1 Pluridisciplinary analysis and multi-archive reconstruction of

2 paleofloods: societal demand, challenges and progress

3

4 Lothar Schulte¹, Daniel Schillereff², Juan Ignacio Santisteban³

- ¹ FluvAlps Research Group, Department of Geography, University of Barcelona, Spain,
 schulte@ub.edu
- ² Department of Geography, King's College London, United Kingdom,

8 daniel.schillereff@kcl.ac.uk

³ Department of Geodynamics, Stratigraphy and Paleontology, Fac. of Geological Sciences,

10 Complutense University of Madrid, Spain, j.i.santisteban@geo.ucm.es

11 **Corresponding author:** Lothar Schulte, schulte@ub.edu

12

13 Abstract.

14 Floods are one of the gravest natural hazards for societies, worsened by population growth, unchecked development, and climate change. From a Global 15 Change perspective, past extreme events merit particular interest because they 16 can be linked to wider climate and environmental changes, introduce 17 perturbations. During the last decade, knowledge of long-term flood frequency 18 19 and magnitude has been improved by extracting data from different types of archive. But, despite advances in dating methods, proxies and statistical 20 21 techniques and efforts to identify atmospheric drivers, some fundamental questions remain unresolved. The Special Issue entitled "Pluridisciplinary 22 23 analysis and multi-archive reconstruction of paleofloods" in the journal Global and Planetary Change addresses these uncertainties and complexities by assembling 24 25 a selection of studies, which were first presented at the Past Climate Changes (PAGES) Open Scientific Meeting held at Zaragoza in 2017. In this introductory 26

paper, the guest editors outline the 17 research contributions and meta-data from 27 the 17 paleoflood studies were systematically analyzed in terms of i) geographical 28 distribution; ii) methodologies applied; iii) types of archives; iii) numbers of flood 29 series compiled and iv) spatial and temporal resolution of paleoflood data. The 30 data indicate that paleoflood studies focused on fluvial depositional environments 31 show a higher rate of integration with other types of paleoflood archive (mean of 32 4.5 types of archive) than studies focused on documentary sources (mean of 3.5) 33 and lake sediments (mean of 2.4). We suggest that this strategy of archive 34 integration has been adapted to effectively compensate for the higher 35 36 uncertainties of fluvial deposition in floodplains. Statistical processing of the meta-data shows quantitative associations between specific types of flood 37 archive and offers a solid platform for designing the optimal approach for multi-38 39 archive paleoflood research. A qualitative review and visual comparison of the 17 paleoflood series shows some consistent trends and breaks but also notable 40 41 differences within and between regions. While a trend of increased flooding since 4-5 ka BP is evident, the lack of synchronicity between breaks and the coeval 42 increases and decreases in fluvial activity is manifest. The majority of studies in 43 the Special Issue do denote the 19th century - including the youngest cool climate 44 pulses during the Little Ice Age - as a particularly flood-rich period. It is more 45 difficult to assess the 20th century because of social changes, population growth 46 and extensive river modification. Despite the mentioned uncertainties, 10 of 14 47 papers do not record the 20th century as an exceptional flood period. Assessing 48 the effects of human impact on paleoflood calendars and disentangling 49 anthropogenic from natural drivers are major challenges in integrated paleoflood 50 analysis. 51

It is concluded that the interpretation of flood series is complex as landscapes and flood drivers are heterogeneous and systems show different sensitivities to flood control and drivers. Thus, the study of past floods, from historical and natural archives, is challenging but also offers unparalleled opportunities to document low-frequency, large-magnitude flood events, which occurred under a broad range of climate and/or environmental scenarios, and, probably, the only way to reconstruct robust paleoflood series.

Keywords: Paleoflood hydrology; flood hazard; natural archives; documentary
sources; multi-archive reconstruction; integration model.

61

62 **1. The motivation of this Special Issue**

The integration of multi-archive flood proxies to reconstruct flooding hundreds or 63 thousands of years ago is like putting together a puzzle. In the beginning, the 64 numerous pieces appear chaotic and confusing. But after struggling for some 65 years or even decades, structure and eventually a diffuse picture becomes 66 recognizable. This differs from an ordinary puzzle, however, because the number 67 of pieces is not finite and the puzzle will never be finished. Although this might 68 produce at a first glance a certain frustration, there are many other aspects which 69 fully satisfy the expectations of scientists. 70

The first aspect is that the development of multi-archive flood records is a relatively modern approach. Over the last two decades, a growing number of studies have reconstructed flood records spanning centuries and millennia from fluvial sediments, lake deposits, speleothems or tree-rings (Baker, 1987; Benito et al., 2004; Schulte et al., 2008, 2009b; Wilhelm et al., 2012; 2019; Díez-Herrero

et al., 2013; Wirth et al., 2013, Schillereff et al., 2014; Ballesteros-Cánovas et al., 76 77 2014; Santisteban et al., 2017; Denniston and Lütscher, 2017). These data series were largely confined to comparisons of paleoflood series with historical sources 78 and instrumental measurement of discharge and precipitation. More recently, 79 efforts were made to depict flood patterns across larger regions based on 80 instrumental data covering half a century (Blöschel et al., 2017). At the same 81 time, historians and geographers produced regional compilations also from 82 historical sources (e.g. Röthlisberger, 1991; Glaser, 2001; Brázdil et al., 2005a, 83 2005b; Wetter, 2011; Macdonald and Sangster, 2017; Paprotny et al., 2018). 84 85 Historical records and long instrumental records are mostly restricted to larger river towns (Pfister, 1999; Barriendos et al., 2014; Elleder et al., 2015; Wetter, 86 2017) whereas catchments in more remote regions, particularly mountain basins, 87 88 are often ungauged and historical sources may be scarce (Schulte et al., 2009a, 2015). Since flood archives are embedded in different geographical and 89 environmental settings, and their "perfect" study sites do not coincide 90 geographically, paleoflood information is often fragmented. 91

Multi-proxy approaches have become standard in paleoenvironmental and paleoflood research (Santisteban et al., 2017; Wilhelm et al., 2019), whereas multi-archive studies *in sensu strictu* which integrate more than three different types of flood archives are extremely rare (Schulte et al., 2015). This presents opportunities for creative researchers to open doors to a fascinating world where they can explore, combine, disentangle and test several combinations of flood archives.

A second motivation is the attraction of multi-disciplinary research. It is exciting
to meet researchers from other fields at conferences, workshops, field

excursions, or on interdisciplinary field work and listen to them describe their
approaches to researching floods. It is remarkable that they all look at the same
physical process but use other archives, proxies, markers, thresholds and so on.
For example, who could imagine that bioindicators such as algae and lichens in
cm-small alveoli in canyon rock walls could provide information about floods?
Therefore, it is vital for the paleoflood community to test reconstructed past floods
through different techniques, methods, and scientific views.

A third aspect is the spatial dimension of the flood phenomenon. Different 108 archives allow flood information to be obtained that better reflects the diversity of 109 landscapes that experience flooding compared to studies that focus on only one 110 type of archive. For example, in mountain regions, flood information can be 111 obtained from high-altitude lakes, tree-rings and lichen colonization of river 112 113 banks, gorge rock surfaces, and alluvial fan deposits at mid-altitudes, and from low-altitude floodplains and deltas (alluvial sediments, historical and 114 archaeological evidence, pollen, etc.). In some basins, flood data can be obtained 115 from multiple sites that differ in elevation by 1500 m or more within only a few 116 kilometers (Schulte et al., this issue; Zaginaev et al., this issue). Another 117 118 promising approach is the reconstruction of single flood events in terms of total flooded area, the propagation of the flood wave and the path of the precipitation 119 120 field (Kiss, 2009; Elleder et al., this issue). Furthermore, where a high density of 121 paleohydrological data is available, the production of paleoflood maps can 122 improve our spatial understanding of flood dynamics (Röthlisberger, 1991; Schmocker-Fackel and Naef, 2010; Barriendos et al., this issue; Schulte et al., 123 124 this issue). In this context, a further methodological innovation is the 125 reconstruction, reanalysis and modelling of synoptic sea level pressure maps of

extreme flood episodes, which improve our knowledge about atmospheric
variability as a flood driver (Ortega et al., this issue; Peña and Schulte, this issue;
Sánchez-García et al., this issue, Schulte et al., this issue).

