigo, R., Jacoby, G., Juday, G., 2005. Divergent growth responses
- in circumpolar boreal forests. Geophysical Research Letters 32, L15715.
- Wilson, R.J.S., Elling, W., 2004. Temporal instability in tree-growth/climate response
- in the Lower Bavarian Forest region: implications for dendroclimatic
 reconstruction. Trees, Structure and Function 18, 19–28.
- 724

725 SUPPORTING INFORMATION LEGENDS

Figure A1. (a) Principal Components Analysis based on 30 TRW chronologies showing 726 the scores of the first two principal components PC1 and PC2 (sites codes are as in 727 Table 1; analysed period is 1901-1994, covered by chronologies from all sites). PC1 and 728 PC2 scores change as a function of altitude (a) and longitude (b), respectively. Stands 729 with special characteristics or located near the distribution limit of the species are 730 indicated. Different symbols correspond to sites from different geographical areas 731 732 (PNOMP, black circles; PNASM, yellow circles; western and central Pyrenees, downward blue triangle; Iberian System, red square; eastern Pyrenees, white circle; Pre-733 Pyrenees, upward white triangle). The continuous line in (c) indicates the regression 734 line without considering the red outlier on the left. 735

Figure A2. Upper and lower graphs show the different TRW (blue) and MXD (green) chronologies, respectively, coming from the 10 different detrendings applied. Dark blue and dark green indicate the TRW and MXD RCS chronologies, in that order. Light blue and light green indicate the eight different chronologies coming from exponential and spline detrendings. Continued and dotted lines refer to chronologies derived from nontransformed and power-transformed data, correspondingly.

742

Figure A3. Temporal distribution of (a) 101 MXD and (b) 1500 TRW core samples of *Pinus uncinata*, ordered by calendar age of their innermost ring, and EPS statistic
(calculated over 30 years lagged by 15 years) of the whole set (i.e. 6 MXD sites and 30
TRW sites) of raw chronologies. The vertical black lines show the temporal limit of the
signal strength acceptance (EPS > 0.85): 1777 AD for MXD and 1500 AD for TRW.

The grey horizontal dashed lines denote the 0.85 EPS criterion for signal strengthacceptance (Wigley et al. 1984).

750

Figure A4. (a) EPS statistic (calculated over 30 years lagged by 15 years) of each site raw chronology without variance adjustment. (b) Temporal distribution of the 1500 *Pinus uncinata* TRW cores, grouped by site (from bottom West to top East) and ordered by calendar age of their innermost ring. Vertical lines show the limit of the signal strength acceptance (EPS > 0.85; see Wigley et al. 1984).

756

Figure A5. Relationships between mean segment length (MSL) vs. mean TRW growth
rate (AGR) (a) and MXD (b). Different symbols correspond to sites as in Fig. S1.

759

760 Figure A6. Contour plots summarizing the Pearson correlation coefficients (r) calculated between TRW chronologies and June-July SPEI index for the 12 months of 761 762 the year (y axis) at different time scales from one to 24 accumulated months (x axis), 763 covering the period 1901-2009. For the SPEI index we used averaged data from 0.5°gridded data covering the sampled sites from Ordesa, Aigüestortes and Pyrenees 764 subsets. TRW mean refers to the mean chronology averaging the eight different standard 765 766 chronologies derived from spline and negative exponential detrendings (from power transformed and non transformed raw data); TRW RCSpt and TRW RCSnt refer to the 767 TRW standard RCS chronologies from power transformed and non transformed raw 768 769 data, respectively. Legends in the right side show the correlation coefficients from negative values in blue to positive values in orange and red. Significant values (p < p770 771 0.05) correspond to r > 0.19 or r < -0.19.