129

130 2. Foci of the PAGES Floods Working Group

The exposed range of opportunities is one of the reasons why multidisciplinary 131 analysis and multi-archive reconstruction of paleofloods define one of the three 132 core activities of the Past Climate Changes (PAGES) Floods Working Group 133 since its founding in 2015. According to the White Paper (PAGES - Floods 134 135 Working Group, 2017), the Working Group "aims to bring together all the scientific 136 communities reconstructing past floods (historians, geologists, geographers, etc.) and those studying current and future floods (hydrologists, modelers, 137 statisticians, etc.) to coordinate, synthesize and promote data and results on the 138 natural variability of floods". Also in 2017, the Floods Working Group launched 139 three work packages (WP): WP1 focuses on collecting, storing and sharing of 140 global paleoflood data, WP2 on integrating and analyzing paleoflood data and 141 142 WP3 on communicating and disseminating paleoflood science and data at 143 different levels, including stakeholders. Conference sessions of the WP2 topic were organized in 2016 during the first Floods Working Group Workshop in 144 Grenoble and in 2017 on the PAGES Open Scientific Meeting held at Zaragoza. 145 146 Also in 2016 several members of WP2 launched a pilot project of paleoflood data integration in the Swiss Alps. The results of the first phase of this research of 147 geographers, historians, geologists, and geochemists are presented in the paper 148 149 of Schulte et al. entitled "Integration of multi-archive datasets towards the 150 development of a four-dimensional paleoflood model in alpine catchments" in this

Special Issue. These research activities will continue during the second phase(2019-2021) of the FWG Program.

153

3. Societal demand for multi-archive reconstruction of paleofloods

155 Floods are one of the gravest natural hazards for societies, worsened by population growth, unchecked development and climate change (UNISDR, 156 2015). So, the transfer of long flood series to public agencies is crucial for 157 producing reliable evaluations of floods and societal risk. However, although 158 policies have been developed (e.g. Directive 2007/60/EC of the European 159 Parliament and of the Council of 23 October 2007 on the assessment and 160 management of flood risks; Real Decreto 903/2010, of July 9th, Assessment and 161 management of floods), the integration of paleoflood studies into spatial planning 162 163 and flood risk assessment is not sufficiently applied. From a Global Change 164 perspective (Baker, 2006), past extreme events are of interest as they can be linked to climate and environmental changes, introduce perturbations in natural 165 166 systems and can be traced in paleoenvironmental archives. Hence, paleoflood research is a rapidly developing approach through which insight from multiple 167 disciplines (hydrology, geomorphology, climatology, paleolimnology) has 168 implications for human life as its goal is to understand and quantify flood risk over 169 extended periods of time. 170

During the last decade, knowledge of flood frequency and magnitude has improved through data coming from different types of archives (Baker, 1987; Benito et al., 2004; Schulte et al., 2015; Schillereff et al., 2016; Wilhelm et al., 2019). But, despite advances in dating methods, proxies and statistical techniques and efforts to identify atmospheric drivers, some fundamental

questions remain unresolved. The interpretation of flood series is complex as 176 177 landscapes and flood drivers are heterogeneous and systems show different sensitivities to hydrometeorological forcings. Thus, the study of past floods using 178 historical and natural archives is challenging but also a rare opportunity to 179 document low-frequency, large-magnitude flood events. Long-term studies also 180 allow trends in flooding that occurred under a broad range of climate and/or 181 environmental scenarios to be explored, which is probably the only way to 182 reconstruct robust paleoflood series. This issue addresses these uncertainties 183 and complexities by assembling a selection of studies with a global geographical 184 185 distribution (high to low latitude, from mountains to lowlands) and provide an insight about present state on multi-source data (lakes, floodplains, 186 187 geomorphology, tree-rings, historical and archaeological sources, soils, marine 188 sediments, etc.), controls/drivers and time-scales integration (from Pleistocene to present time) plus methodological and societal issues in paleoflood research. 189

190

191 **4.** Contents of contributions to multi-archive paleoflood reconstruction

192 The compilation of this Special Issue, which includes 17 research papers, is the 193 outcome of the PAGES OSM Conference session entitled "Multidisciplinary reconstruction of paleofloods". Sixteen oral contributions and 18 posters from 194 most continents were presented and lively discussed. The papers showcase 195 196 substantial progress in the analysis and interpretation of flood archives, important methodological advancements, including innovative approaches to integrate and 197 model diverse archives and flood series, and a focus on remote regions with 198 199 difficult access.

The research papers of Santisteban et al. (this issue) and Fuller et al. (this issue) 200 201 are case studies from Central Spain and New Zealand that demonstrate how high-resolution, continuous geochemical flood proxies can be inferred from 202 203 alluvial sediments that span most of the Holocene. Santisteban et al. (this issue) use several geochemical ratios as proxies for water competence, water level, and 204 sediment discharge to reconstruct flood pulses. Similarly, Fuller et al. (this issue) 205 206 estimated the flood recurrence interval using normalized Zr/Rb measurements and a tight age-depth model in a volcanically-reset catchment. 207

The studies of Agatova et al. (this issue) and Lombardo et al. (this issue) focus 208 209 on large-scale flood areas in Asia and South America which are difficult to access. In south-western Amazonia, Lombardo et al. (this issue) combined proxies such 210 as phytoliths and stable carbon isotopes from sedimentary flood archives and 211 212 soils to provide a solid reconstruction of past Holocene land cover change and periods of low or modest flooding. Agatova et al. (this issue) used 213 geomorphological, geological and geoarchaeological data to reconstruct the 214 presence of Late Pleistocene ice-dammed lakes and cataclysmic outburst floods 215 in the Mongolian Inland Drainage Basin. A multi-century dataset of regional 216 217 glacial outburst floods (GLOF) is presented by Zaginaev et al. for the Tien Shan 218 (Central Asia). These high discharge flash-floods were reconstructed by tree-ring 219 analyses from six different torrential fans providing insights on regional process 220 activity.

A different approach is adopted by the following four papers: extracting evidence from documentary archives to produce regional centennial flood series. Barriendos et al. (this issue) provide 18 extensive flood event chronologies for the Spanish Mediterranean coast from 14th to 20th centuries. They discuss the

profound influence of social factors on historical flood data series and evaluate 225 methods of integrating multi-source information such as population and flood 226 protection measures. This human component also affects the 450-year 227 reconstruction of historical discharges performed by Sánchez-García et al. (this 228 issue) from semi-arid South-eastern Spain. Furthermore, the synoptic 229 atmospheric configurations of four catastrophic flood events were investigated. 230 In the River Jing catchment, southern Chinese Loess Plateau, Yu et al. (this 231 232 issue) identified decadal solar activities as an important driver for floods and droughts. Multiple documentary sources and a precipitation-runoff model were 233 234 used by Elleder et al. (this issue) to explore the spatial imprint of the 1872 flashflood in central Bohemia and model the river's runoff response. 235

Another five papers deal with paleoflood reconstruction and flood frequency 236 237 analysis using lake records. Evin et al. (this issue) propose a novel statistical approach that combines a classic series of paleoflood observations for the Rhône 238 River reconstructed from lake sediments (Lake Bourget, Northwestern Alps, 239 France) and disseminates uncertainties related to the reconstruction method 240 during the estimation of extreme quantiles. Albrecher et al. (this issue) applied a 241 242 change-point analysis to sedimentary flood frequency data from six large alpine lakes. This enabled a comparison to be made with other flood records and 243 244 possible links to be drawn between event frequencies and climatic conditions. 245 Corella et al. (this issue) present a new method for estimating seasonally-246 resolved flood erosion rates using millennium-long varved lake sediments. Their use of high-precision, multi-proxy data also sheds light on the main environmental 247 248 drivers (climatic or anthropogenic) controlling sediment yield in a mountainous Mediterranean watershed. The respective roles of human and climate forcings on 249

Holocene flood frequency were also investigated by Rapuc et al. (this issue) in Lake Iseo (Southern Alps). Similarly, Schillereff et al. (this issue) showed that detailed sub-sampling and proxy analysis based on particle size data, coupled with careful evaluation against independent hydrological data and accounting for variations in external sediment supply potentially driven by anthropogenic landscape modification, is an appropriate methodology to extract paleoflood records from temperate lakes.

To explore climatic forcing of floods Peña and Schulte (this issue) performed a paleoclimate modeling experiment of the atmospheric variability related to large summer floods in the Hasli-Aare (Swiss Alps) from the AD 1300 to 2010. They propose the name of paleo-SNAO to define this decadal atmospheric variability related to summer floods in the alpine catchment.

Schulte et al. (this issue) designed an innovative methodology that integrates multi-archive datasets towards the development of a spatial-temporal (fourdimensional) paleoflood model in alpine catchments. The most continuous and accurate series from natural and anthropogenic flood archives were integrated over the period from AD 1400 to 2005 into a synthetic flood master curve for the Bernese Alps.

Ortega et al. (this issue) analyzed extreme ENSO-driven torrential rainfalls at the southern edge of the Atacama Desert during the Late Holocene and their projection into the 21st century. The integration of marine paleoclimate proxies, historical data, and the future projection helps to understand oceanic and climatic factors conditioning the variability of extreme rainfall events.

273

5. Geographical location and meta-data of paleoflood records

The 17 papers of the Special Issue present a diverse body of work in terms of i) geographical distribution (four continents, northern and southern hemisphere; Figure 1); ii) types of paleoflood archives; iii) numbers of flood series compiled; iv) spatial and temporal resolution and v) methodologies applied for the integration of flood data (Table 1).



Flood records mainly from natural archives
 Mainly from documentary archives
 From natural and documentary archives
 Number of flood series FWG metadatabase

280

Figure 1. Location of the case studies (black numbers) presented in the research papers of this Special Issue. The ID of each paper is listed in Table 1. White numbers encircled presents the number of studies recorded in the paleoflood metadatabase of the PAGES Floods Working Group for each region (PAGES-FWG, <u>http://www.pages-igbp.org/ini/wg/floods/wp1/data</u>, date of access January 10^{th,} 2019).

286

Figure 1 reflects two types of data: the papers presented in this Special Issue (black numbers) and the regional distribution of studies recorded in the paleoflood metadatabase of the PAGES Floods Working Group (FWG; <u>http://www.pages-</u> igbp.org/ini/wg/floods/wp1/data, white circled numbers). More than half of the

studies archived in the FWG databank are located in Europe. More than 50 291 292 studies were carried out in North America as well as in China, 15 in India, whereas low numbers are recorded in Australia/New Zealand, Central Asia, Africa, and 293 South America. 36% of these records were obtained from historical documents, 294 33% from riverine sediments, 29% from studies of lake sediments and tree rings 295 and, finally 2% from speleothems (PAGES Floods Working Group, 2019). These 296 numbers and consequent distribution do not include all worldwide published 297 works but may reflect some general trends. The high numbers obtained in Europe 298 reflect the intense research activities in the field of paleoflood reconstruction 299 300 across the continent, but, on the other hand, these numbers are also influenced by the location of organized workshops and annual meetings, the hosting of the 301 PAGES office and members of the FWG steering committee and the lower level 302 303 of cooperation with researchers from other continents. For example, in recent years several European researchers (many active in the FWG network) attended 304 305 paleoflood conferences organized by US researchers (e.g. Rapid City 2016) and 306 vice versa, but no joint conference has yet been organized by both communities. The paleoflood community is in a similar situation with regard to links with Asia. 307 308 In addition to the innovative topics and methodological progress of the presented 309 research papers, the metadata of these case studies presented in Table 1 provides interesting insight into the structure of multi-archive paleoflood 310 311 approaches. According to Table 1 and Figure 3, the papers presented in this

311 approaches. According to Table 1 and Figure 3, the papers presented in this 312 special issue can be subdivided into different groups. The first group includes 313 papers which present flood series from alluvial and fluvial depositional 314 environments and landscapes; the second group reconstructs flood calendars 315 from historical sources, and the third investigates past floods from lake deposits.

- Finally, there are contributions that focus on flood records from tree-rings and
- 317 marine sediments or integrate numerous types of flood archives.

		Multi	Botanical	Marine	A	luvial sedime	ents and soil	s		Documenta	ry sources			Га	ike sedimen	ts		Model
eteb eten	Research papers of Special Issue	Schulte et al.	.le 19 v9enigeZ	Ortega et al.	Santisteban et al.	.ls t9 svots3A	Lombardo et al.	Fuller et al.	Elleder et al.	Sánchez-G. et al.	Barriendos et al.	Yu et al.	.ls tə nivə	Corella et al.	Rapuc et al.	Schillereff et al	Albrecher et al.	əfludə2 & eñəq
n oi:	Reference in Figure 1	6	14	1	ъ	15	2	17	13	4	9	16	8	5	11	7	12	10
seg		46°41'N	74°33′E- 74°48′E	32°S-26 °S	39°5'N	50º15'N- 49º45'N	14°30'S	39°43'S	49°57'N	37º12'N	35°50'N- 43°34'N	34°48'N- 36°12'N	45° 43'N	42º19′N	45°44′N	54°30'N	47°48'N	46°41'N
	Location of study area	6°04'E	42°25′N- 42°42′N	71°43′W- 69°28′W	3°45′W	89º45'E- 90º10'E	65°00'W	175°09′E	14°04'E	1º46'W	5°58'W- 4°30'E	107°14E- 108°40'E	5° 52'E	0º59'E	10°4′E	2°55'W	13°23'E	6°04'E
	Total catchment area (km2)	2117	145	no data	26232	no data	78000	7380	8286	2611	156930	16057	4000	1.39	45	13,01	241	596
	Sediments (Stratigraphy, geochemistry)	4	9		3 (12)	2 (15 sect.)	4	1 (3)										1
	Landforms: flood plains, terraces, alluvial fans	ŝ				2 (basins)	4											
sə	Soil sequences	4				2 (15 sect.)	4 (37)											
seri	Mapping, aerial photographs, GIS	ŝ	9				4											
ро	10Be erosion rate data							1										
olì	Lichenometry	4																
ler	Dendrochronology/Dendromorphology	[1]	9															
ioig	Palynology	[1]												1				
}91	Documentary sources (flood series)	9	9	1	2			1	2	1 (4)	18	1 (10)				1	[1]	1
for	Documentary sources (drought series)				1							1 (10)						
pə	Flood series from flood marks	[7]							10									
zÁje	Archeological sites	1			1	2									[1]			
eue	Precipitation records (meteorological stations)	[4]		1	[11]				12	2	18			1				
sən	Instrumental records (gauging stations)	7			4			1	6	3	18		1			3	[1]	
vido	Lake sediments	4											1 (32)	1	1	1	1 [5]	
ne i	Marine sediments			1														
to s	Geophysical sections				1									1	1			
əd/	Variability of glaciers	[2]	9															
Ţ	Climate reanalysis / modeling (CESM at NCAR)	1		1						1								1
	Hydraulic / Hydrological modeling	[1]							1									
	Total of sytematically analysed archive	10	5	4	9	4	4	4	5	4	3	2	2	4	2	3	1	3
əu	Max. range of flood series (cal yr AD)	1400	1874	1301					1872	1550	1301	1646	1650			450		1300
iΤ	Max. range of flood series (cal yr BP)	3600			9500	>11600	10000	1770						2775	12000		7096	
sə	exact day	1	1						1	1	1	1						1
eri	seasonal	1	Ļ						1	1	1	1		1				1
s po	annual	1	1						1		1	1	1	1		1	1	1
ooli	intradecadal	1		1	ц								1	1	1	1	1	1
t to	decadal	1			1			1					1	1	1	1	1	1
uo	multidecadal				1			1										
itul	centennial						1											
osa	multicentennial						1											
·Я	millennial					1	1											

Table 1: Metadata of Paleoflood case studies published in the Special Issue. A) Numbers of different types of archive analyzed to compile regional flood series. Legend: 2 = number of analyzed flood series (one series per type of archive and catchment, region or area). If data is available: (2) = number of records; [1] = punctual data record or data not explicitly discussed in paper

325

The number of systematically analyzed types of flood archives listed in Table 1 326 varies significantly between papers. Seven studies - primarily investigating 327 historical sources and lake sediments - draw on one to three types of archives; 328 329 nine papers incorporate four to six types of archive and one paper utilizes up to ten. The meta-data indicates that paleoflood studies focused on fluvial 330 depositional environments show a higher rate of integration of different types of 331 paleoflood archives (mean of 4.5 types of archives) than studies focused on 332 documentary sources (mean of 3.5) and lake sediments (mean of 2.4). 333

Papers in this Special Issue present paleoflood reconstructions over variable time 334 periods, ranging from one and a half centuries (tree rings; Zaginaev et al., this 335 issue) to the Early Holocene (lake and alluvial flood records; Rapuc et al., this 336 337 issue: Santisteban et al., this issue) while the reconstruction of catastrophic floods from the Mongolian Great Lakes Basin reaches back to the Late Pleistocene 338 (Agatova et al., this issue). The highest temporal resolution (exact dates, 339 seasonal and annual flood information) were obtained by studies using 340 documentary sources or papers that combine natural flood archives (e.g. tree 341 rings and varved lake sediments) with documentary and instrumental data. It is 342 striking that most approaches exploiting natural archives (except soils and fluvial 343 landforms) achieve a temporal accuracy of decadal or better. 344

With regard to the spatial scale, large differences in the size of study areas and catchments are noticeable in Table 1. Catchments smaller than 100 km² are associated with lake reconstructions, whereas larger areas of more than 50,000 km² were studied by papers focused on landscape, landform and soil development. Barriendos et al. (this issue) submitted the paper with a total area of 156,930 km², which presents documentary flood records from 18 catchments spanning the Mediterranean slope of the Iberian Peninsula.

352

353 6. How are paleoflood archives combined and integrated?

A possibility to develop a conceptual framework for multiple-archive paleoflood integration is the performance of a qualitative approach (PAGES - Floods Working Group, 2017). However, statistical processing of the meta-data from paleoflood studies published in this Special Issue could provide valuable insight. This testing shows associations between different types of flood archive, achieving a solid background for the design of an integrated multi-archive paleoflood approach.