Figure A7. Contour plots summarizing the Pearson correlation coefficients (r)773 774 calculated between (a) TRW and (b) MXD standard chronologies and the SPEI index 775 for the 12 months of the year (y axis) at different time scales (1-24 months, x axis), 776 considering the period 1901-2009 and two subperiods: 1930-1969 and 1970-2009. For SPEI index we used averaged data from 0.5° grids covering (a) the 30 TRW sampled 777 778 sites and (b) the 6 MXD sampled sites. Legends in the right side show the correlation 779 coefficients from negative values in blue to positive values in red. Significant values (p < 0.05) are those with r > 0.19 or r < -0.19 for the period 1901-2009, and r > 0.35 or r < -0.19780 -0.35 for both subperiods (1930-1969 and 1970-2009). TRW/MXDmean refers to the 781 782 mean chronology coming from averaging the 8 different standard chronologies derived from spline and exponential detrendings; RCSpt and RCSnt refer to the RCS 783 784 chronologies derived from power transformed and non transformed raw data, 785 respectively.

Figure A8. Comparison between the highest spatial field correlations of TRW and MXD RCS chronologies against April-May maximum temperatures for the period 1950-2009 (climate data were derived from the CRUTS3.10 dataset). The asterisk indicates the approximate location of the centroid of the study area in NE Spain.

791

Figure A9. Comparison between May (left column; subfigure a) and June-July (right
column; subfigure d) CRUTS3.10 maximum temperature record (red) for the period
1901-2009, and TRW RCSnt (dark blue) and TRW RCSpt chronologies (light blue).
Upper graphs indicate 31-year moving correlations between the temperature records and

the chronologies. Each moving correlation point refers to the central year of a 31-year
window. Subfigures (a), (b) and (c) show the standard, 20-year low- and high-pass
(anomalies) filtered datasets, respectively, for May temperature. Subfigures (d), (e) and
(f) show the same for June-July maximum temperature.

800

Figure A10. Comparison between May (left column; subfigure a) and June-July (right
column; subfigure d) CRUTS3.10 maximum temperature records (red) for the period
1901-2009, and MXD RCSnt (dark green) and MXD RCSpt chronologies (light green).
The rest of explanations are as in figure A8.

805

Figure A11. Comparison between low- (left column) and high-elevation (right column) chronologies. In (a) and (b) May-September maximum temperature (red) is compared with the TRW RCSnt chronology (dark blue). Upper graph indicates 31-year moving correlations between the 1901-2009 May-September maximum temperature and the RCSnt chronology. Each moving correlation point refers to the central value of a 31year window. Subfigures (c, d) and (e, f) show the same for 20-year low-, and high-pass (anomalies) series, respectively.

813

Figure A12. Comparison between low- (left column) and high-elevation (right column) chronologies. In (a) and (b) June-July SPEI (orange) is compared with TRW RCSnt chronology (dark blue). Upper graph indicates 31-year moving correlations between the 1901-2009 May-September maximum temperature and the RCSnt chronology. Each moving correlation point refers to the central value of a 31-year window. Subfigures (c, d) and (e, f) show the same for 20-year low-, and high-pass (anomalies) series,respectively.

821

Figure A13. Example of a densitometric profile covering seven annual rings (period 1927-1933) showing intra-annual MXD and wood-anatomical variability for a *Pinus uncinata* tree from Gerber site (PNAESM). MXD reaches the maximum values during the late growing season, usually from August up to September, when cell-walls are thickening.

827

Figure A14. CRUTS3.10 mean May-September precipitation (in blue) and mean May-September temperature (in red) trends from 1901 to 2013. We found significant (Mann-Kendall P < 0.05) positive mean May-September temperature trends for the period 1901-2013 and also for the subperiod 1970-2009 (solid and broken red lines, respectively). Instead, no significant trend was found for the mean May-September precipitation trends.

834

835

836

837 **TABLES**

Table 1. Geographical, topographical and ecological characteristics of the sampled *P*. *uncinata* sites. Stands are arranged from East to West. Sites' codes are as in Figure 1.
Values are means ± SD. In bold, sites where samples for maximum density (MXD)
were obtained. Superscripts ^o and ^a indicate the sites located in PNOMP and PNAESM
respectively. Dbh = diameter at breast height

Site (code)	Latitude (N)	Longitude (E / W)	Altitude (m a.s.l)	Aspect	Slope (°)	Dbh (cm)	Height (m)	Age at 1.3 m (years)
Estanys de la Pera (EP)	42° 27'	1° 35' E	2360	SW	30 ± 0	65.2 ± 11.0	7.8 ± 2.0	339 ± 117
Mata de València (MA) ^a	42° 38'	1° 04' E	2019	N-NW	19 ± 10	43.2 ± 3.6	12.0 ± 3.1	237 ± 72
Estany de Lladres (LA) ^a	42° 33'	1° 03' E	2120	NW	35 ± 12	52.1 ± 9.8	8.3 ± 1.6	313 ± 123
Airoto (AI)	42° 42'	1°02'E	2300	W	37 ± 29	58.5 ± 13.5	7.4 ± 1.6	288 ± 100
Tessó de Son (TS) ^a	42° 35'	1°02'E	2239	N-NE	42 ± 14	74.5 ± 18.8	9.3 ± 3.8	346 ± 202
Estany Negre (NE) ^a	42° 33'	1°02'E	2451	SE	35 ± 18	71.0 ± 26.0	6.6 ± 1.9	411 ± 182
Estany Gerber (GE) ^a	42° 37'	0° 59' E	2268	W	15 ± 15	53.5 ± 14.6	6.9 ± 1.4	426 ± 147
Estany d'Amitges (AM) ^a	42° 35'	0° 59' E	2390	S-E	40 ± 21	69.0 ± 26.0	9.3 ± 3.8	355 ± 106
Mirador (MI) ^a	42° 35'	0° 59' E	2180	SE	33 ± 18	55.1 ± 25.8	7.6 ± 2.3	401 ± 132
Ratera (RA) ^a	42° 35'	0° 59' E	2170	Ν	40 ± 5	28.3 ± 8.1	10.4 ± 2.0	380 ± 146
Sant Maurici (SM) ^a	42° 35'	0° 59' E	1933	S-SE	16 ± 15	38.2 ± 5.7	11.5 ± 1.7	204 ± 23
Monestero (MO) ^a	42° 34'	0° 59' E	2280	SE	28 ± 13	64.4 ± 16.1	9.3 ± 2.1	346 ± 110
Corticelles (CO) ^a	42° 34'	0° 56' E	2269	W-NW	24 ± 17	83.1 ± 28.8	10.7 ± 3.8	509 ± 177
Barranc de Llacs (LL) ^a	42° 32'	0° 55' E	2250	N-NW	44 ± 38	71.7 ± 20.0	10.5 ± 2.5	616 ± 175
Atxerito (AT)	42'53'	0°45' E	1875	Ν	57 ± 22	64.7 ± 27.2	7.7 ± 2.4	422 ± 159
Conangles (CG)	42° 37'	0° 44' E	2106	S-SW	43 ± 15	56.0 ± 14.5	6.4 ± 2.7	318 ± 117
Vall de Mulleres (VM)	42° 37'	0° 43' E	1800	N-NE	34 ± 13	69.0 ± 26.0	9.8 ± 1.8	437 ± 184
Bielsa (BI)	42° 42'	0° 11' E	2100	Е	60 ± 4	45.1 ± 9.4	7.7 ± 3.0	270 ± 67
Sobrestivo (SB) ^o	42° 40'	0° 06' E	2296	S	38 ± 2	61.7 ± 17.5	7.6 ± 1.7	341 ± 97
Foratarruego (FR) $^{\circ}$	42° 37'	0° 06' E	2031	W	37 ± 11	49.5 ± 18.3	8.3 ± 2.9	433 ± 50
Senda Cazadores (SC) $^{\circ}$	42° 38'	0° 03' W	2247	Ν	39 ± 12	60.9 ± 16.5	9.4 ± 1.6	357 ± 145
Ordesa-Cara Norte (ON)°	42° 38'	0° 03' W	2270	Ν	40 ± 12	50.2 ± 12.5	9.8 ± 1.7	311 ± 45
Mirador del Rey (MR) ^o	42° 38'	0° 04' W	1980	SW	25 ± 10	53.3 ± 15.3	10.9 ± 4.6	117 ± 18
Las Cutas (CU) °	42° 37'	0° 05' W	2150	S-SW	20 ± 5	33.3 ± 8.3	9.9 ± 2.5	129 ± 16
Guara (GU)	42° 17'	0° 15' W	1790	N-NW	35 ± 5	44.5 ± 8.1	9.0 ± 1.7	149 ± 36
Respomuso (RE)	42° 49'	0° 17' W	2350	S	30 ± 19	49.5 ± 15.1	7.6 ± 1.5	280 ± 83
Pic d'Arnousse (PA)	42° 48'	0° 31' W	1940	NW	32 ± 4	65.4 ± 5.1	9.4 ± 0.7	248 ± 83
Valdelinares-Teruel (TE)	40° 23'	0° 38' W	1800	SW-W	10 ± 5	63.8 ± 12.4	10.2 ± 1.8	214 ± 107
Larra-La Contienda (CN)	42° 57'	0° 46' W	1750	SW	38 ± 24	46.4 ± 14.0	7.8 ± 2.2	350 ± 108
Castillo de Vinuesa (VI)	42° 00'	2° 44' W	2050	W	21 ± 1	85.6 ± 23.0	9.4 ± 2.9	368 ± 148