The variables (number of flood archive types analyzed for generating paleoflood 361 series) presented in Table 1 were transformed into a binary system and 362 introduced into a matrix. Factor analysis (FA) was performed to explore the 363 variability of flood archives across the 17 studies. Figure 2 shows the 2-364 365 dimensional plot of the first two factors explaining 34% (F1) and 19% (F2) of the variability. The following groups are identified: (i) fluvial and terrestrial archives 366 (red circle); (ii) botanical archives (green circle); hydrological archives (light blue 367 368 circle) and (iv) precipitation, discharge measurements and documentary sources

369 (blue circle). The variables climate modeling, lake sediments, and marine370 sediments show a more scattered distribution.





Figure 2: 2-D plot of the first two factors explaining the variability of types of archives analyzed bythe research papers in this Special Issue.

374

The factor F1 is interpreted as the range of environments of natural flood archives: floodplain and river environments show negative loadings, whereas subaquatic (lakes and marine) archives show positive loadings. The second factor reflects the temporal resolution of archives from low (millennial-scale resolution of fluvial landforms and soils) to high (exact hour and/or day of river discharge, documentary sources, flood marks and precipitation records). This distribution is similar to the 2-D plot (not shown) where temporal resolution (Table
1) is included in the FA matrix as an additional binary variable. Another interesting
outcome is the clear division (0.3 F2 loading) between natural archives and
anthropogenic sources (Figure 2).

385 Our explanation for this variability is that high-resolution lake records are mostly calibrated against instrumental records of discharge and precipitation as well as 386 387 documentary sources at annual and, in the best cases, seasonal resolution (Corella et al., this issue; Evin et al., this issue). Accurate calibration can also be 388 applied in the studies of tree-rings and lichens. However, the botanical archives 389 show a closer relationship with the group of fluvial archives, landforms, and soils 390 391 because they are also used when dating flood deposits, flood levels, and impacts (Schulte et al., this issue; Zaginaev et al., this issue). 392

Terrestrial archives such as fluvial landforms, deposits, soils, and archeological sites provide flood information at lower temporal resolution than e.g. lakes but they can explain the spatial scale of flooding more accurately (Agatova et al., this issue; Lombardo et al., this issue). With regard to the fluvial sediments in floodplains, the studies of Fuller et al. (this issue), Santisteban et al. (this issue) and Schulte et al. (this issue) demonstrate that fluvial deposition mirrors sensitively severe and medium-magnitude floods.

400

401 **7. Perspectives of the integration of paleoflood archives**

To understand the epistemic concepts of paleoflood research, the thematic relationships relationship between the 17 research papers of the Special Issue were explored. Factor analysis (FA) was performed from the binary matrix (chapter 3), where research papers are variables and flood archives analyzed by

each study are considered as cases. The 2-dimensional plot of the first two
factors shows the distribution of the research papers. Below the citations (values),
the types of flood series, generated by each study, are listed additionally.

409



410

Figure 3: 2-D plot of the first two factors explaining the variations and associations of the 17 paleoflood approaches presented in the Special Issue. The matrix is defined by binary data of analyzed types of archives. Below the references, the types of flood series generated by each study are listed. Note that the number of generated flood series is lower than the total of flood archives used for the compilation of flood series.

The 2D-plot in figure 3 presents a very clear structure. Papers that used data 417 from 2 to 4 different types of flood archive are located around the periphery, 418 essentially defining a circle (grey shading). Those papers which focus mainly on 419 420 lake records are located at the bottom (negative loadings of F2). The different factor F1 loadings of these studies result from the fact that Schillereff et al. (this 421 issue) and Albrecher et al. (this issue) compare their records with historical 422 sources and instrumental discharges (also Evin et al., this issue), whereas 423 Corella et al. (this issue) consider palynological data and Rapuc et al. (this issue) 424 provide a calibration using precipitation records. 425

426 Papers that primarily explore historical sources of flood information (Barriendos et al., this issue; Sánchez-García et al., this issue; Yu et al., this issue) are 427 situated on the left (strong negative loadings of F1) and show a close relationship 428 429 to the studies of floodplain sediments (Fuller et al., this issue; Santisteban et al., this issue). This association arises from the fact that both types of archives -430 documentary evidence of damage and flooding of settlements and infrastructure 431 on one hand, and aggradation of overbank deposits, on the other - are sourced 432 from similar areas of a catchment, e.g. in the floodplains of river valleys and deltas 433 434 (Schulte et al., this issue).

The loadings and associations of the only paper exclusively dedicated to paleoclimate modeling (Peña and Schulte, this issue; strong positive loading of F2) result from the fact that the flood periods of this model were inferred from geochemical floodplain proxies. The dendromorphological paper presented by Zaginaev et al. (this issue) is positioned a relatively short distance from the two papers dedicated to landforms, soils and archaeology (Lombardo et al., this issue; Agatova et al., this issue; positive loadings of F1 and F2), since trees were

sampled on alluvial cones for the reconstruction of flash-floods and debris flow
dynamics. The works of Agatova et al. (this issue) and Lombardo et al. (this issue)
take slightly eccentric positions because these approaches are not strictly related
to the analysis of flood records but rather on fluvial landscape and soil
development.

Those papers that show the strongest degree of multi-disciplinary research and 447 the highest number of integrated flood series are located in the center of the circle 448 (Figure 3). Furthermore, they performed climatological or hydrological modeling. 449 In the case of the study of Elleder et al. (this issue), the authors analyzed one 450 451 single flood episode reconstructing the propagation of the 1872 flooding by different documentary and instrumental archives. The study of Ortega et al. (this 452 issue) focuses on marine, documentary and instrumental archives. Finally, the 453 454 widest range of methodologies and archives are presented by the research cluster of the Bernese Alps (Schulte et al., this issue), where fluvial, lake, 455 documentary and lichenometric flood series are integrated (Table 1). 456

457 Despite the rather modest number of cases (defined by the papers published in 458 this special issue), this factor analysis helps elucidate the different yet 459 complementary approaches of palaeoflood research.

460 Thus, the distribution of papers and type of flood series (variables in Figure 3)
461 were integrated into the conceptual model presented in Figure 4.

462



463

Figure 4: Concept of multi-archive paleoflood integration according to the type of flood archive. The assembly of the type of flood series mirrors the distribution of papers and constructed flood series shown by the 2D-plot of the Factor Analysis of figure 3. Thus, the concept is not only based on a qualitative background but also on an empirical background inferred from the metadata of Table 1. Paleoflood records from speleothems* were not presented by any case study of the Special Issue, but they were included to complete the concept.

470

The conceptual model is structured in the form of a pie chart, in which each slice represents a type of paleoflood archive. Their arrangement is guided by their

nature and statistical association (Figure 3). Furthermore, each slice assembles 473 the most commonly used paleoflood proxies or techniques applied to that type of 474 archive. These archive types (external boundary of the chart) largely correspond 475 476 to scientific disciplines focused on analyzing past floods. The (sub-) horizontal slices in the middle (vertical order) represent terrestrial archives (geosphere), 477 including floodplains, soils, and landforms as well as historical sources. On top of 478 the geosphere are located botanical archives (biosphere) and climatological data 479 series (atmosphere). Slices at the bottom of the conceptual model are associated 480 with the hydrosphere and subaquatic archives: hydrological and hydraulic data 481 482 from rivers, sedimentary and environmental archives from lakes and oceans and speleothem proxies from subsurface flooding. 483

All these flood archives can be integrated by means of statistical processing (inner circle) to compose synthetic regional flood records that reflect flooding up to basin-scale. At these points, it has to be stressed again that the combination of proxies (and archives) and their statistical processing are presented in Table 1 and Figures 2 and 3.

Finally, robust multi-archive flood records can provide accurate information forfundamental concerns of society (bottom of Figure 4):

i) Centennial and millennia-long flood calendars allow clusters of extreme
events to be detected as well as changes in trends of flood frequency and
magnitude during periods of changing cold/warm and dry/wet climate
pulses and periods (Schulte et al., 2008, 2009a, 2015; Wilhelm et al.,
2012);

496 ii) Flood Frequency Analyses (FFA) based on long time series of field
 497 evidence ("real flood evidence") of extreme floods can account for

changes in the pattern of flooding during different climate conditions and
cycles (i.e., non-stationarity; Knox, 2000; Mudelsee et al., 2003);

- iii) Compiling spatial information of paleofloods in thematic maps contributes 500 fundamental information on local hazard and risk, thus improving river and 501 flood and ensuring appropriate 502 management spatial planning (Röthlisberger, 1992; Schulte et al., 2009b, this issue; Geoportal des 503 504 Kanton Bern, 2018);
- iv) The holistic knowledge of flood dynamics during past climate periods (e.g.
 RWP, DA, MCA, LIA) is critical for the assessment of the impacts of
 flooding in the context of Climate Change (Global Warming).

To conclude, the strong arguments in favor of integrated paleoflood approaches are the possibility of cross-calibrating independent proxies of past floods from different archives and bringing to light the flood phenomena from different perspectives. This diversity of foci on past floods and internal validation should reduce uncertainties and help to identify unusual data in flood series.

513

514 8. Major trends and drivers of paleoflood series

Despite the heterogeneity of the presented records in terms of sources, settings and timescales, a qualitative comparison between the flood series reveals some consistent patterns. The most evident structural elements in Figures 5 and 6 are: i) similar trends in frequencies and magnitudes of flooding; ii) periods of noticeable higher activity ("event periods"); and iii) "breaks" at which an abrupt fall in values occurs where thresholds in fluvial and erosional systems have been exceeded.

Relatively few records of multi-millennial timescale (Fig. 5) are presented, and 522 they are all based on sedimentary reconstructions. Most long records show an 523 overall trend of increasing flood frequency/magnitude from ca. 4 to 5 ka BP, with 524 some earlier episodes of high fluvial activity in Amazonia (before 8 ka BP; 525 Lombardo et al., this issue) and central Spain (from 8.5 to 7 ka BP; Santisteban 526 et al., this issue). Patterns of flooding around the world during the last five 527 millennia show more complexity, which could relate to: i) the higher temporal 528 resolution of available archives; ii) the higher number of shorter flood records; iii) 529 the use of documentary sources and a wider range of natural archives spanning 530 the last millennium; and iv) the progressive intensification of human impact on the 531 landscape and river systems (Fig. 6). Flood regimes during the last few millennia 532 are typically characterized by longer (many decades to centuries) periods of 533 534 increased flood activity punctuated by short or abrupt drops in flood occurrence (e.g. 2.2 ka BP at site 3, 1.5 ka BP at site 5, 1.8 ka BP at site 11 and 12 in figure 535 5). However, it is important to note that these gaps do not occur synchronously 536 (Fig. 5). 537

Whereas flood activity increases through the mid-Holocene in most records, (i.e. Albrecher et al., this issue; Rapuc et al., this issue; Santisteban et al., this issue), the picture of flood trends for the last 2500 years is much more diverse. Rapuc et al. (this issue) show an overall decrease in flooding activity while Albrecher et al. (this issue), Ortega et al., (this issue) and Santisteban et al. (this issue) show an increase until the last centuries.

544



 Trend ⇒ Event period …… Break
 River engineering
 Land-use intensification *: Land abandonment

 545
 1 Numbers of study area as in text and table 1
 For (3): - Regional event - Sub-basin event - Local event

Figure 5.- Millennial-scale flooding episodes according to research papers in the Special Issue and their relation to solar activity (sunspot group number and 21-points [210 years] moving average: Wu et al., 2018; 39°N summer-winter difference calculated using the R package 'palinsol', Crucifix, 2016, using the calculations of Berger and Loutre, 1991) and NAO index (Olsen et al., 2012) for European records and insolation at 60°S and 30°S (Berger and Loutre, 1991), ENSO events (Moy et al., 2002) and ENSO-related GAM and rainfall episodes in subtropical Australia (Barr et al., 2019) for the Pacific records. References of paleoflood studies: site 3 =





Figure 6.- European flood records spanning the last 2000 years, NAO (in reverse scale) (grey: 558 559 Olsen et al., 2012; black: Trouet et al., 2009) and sunspot reconstructions (grey: Usoskin et al., 2014; black: WDC-SILSO, Royal Observatory of Belgium, Brussels http://sidc.be/silso/home). 560 561 Similarities emerge in trends and periods of sunspot, NAO and flooding activity. There is a 562 stronger link between NAO and flooding than at the millennial time-scale. References of 563 paleoflood studies: site 7 = Schillereff et al. (this issue); site 11 = Rapuc et al. (this issue); site 12 564 = Albrecher et al. (this issue); site 9 = Schulte et al. (this issue); site 8 = Evin et al. (this issue); 565 site 4 = Sánchez-Garcia et al. (this issue); site 6 = Barriendos et al. (this issue); site 5 = Corella 566 et al. (this issue); site 16 = Yu et al. (this issue); site 14 = Zaginaev et al. (this issue).

567

Figure 6 presents ten data-rich paleoflood records that span the last 1.5 ka and
show similar variability (Fig. 6). Whilst most records show an increasing trend
over this period, there are exceptions.

This heterogeneous pattern continues towards the present, when human action 571 has become an increasingly important driver. Records showing sudden 572 decreases (i.e. Corella et al., this issue; Ortega et al., this issue; Schulte et al., 573 this issue) coincide at times with periods of increasing activity elsewhere (i.e. 574 Barriendos et al., this issue; Schillereff et al., this issue; Zaginaev et al., this 575 576 issue). These changes have been attributed by the authors to different natural forcings, depending on the period and timescale. For the millennial timescale, 577 Rapuc et al. (this issue) and Santisteban et al. (this issue) relate the long-term 578 579 trend to changes in insolation that could have affected seasonality and the persistence of atmospheric patterns (Fig. 5). Over shorter intervals, a number of 580 regional ocean-atmosphere processes have been invoked as important natural 581 forcings. Most presented studies for Europe relate flooding activity to negative 582 583 NAO phases (e.g. Rapuc et al., this issue; Santisteban et al., this issue; Schillereff

et al., this issue), (positive and negative) phases of summer NAO (Peña and
Schulte, this issue; Schulte et al., this issue), changes in solar activity (Peña and
Schulte, this issue; Schillereff et al., this issue) or cold phases linked to Atlantic
multidecadal variations (Barriendos et al., this issue). For the Pacific domain,
floods have been correlated to displacement of the westerlies/monsoon systems
(Pacific Decadal Oscillation, PDO; Southern Annular Mode, SAM) and ENSO
(Fuller et al., this issue; Ortega et al., this issue; Yu et al., this issue).

However, the frequency and intensity of flood events are the result of diverse and interacting factors operating at the local, regional and global scales. This produces complex records that are challenging to interpret. For example, Corella et al. (this issue) show a lake sediment record that responds to the seasonal distribution of storms and longer-term changes in soil properties (resulting from climate and land-use change).

The comparisons presented in Figures 5 and 6 (and in the papers mentioned) 597 598 highlight that temporal correlations between regional forcings and flood reconstructions can rarely be drawn precisely. However, numerous studies in the 599 Special Issue emphasis that the 19th century - including the most recent cool 600 601 climate pulses during the Little Ice Age - is a particularly flood-rich period (Barriendos et al., this issue; Rapuc et al., this issue; Schillereff et al., this issue; 602 Sánchez-García et al., this issue; Yu et al., this issue) and the period with highest 603 604 flood intensity in some regions (Corella et al., this issue; Schulte et al., this issue). This could be a consequence of synergetic effects between climate forcing and 605 human factors (land-use, river management). With regard to the 20th century, it 606 is difficult to assess the influence of global warming because of intensifying social 607 608 factors, the effect of hydraulic infrastructure and management, and demographic

and urban growth (Barriendos et al., this issue; Sánchez-García et al., this issue). 609 Research drawing on historical sources might also be affected by the increased 610 availability of flood information about smaller and moderate floods since the 611 second half of the 19th century. In addition, some flood types such as GLOFs and 612 debris flows can be favored by particular physiographic settings like the formation 613 of new glacier lakes in the Tien Shan mountains (Zaginaev et al., this issue). It is, 614 however, noteworthy that 10 of the 14 papers displayed in Figures 5 and 6 do not 615 record the 20th century as the exceptional flood period. 616

Based on this synthesis of current research, palaeoflood data are optimally 617 618 explored at decennial to centennial time scales (trends or periods). Finerresolution data are highly desirable but we must be conscious of multiple limiting 619 factors. For example, the mixing depth of sedimentary records may limit data 620 621 resolution. In addition, the timing of flooding in adjacent catchments can differ 622 considerably, as shown by Schulte et al. (this issue) in the Bernese Alps, Santisteban et al. (this issue) in Central Spain and Barriendos et al. (this issue) 623 in eighteen catchments of eastern Spain. This is unsurprising because 624 hydrometeorological processes, sensitivity to climate variability or land-use 625 626 change and thresholds may be site-specific. Palaeoflood research must account for this diversity. There are many potential pathways towards improvement: new 627 628 chronological tools that circumvent technical limitations, such as ¹⁴C 629 plateaus/anomalies coupled to higher-resolution, multi-proxy studies, basin-scale 630 studies, these need to be coupled with improved reconstructions of local factors, especially human activity, and climate forcing. For example, evaluating NAO or 631 632 ENSO as a long-term flood driver is limited by the temporal resolution of NAO

reconstructions. These requirements should guide future research and will bebest achieved by expanding collaborative efforts.