Table 2. Statistical characteristics for each site TRW chronology. Variables of raw tree-ring series for the time span analyzed: SD, standard deviation; AC, first-order autocorrelation. Variables of residual chronologies: ms_x , mean sensitivity, a measure of year-to-year growth variability; r_{bt} , mean correlation between trees which evaluates the similarity in growth among trees; E1, variance explained by the first principal component. The reliable time span was defined as the period with EPS > 0.85, where the EPS (Expressed Population Signal) is a measure of the statistical quality of the mean site chronology as compared with a perfect infinitely replicated chronology (Wigley et al. 1984). *N trees* is the number of trees needed to reach the EPS threshold for each site. The mean length was calculated for the time span, while tree-ring width, AC, ms_x , r_{bt} and E1 are calculated from 1901 to 1994. In bold, sites where MXD sampling was also carried out. Superscripts ^o and ^a indicate the sites located in PNOMP and PNAESM respectively.

				Raw data			Residual chronology				
Site	No. trees / radii	Time span	Mean length (years)	Tree-ring width ± SD (mm)	AC	Reliable time span (EPS > 0.85)	N trees	ms_x	r _{bt}	E1 (%)	
EP	20 / 39	1586-1997	198	0.95 ± 0.36	0.77	1775-1997	10	0.15	0.35	37.84	
MA^{a}	10 / 20	1668-1997	175	0.92 ± 0.51	0.85	1785-1997	9	0.18	0.40	47.19	
LA ^a	36 / 74	1390-2009	243	0.80 ± 0.40	0.85	1390-2009	13	0.13	0.27	32.34	
AI	16 / 31	1651-1996	194	1.02 ± 0.35	0.77	1748-1996	7	0.14	0.45	49.00	
TS^{a}	10 / 17	1537-1995	252	0.88 ± 0.38	0.84	1773-1995	13	0.12	0.32	38.43	
\mathbf{NE}^{a}	46 / 86	1393-2009	242	0.74 ± 0.33	0.79	1652-2009	11	0.14	0.36	38.34	
\mathbf{GE}^{a}	41 / 79	1270-2010	278	0.59 ± 0.26	0.81	1423-2010	11	0.12	0.43	50.06	
\mathbf{AM}^{a}	25 / 56	1592-2009	229	0.83 ± 0.33	0.77	1665-2009	7	0.15	0.48	51.79	
\mathbf{MI}^{a}	33 / 85	1390-2009	252	0.59 ± 0.32	0.83	1596-2009	12	0.16	0.34	37.25	
RA ^a	5 / 13	1818-2009	192	1.07 ± 0.70	0.88	1856-2009	5	0.17	0.40	50.36	
\mathbf{SM}^{a}	20 / 40	1811-1996	164	0.94 ± 0.68	0.89	1819-1996	9	0.18	0.48	50.57	
MO^a	30 / 76	1481-2009	246	0.92 ± 0.50	0.87	1691-2009	13	0.12	0.31	34.24	
CO^a	25 / 43	1509-1995	274	0.64 ± 0.25	0.78	1594-1995	15	0.14	0.34	37.51	
LL ^a	17 / 17	1338-1997	435	0.59 ± 0.29	0.88	1548-1997	17	0.11	0.33	38.51	
AT	17 / 43	1317-2010	339	0.59 ± 0.21	0.75	1474-2010	16	0.13	0.28	31.52	
CG	25 / 54	1510-1994	215	0.82 ± 0.36	0.82	1700-1994	14	0.15	0.26	30.37	
VM	12 / 23	1476-1994	234	0.77 ± 0.37	0.83	1816-1994	12	0.14	0.29	34.34	
BI	11 / 20	1707-1996	196	0.80 ± 0.53	0.82	1766-1996	10	0.21	0.40	46.27	