635

636 9. Human impact and disentangle anthropogenic from natural drivers

Anthropogenic modifications to the landscape can dramatically alter flood 637 regimes. Land-use change, in particular, the removal of mature vegetation covers 638 639 and intensification of agriculture, destabilizes hillslopes and increases surface runoff and soil erosion potential (Dotterweich, 2008; Hoffmann et al., 2010). 640 Structural interventions in rivers also affect the flood hazard (Schulte et al., 2015; 641 Wetter et al. 2017; Munoz et al., 2018). Disentangling climatic and anthropogenic 642 forcings in palaeoenvironmental data is a persistent challenge, however (Mills et 643 644 al., 2017). Palaeoflood researchers are cognizant of these difficulties (Brisset et al., 2017; Wilhelm et al., 2019) and this set of papers presents an opportunity to 645 646 explore current approaches and limitations when evaluating the human influence 647 on long-term flood risk.

Some common approaches are evident, in general, but also in this Paleoflood 648 649 Special Issue. There is common agreement that regional consistency across multiple proxies from independent archives denotes a climate signal whereas 650 localized shifts probably point towards human disturbance (e.g. Barriendos et al., 651 652 this issue; Fuller et al., this issue; Rapuc et al., this issue; Sánchez-García et al., 653 this issue; Schulte et al., this issue). There is also evidence that interactive effects characterize the climate-human-flood nexus. For example, flood occurrence in 654 655 northern Britain correlates with solar activity and NAO dynamics but concurrent woodland clearance for pastoralism appears to amplify flood frequency and 656 magnitude (Schillereff et al., this issue). Similarly, Rapuc et al. (this issue) show 657

a striking increase in flood frequency at Lake Iseo (Italy) around 3000 yr BP that 658 coincides with forest clearance indicators but lags the onset of climate-driven 659 Subsequent channel diversion, however, 660 catchment erosion. reduced sedimentation and discontinued the depositional flood record in some areas of 661 lake basins (Rapuc et al., this issue) and floodplains (Carvalho and Schulte, 662 2013). Researchers must be aware that channelization can equally produce 663 areas of aggradation and delta progradation (Schulte et al., 2009a; Wirth et al., 664 2011; Santisteban et al., this issue). Crucially, the effects of human pressure on 665 flood regimes are often irregular through time. Corella et al. (this issue) infer from 666 667 high-resolution, multi-proxy palaeoecological data that burning, grazing and cultivation triggered a prolonged period of frequent flooding around 700-1300 AD 668 in northeast Spain. Equivalent activity during later centuries produced a more 669 670 muted flood response, suggesting the system rebalanced to accommodate disturbance. 671

Hydraulic infrastructure also induces complex effects. Flood risk declined on 672 Spanish rivers after expansive 20th-century dam building (Barriendos et al., this 673 issue). Similarly, in several catchments of the Alps the combination of river 674 675 correction and diversion into large alpine lakes lower peak downstream discharges because these lakes regulate flood waters like large retention areas 676 677 (Wetter et al., 2011, Schulte et al., this issue). Conversely, channelization 678 amplified flood magnitudes on the Mississippi (Munoz et al., 2018) while Elleder 679 et al. (this issue) show the Mladotice dam collapse (Czech Republic) was a key factor behind the destructiveness of the 1872 flood. Sánchez-García et al. (this 680 681 issue) note more recent dam construction, such as on the Almanzora River, Spain

(Sánchez-García et al., this issue), has shifted the hydrometeorological baseline. 682 This hinders efforts to evaluate flood risk under 21st-century climatic warming. 683 684 This compilation of evidence stresses that the role of human activity as a flood driver and proxy evidence used to characterize an anthropogenic signature must 685 686 be established on a site-by-site basis. This presents a number of challenges: first, while the multi-proxy approach of Corella et al. (this issue) that distinguishes the 687 impacts of grazing, burning and cultivation is a powerful tool and Schulte et al. 688 (this issue) sift their synthesis of the European Alps for sites least affected by 689 human presence, such bountiful paleoflood data is rare. Second, we must keep 690 691 in mind that vegetation and fire dynamics can respond independently to climate so evidence of human-induced changes is crucial (Corella et al., this issue). Third, 692 inter-site comparisons will widen chronological uncertainty. For example, most 693 694 periods of frequent flooding in northern Britain (Schillereff et al., this issue) align with geomorphic evidence of hillslope destabilization across the region but both 695 datasets depend on radiocarbon dates with multi-decadal uncertainties. 696 Communicating the temporal uncertainty for comparator datasets should, 697 therefore, be encouraged. Similarly, the approach of Rapuc et al. (this issue) to 698 699 re-examine local archaeological evidence in a flooding context builds confidence in the time-transgressive role of human activity. Lastly, we must be wary of 700 701 circular reasoning: catchment destabilization usually alters the rainfall-runoff 702 relationship and soil erodibility. In this scenario, an anomalous lamination need 703 not reflect a major flood because of modest rainfall on recently exposed, fragile 704 soils could produce a similar signature. Mechanistic interpretations that consider 705 transport capacity, for example, become crucial (Evin et al., this issue; Schillereff et al., this issue). Similarly, Corella et al. (this issue) convincingly attribute a shift 706

in flood seasonality to human influence because known advancements in tilling
practice would create the observed response. Site selection is also important. For
example, Schulte et al. (this issue) show a divergent flood response on either
flank of the Bernese Alps.

711 Isolating the anthropogenic component can be a formidable challenge. This 712 collection of papers showcase how a coupled multi-archive, multi-proxy approach 713 is imperative. In sedimentary systems, for example, do different geochemical proxies reflect rates of erosion and the carrying capacity of the system (grain 714 size). Determining the nature of human modifications must also occur on a 715 716 specific basis. Channel diversion and hillslope vegetation clearance may exert 717 quite different effects on the flood regime. This could draw on archaeological evidence, for example (Rapuc et al., this issue). As human and climatic modifiers 718 719 may coincide, less equivocal proxy evidence of human presence is needed. 720 Indicator pollen (Corella et al., this issue) or pastoral DNA (Giguet-Covex et al., 2014) show real promise but may require deeper collaboration amongst 721 international research groups in the future. Integrating sedimentary data with an 722 independent archive, such as historical documents or tree rings would also be 723 724 wise.

725

10. Outlook: scoop and limitations of multi-archive paleoflood integration

Taking a long-term perspective on flooding is fundamental for adequate hazard
and risk assessment (e.g. flood-frequency analysis). The research papers in this
Special Issue demonstrate that integrating field-data on "real" past floods derived
from multiple historical and natural archives provides excellent flood data series.
These datasets are uniquely positioned to document low-frequency, large-

magnitude flood events that vary under different climate regimes (cooler, warmer
and transitional climate periods) and/or environmental conditions (changes in
land cover, land use, and river management).

However, reliable and accurate integration of paleoflood data relies on
 accounting for several critical issues:

i) Although this paper does not focus on the dating of flood records, we
would like to stress first that considering dating uncertainties within the
time series is vital prior to perform statistical analysis. The temporal
resolution of records can vary significantly, however. Before flood data
series from different natural and anthropogenic archives can be
integrated into a regional model, a critical assessment of chronological
models and homogenization of flood data is needed.

The comparability of flood series from heterogeneous catchments and
landscapes is often complex because the controlling factors and
system sensitivity (e.g. of erosion or aggradation) to climatological
conditions and hydrological extremes varies greatly across diverse
hydrological and environmental settings.

iii) Indirect flood proxies recording climatic-environmental signals (e.g.
sediments that are deposited by surface runoff in a small subcatchment) are different from records that are directly involved in the
process of river flooding. Thus a precise understanding and a careful
interpretation and/or calibration of physical processes are mandatory.

iv) Due to the heterogeneous natural response of different subsystems to
flood drivers, not all flood series from a basin or a region can be
integrated into a regional synthetic paleoflood master curve. The

criteria for selection or rejection of individual flood series must not only
follow statistical protocols but also consider process-based arguments.
To identify "false alarms" and "missed" floods, data series should be
tested against known regional hydrological extreme events that are
documented by several records.

v) Human modification to many river systems has had major effects on
 the flood regime. These non-stationary conditions impose challenges
 when performing flood frequency analysis and evaluating flood risk
 under future climate change projections. Effort should be invested to
 isolate the anthropogenic component, ideally through a coupled multi archive, multi-proxy approach.

vi) There is good evidence that some regional/global factors can
systematically affect the dynamics of flooding over long timescales.
There is now a need to achieve wider spatial and temporal coverage,
leading to better understand the factors affecting intra-basin variability,
especially interactions between natural and anthropogenic forcings.

When critical points i) - vi) are carefully taken into consideration, it seems clear 773 that using a variety of paleoflood data from multiple archives and methodologies 774 775 from different scientific fields is the best approach. Such multi-dimensional 776 investigations can better account for limitations in individual records and more effectively analyze the spatial distribution (horizontal and vertical) of flood records 777 778 in order to capture the physiographic and environmental diversity of a catchment. Schulte et al. (this issue) conclude from their integrated paleoflood pilot project in 779 780 the Alps that such a multi-archive methodology can be applied in many regions. They do recommend, however, that this approach will be most effective in 781

catchments where a high number of paleoflood records already exist and a
profound understanding of the different flood proxies and flood generating
mechanisms has been built up.