SB°	53 / 95	1512-2009	285	0.84 ± 0.51	0.85	1617-2009	16	0.15	0.30	32.1
FR⁰	12 / 25	1438-1947	305	0.50 ± 0.29	0.82	1582-1947	5	0.16	0.30	47.41
SC°	65 / 119	1421-2010	256	0.72 ± 0.41	0.85	1571-2010	27	0.12	0.28	29.51
ONº	14 / 27	1531-1998	234	0.76 ± 0.36	0.81	1716-1998	6	0.21	0.28	33.43
MR ^o	17 / 34	1795-1998	156	0.77 ± 0.44	0.86	1836-1998	12	0.15	0.31	34.39
CUº	10 / 20	1871-1997	98	1.71 ± 0.65	0.74	1892-1997	10	0.22	0.39	47.56
GU	27 42	1800-2011	122	1.85 ± 1.00	0.81	1873-2011	11	0.23	0.39	42.26
RE	20 / 47	1572-2010	202	0.84 ± 0.42	0.81	1742-2010	18	0.15	0.26	31.40
PA	8 / 16	1755-1994	170	1.14 ± 0.62	0.84	1778-1994	5	0.18	0.32	40.58
TE	35 / 68	1730-2008	157	1.33 ± 0.74	0.83	1741-2008	13	0.14	0.41	46.57
CN	25 / 57	1364-2010	252	0.68 ± 0.42	0.82	1670-2010	13	0.16	0.33	36.93
VI	24 / 42	1561-2010	238	0.99 ± 0.49	0.81	1731-2010	14	0.18	0.31	42.10

_

Table 3. Statistical characteristics of TRW and MXD chronologies (from the whole dataset) resulting from the 10 different detrending methods applied. Variables of standard tree-ring series for the period 1901-2009: *corr*, correlation coefficient with the maximum temperature of the period MJJAS; EPS, Expressed Population Signal, a measure of the statistical quality of the mean site chronology as compared with a perfect infinitely replicated chronology (Wigley et al. 1984); SNR, signal-to-noise ratio, the statistical size of the common variance between the trees; PC1, variance explained by the first principal component; ms_x mean sensitivity, a measure of year-to-year growth variability.