The meta-data of the case studies presented in this Special Issue in Table 1 785 786 suggest that paleoflood studies focused on fluvial depositional environments show a higher rate of integration with other types of paleoflood archive (mean of 787 788 4.5 types of archive) than studies focused on documentary sources (mean of 3.5) and lake sediments (mean of 2.4). We suggest that this adopted strategy of cross-789 correlation is an effective method to compensate for the higher uncertainties of 790 791 fluvial deposition in floodplains due to lower temporal sample resolution and 792 possible effects of unconformities (possible gaps of flood information). The apparently more precisely dated lake and documentary flood records focus 793 predominantly on instrumental calibration instead of multi-archive integration. 794 However, several studies showed that neither of these series always record 795 continuous flood information and they should be completed by other archives. In 796 addition, spatial accuracy of flooding processes is a weak point of studies where 797 798 flood information is obtained from single locations such as lakes, flood marks or 799 settlements instead of larger flood-prone areas. In this latter case, terrestrial 800 natural flood archives contribute highly valuable information.

Based on the gathered experience from the Special Issue, the activities of the work package WP2 and the FWG pilot multi-archive project, we suggest that over the next few years the agenda of regional paleoflood research might include the following trends:

i) Design of methodological approaches integrating paleoflood datasets
 through numerous regional pilot studies in different environments,

- 807 ii) Improvements in flood frequency analysis and spatial flood risk
 808 assessment using multi-archive analysis,
- 809 iii) The progress of methodological and statistical approaches to analyze810 paleoclimate models in relation to the flood variability,
- iv) Assessment of the changes of flood pattern due to the effect of land-usechanges in basins,
- v) Examination of changes in external forcing and atmospheric variability of
 the flood periods by paleoclimate modeling. Furthermore, these
 comparisons help to predict future climate change related to flooding.
- vi) Detailed consideration of the role of anthropogenic landscape modification
 in controlling flood dynamics and develop and apply multi-proxy
 approaches to disentangle the effects of human activity from climatic
 drivers of flooding. This will be most effectively achieved through wide
 collaborations.

We, the invited editors of the present Special Issue and authors of this 821 introductory article, hope that the collection of papers presented in the Paleoflood 822 Special Issue and at the PAGES Open Scientific Meeting in 2017 contribute to 823 824 the progress of paleoflood research and inspire interested readers to promote the research on multidisciplinary analysis and multi-archive reconstruction of 825 826 paleofloods. Finally, we would like to express our gratitude to the more than 101 827 authors and co-authors who shared enthusiastically their knowledge at the 828 PAGES OSM conference session at Zaragoza and contributed with their studies and research projects to this Special Issue on Paleofloods. 829

830

831 Acknowledgments

We would like to thank Fabienne Marret-Davies, Editor-in-Chief and responsible 832 Home Editor of the Global and Planetary Change Journal, for her advice on how 833 to focus and edit this Special Issue. We would also like to express our gratitude 834 to the other Editors-in-Chief Zhengtang Guo, Alan Haywood, Liviu Matenco and 835 the Editorial Board of this Journal for accepting our SI proposal. Thanks to Sunoj 836 Sankaran and Yanping Hou from Elsevier for patiently managing and monitoring 837 the editing and production processes. We are also grateful to a large number of 838 reviewers of the 17 research papers for their expertise and judgment. The OSM 839 840 conference session and the related Special Issue were supported by the Past Climate Changes Project (PAGES). We would like to thank in particular the 841 unconditional support of Bruno Wilhelm and Juan Antonio Ballesteros Canovas, 842 843 co-leaders with Lothar Schulte of the Flood Working Group (FWG), for incorporating this initiative into the agenda of the FWG community. The authors 844 845 of this introductory paper and Guest Editors of this Special Issue are members of the Past Climate Change (PAGES) Floods Working Group 2016-2018 and 2019-846 2021. 847

The work was also co-funded by the Spanish Ministry of Economy and Competitivity (CGL2016-75475/R, CGL2011-30302-C02-01), the Catalan Institution for Research and Advanced Studies (ICREA Academia 2011).

851

852 **References**

Albrecher, H., Bladt, M., Kortschak, D., Prettenthaler, F., Swierczynski, T. Flood
occurrence change-point analysis in the paleoflood record from Lake Mondsee
(NE Alps). Global and Planetary Change [under review; this issue].

- Agatova A.R., Nepop R.K., 2019. Pleistocene fluvial catastrophes in now arid NW areas
 of Mongolian Inland drainage basin. Global and Planetary Change 175, 211–225
 [this issue].
- Baker, V.R.,1987. Paleoflood hydrology and extreme flood events. Journal of Hydrology
 96, 79–99.
- Baker, V.R., 2006. Palaeoflood hydrology in a global context. Catena 66, 141–145.
- Ballesteros-Cánovas, J.A., Márquez-Peñaranda, J.F., Sánchez-Silva, M., Díez-Herrero,
 A., Ruiz-Villanueva, V., Bodoque, J.M., & Stoffel, M., 2014. Can tilted trees be
 used for palaeoflood discharge estimation? Journal of Hydrology, 529(2), 480489.
- Barr, C., Tibby, J., Leng, M.J., Tyler, J.J., Henderson, A.C.G., Overpeck, J.T., Simpson,
 G.L., Cole, J.E., Phipps, S.J., Marshall, J.C., McGregor, G.B., 2019. Holocene el
 Niño–Southern Oscillation variability reflected in subtropical Australian
 precipitation. Scientific Reports, 9, 1627.
- Barriendos, M., Ruiz-Bellet, J.L., Tuset, J., Mazón, J., Balasch, J. C., Pino, D., and Ayala,
 J. L. 2014. The "Prediflood" database of historical floods in Catalonia (NE Iberian
 Peninsula) AD 1035–2013, and its potential applications in flood analysis. Hydrol.
 Earth Syst. Sci., 18, 4807-4823.
- Barriendos, M., Gil-Guirado, S., Pino, D., Tuset, J., Pérez-Morales, A., Alberola, A.,
 Costa, J., Balasch, J.C., Castelltort, X.F., Mazon, J., Ruiz-Bellet, J.L. Flood
 events chronologies for Spanish Mediterranean coast from documentary sources
 (14th-20th centuries). Updated series for palaeoclimatic analysis and interaction
 with social factors [under review; this issue].
- Benito, G., Lang, M., Barriendos, M., Llasat, M.C., Francés, F., Ouarda, T., Thorndycraft,
 V.R., Enzel, Y., Bardossy, A., Coeur, D. and Bobée, B., 2004. Use of systematic,
 palaeoflood and historical data for the improvement of flood risk estimation.
 Review of scientific methods. Natural Hazards, 31(3), 623-643.
- Berger, A., Loutre. M.F., 1991. Insolation values for the climate of the last 10 million
 years. Quaternary Science Review, 10, 297-317.
- Blöschl, G., Hall, J.L., Parajka, J., Perdigao, R.A.P., Merz, B., Arheimer, B., Aronica,
 G.T., Bilibashi, A., Bonacci, Q., Borga, M.,..., Živković N., 2017. Changing climate
 shifts timing of European floods. Science 2017, 357, 588–590.
- Brázdil, R., Dobrovolný, P., Elleder, L., Kakos, V., Kotyza, O., Květoň, V., Macková, J.,
 Müller, M., Štekl, J., Tolasz, R., Valášek, H., 2005a. Historical and Recent Floods