	Data transformation method	Detrending method	corr	EPS	SNR	PC1 (%)
		neg exp1	0.013	0.995	23.666	28.35
		neg exp2	0.087	0.994	23.365	30.56
	non-transformed	150-yr spline	0.213	0.994	23.365	27.42
		300-yr spline	0.219	0.995	23.366	28.07
TRW -		RCS	-0.066	0.995	23.366	22.58
	n ann a tuan afa ma a d	neg exp1	-0.012	0.995	23.366	27.42
	power-transformed	neg exp2	0.064	0.994	23.365	32.14
		150-yr spline	0.180	0.995	23.366	28.03
		300-yr spline	0.119	0.995	23.366	26.52
		RCS	-0.149	0.996	23.367	25.86
		neg exp1	0.244	0.919	11.381	37.07
		neg exp2	0.277	0.919	11.381	36.16
	non-transformed	150-yr spline	0.336	0.920	11.490	55.31
	non-transformed	300-yr spline	0.301	0.919	11.381	42.59
MYD -		RCS	0.247	0.918	11.274	46.27
MAD		neg exp1	0.246	0.921	11.599	33.32
		neg exp2	0.274	0.921	11.599	31.76
	power-transformed	150-yr spline	0.339	0.923	11.820	37.87
		300-yr spline	0.306	0.921	11.599	45.07
		RCS	0.198	0.920	11.490	47.96

FIGURE LEGENDS

Figure 1. Network of the 30 Iberian *Pinus uncinata* sampled sites (white areas indicate highelevation sites). The left lower 3D graph emphasizes the sampled sites located at high altitudes, mostly in the Spanish Pyrenees. The right lower map shows the location of the study area (red box, NE Spain) within the Mediterranean Basin (blue box).

Figure 2. Comparison between the RCS chronologies (dark lines) and the mean standard chronology derived from the 8 different spline and negative exponential detrendings (light lines), for (a) TRW and (b) MXD. Upper insets show the chronologies comparison for the period 1850-2009 for MXD and 1850-2010 for TRW (areas delimited by the black rectangles). Similar results are displayed in the *Pyrenees* and *Aigüestortes* subsets. Continued and dotted lines refer to chronologies derived from non-transformed and power-transformed data, correspondingly.

Figure 3. Correlation coefficients between maximum temperatures and (a) TRW or (b) MXD RCS chronologies. Monthly correlations are computed from previous-year October (o) to current-year September (Sep), and seasonal correlations are computed from current-year March to September, over the common period 1901-2009 and two subperiods: 1930-1969 and 1970-2009. Significant correlations are indicated with asterisks (p<0,05) and dots (p<0,001).

Figure 4. Contour plots summarizing the Pearson correlation coefficients (*r*) calculated between (a) TRW and (b) MXD RCS standard chronologies derived from power transformed raw data and the SPEI index for the 12 months of the year (y axis) at different time scales (1-24 months, x axis), considering the period 1901-2009 and two subperiods: 1930-1969 and

1970-2009. For SPEI index we used averaged data from 0.5° grids covering (a) the 30 TRW sampled sites and (b) the 6 MXD sampled sites. Legends in the right side show the correlation coefficients from negative values in blue to positive values in red. Significant values (p < 0.05) are those with r > 0.19 or r < -0.19 for the period 1901-2009, and r > 0.35 or r < -0.35 for both subperiods (1930-1969 and 1970-2009).

Figure 5. (a) May-September maximum temperature (red lines) and (d) June-July SPEI series (orange lines) compared with TRW RCSnt (dark blue lines) and RCSpt chronologies (light blue lines) for TRW. Upper graph indicates 31-year moving correlations between the climatic series and the RCSnt and RCSpt chronologies, coloured in dark and light blue lines respectively. Each moving correlation point refers to the central value of a 31-year window. For May-September maximum temperature, the same analyses for (b) 20-year low- and (c) high-pass (anomalies) series are displayed. For June-July SPEI, the same analyses are also displayed for (e) 20-year low- and (f) high-pass series.

Figure 6. (a) May-September maximum temperature (red lines) and (b) June-July SPEI series (orange lines) compared with MXD RCSnt (dark green lines) and RCSpt chronologies (light green lines) for MXD. The rest of explanations are as in Figure 5.