- in the Czech Republic. Masaryk University and Czech HydrometeorologicalInstitute, Brno, Prague, 370 pp.
- Brázdil, R., Pfister, C., Wanner, H., von Storch, H., Luterbacher, J., 2005b. Historical
 climatology in Europe the state of the art. Climatic Change 70 (3), 363–430.
- Brisset, E., Guiter, F., Miramont, C., Troussier, T., Sabatier, P., Poher, Y., Cartier, R.,
 Arnaud, F., Malet, E., Anthony, E.J., 2017. The overlooked human influence in
 historic and prehistoric floods in the European Alps. Geology 45, 347–350.
- Carvalho, F., Schulte, L., 2013. Morphological control on sedimentation rates and
 patterns of delta floodplains in the Swiss Alps. Geomorphology, 198, 163–176.
- Corella, J.P., Benito, G., Wilhelm, B., Montoya, E., Rull, V., Vegas-Vilarrúbia, T., ValeroGarces, B.L. A millennium-long perspective of flood-related seasonal sediment
 yield in Mediterranean watersheds. Global and Planetary Change [under review;
 this issue].
- 903 Crucifix, M., 2016. palinsol: Insolation for Palaeoclimate Studies. R package version
 904 0.93. https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=palinsol
- D'Arrigo, R., Wilson, R., 2006. On the Asian Expression of the PDO. International Journal
 of Climatology, 26, 1607-1617.
- Dotterweich, M., 2008. The history of soil erosion and fluvial deposits in small catchments
 of central Europe: Deciphering the long-term interaction between humans and
 the environment A review. Geomorphology, 101, 192–208.
- Elleder, L., 2015. Historical changes in frequency of extreme floods in Prague. Hydrol.
 Earth Syst. Sci., 19, 4307-4315.
- Elleder, L., Krejčí, J., Racko, S., Daňhelka, J., Šírová, J., Kašpárek, L. Reliability check
 of flash-flood in Central Bohemia on May 25, 1872. Global and Planetary Change
 [under review; this issue].
- Evin, G., Wilhelm, B., Jenny, J.-P., 2019. Flood hazard assessment of the Rhône River
 revisited with reconstructed discharges from lake sediments. Global and
 Planetary Change 172, 114–123 [this issue].
- Denniston, R.F., Luetscher, M., 2017. Speleothems as high-resolution paleoflood
 archives. Quaternary Science Reviews, 170, 1–13.
- Díez-Herrero, A., Ballesteros, J.A., Ruiz-Villanueva, V., Bodoque, J.M., 2013. A review
 of dendrogeomorphological research applied to flood risk analysis in Spain
 Geomorphology 196, 211–220.

- Geoportal des Kanton Bern, 2018. Naturgefahren-Ereigniskataster. Several maps online. Amt für Geoinformationen des Kantons Bern [Natural Hazard Event
 Cadastral. Division of Geoinformation of the Canton Berne]
 https://www.geo.apps.be.ch/de; last access 15/03/2019.
- Giguet-Covex, C., Pansu, J., Arnaud, F., Rey, P.-J., Griggo, C., Gielly, L., Domaizon, I.,
 Coissac, E., David, F., Choler, P., Poulenard, J., Taberlet, P., 2014. Long
 livestock farming history and human landscape shaping revealed by lake
 sediment DNA. Nature Communications 5, 3211.
- Glaser, R., 2001. Klimageschichte Mitteleuropas. 1000 Jahre Wetter, Klima,
 Katastrophen, Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft Darmstadt, Darmstadt,
 227 pp.
- Fuller, I., Macklin, M., Toonen, W., Turner, J., Norton, K. A ~2000 year record of
 palaeofloods in a volcanically-reset catchment: Whanganui River, New Zealand.
 Global and Planetary Change [under review; this issue].
- Hoffmann, T., Thorndycraft, V.R., Brown, A.G., Coulthard, T.J., Damnati, B., Kale, V.S.,
 Middelkoop, H., Notebaert, B., Walling, D.E., 2010. Human impact on fluvial
 regimes and sediment flux during the Holocene: Review and future research
 agenda. Global Planetary Change 72, 87–98.
- Kiss, A., 2009. Floods and weather in 1342 and 1343 in the Carpathian basin, J. Environ.
 Geogr., 2, 37–47.
- 943 Knox, J.C., 2000. Sensitivity of modern and Holocene floods to climate change.
 944 Quaternary Science Reviews 19, 439–457.
- Lombardo, U., Ruiz-Pérez, J., Rodrigues, L., Mestrot, A., Mayle, F., Madella, M., Szidat,
 S., Veit, H., 2019. Holocene land cover change in south-western Amazonia
 inferred from paleoflood archives. Global and Planetary Change 174, 105–114
 [this issue].
- Macdonald, N., Sangster, H., 2017. High-magnitude flooding across Britain since AD
 1750. Hydrology Earth System Sciences, 21, 1631–1650.
- Mills, K., Schillereff, D., Saulnier-Talbot, É., Gell, P., Anderson, N.J., Arnaud, F., Dong,
 X., Jones, M., McGowan, S., Massaferro, J., Moorhouse, H., Perez, L., Ryves,
 D.B., 2017. Deciphering long-term records of natural variability and human
 impact as recorded in lake sediments: a palaeolimnological puzzle. Wiley
 Interdisciplinary Reviews: Water 4, e1195.

- Moy, C.M., Seltzer, G.O., Seltzer, D.T., Anderson, D.M., 2002. Variability of El
 Nino/Southern Oscillation activity at millennial time scales during the Holocene
 epoch. Nature, 420, 162-165.
- Mudelsee, M., Börngen, M., Tetzlaff, G., & Grünewald, U., 2003. No upward trends in
 the occurrence of extreme floods in central Europe. Nature, 425, 166–169.
- Munoz, S. E., Giosan, L., Therrell, M. D., Remo, J. W. F., Shen, Z., Sullivan, R. M.,
 Wiman, C., O'Donnell, M., Donnelly, J. P., 2018. Climatic control of Mississippi
 River flood hazard amplified by river engineering. Nature, 556(7699), 95–98.
- Olsen, J., Anderson, N.J., Knudsen, M.F. 2012. Variability of the North Atlantic
 Oscillation over the past 5,200 years. Nature Geoscience, 5, 808-812.
- Ortega, C., Vargas, G., Rojas, M., Rutllant, Muñoz, P., Lange, C.B., Pantoja, S.,
 Dezileau, L., Ortlieb, L., 2019. Extreme ENSO-driven torrential rainfalls at the
 southern edge of the Atacama Desert during the Late Holocene and their
 projection into the 21th. Century Global and Planetary Change 175, 226–237 [this
 issue].
- PAGES Floods Working Group, 2017. For an improvement of our flood knowledge
 through paleodata. White paper of the PAGES Floods Working Group,
 Grenoble, 15 pp. <u>http://www.pages-igbp.org/ini/wg/floods/intro</u>
- Paprotny, D., Sebastian, A., Morales-Nápoles, O., N. Jonkman, S.N., 2018. Trends in
 flood losses in Europe over the past 150 years. Nature Communications (2018)
 9:1985, DOI: 10.1038/s41467-018-04253-1
- Peña, J.C., Schulte, L. A paleoclimate model of the atmospheric variability related to
 large summer floods in the Hasli-Aare (Swiss, Alps) from the AD 1300 to 2010.
 Global and Planetary Change [under review; this issue].
- 980 Pfister, C., 1999. Wetternachhersage. 500 Jahre Klimavariationen und
 981 Naturkatastrophen (1496–1995), Haupt-Verl., Bern, 304 pp.
- Rapuc, W., Sabatier, P., Arnaud, F., Palumbo, A., Develle, A.-L., Reyss, J.-L., Augustin,
 L., Régnier, E., Piccin, A., Chapron, E., Dumoulin, J.-P., Grafenstein, U.v., 2019.
 Holocene-long record of flood frequency in the Southern Alps (Lake Iseo, Italy)
 under human and climate forcing. Global and Planetary Change 175, 160–172
 [this issue].

Röthlisberger, G., 1991. Chronik der Unwetterschäden in der Schweiz. WSL Bericht 330, Eidgenössische Forschungsanstalt für Wald, Schnee und Landschaft, Birmensdorf, 122 pp.

- Sánchez-García, C., Schulte, L., Carvalho, F., Peña, J.C. 500-year flood history in the
 arid environments of south-eastern Spain. The case of the Almanzora River.
 Global and Planetary Change [under review; this issue].
- Santisteban, J.I., Mediavilla, R., Celis, A., Castaño, S., de la Losa, A., 2017. Millennialscale cycles of aridity as a driver of human occupancy in central Spain?
 Quaternary International 407,96-109.
- Santisteban, J.I., Mediavilla, R., Galán de Frutos, L., López Cilla, I. Holocene floods in a
 complex fluvial wetland in central Spain: environmental variability, climate and
 time. Global and Planetary Change [under review; this issue].
- Schillereff, D.N., Chiverrell, R.C., Macdonald, N., Hooke, J.M., 2014. Flood stratigraphies
 in lake sediments: A review. Earth-Science Reviews 135, 17–37.
- Schillereff, D.N., Chiverrell, R.C., Macdonald, N. and Hooke, J.M., 2016. Hydrological
 thresholds and basin control over paleoflood records in lakes. Geology, 44(1),
 43-46.
- Schillereff, D., Chiverrell, R., Macdonald, N., Hooke, J., Welsh, K., Piliposian, G.,
 Croudace, I. Convergent human and climate forcing of late-Holocene flooding in
 northwest England. Global and Planetary Change [under review; this issue].
- Schmocker-Fackel, P. Naef, F., 2010b. Changes in flood frequencies in Switzerland
 since 1500. Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci., 14, 1581-1594.
- Schulte, L., Julià, R., Oliva, M., Burjachs, F., Veit, H., Carvalho, F., 2008. Sensitivity of
 Alpine fluvial environments in the Swiss Alps to climate forcing during the Late
 Holocene. Sediment Dynamics in Changing Environments, IAHS Publ. 325, 367374.
- Schulte, L., Veit, H., Burjachs, F., Julià, R., 2009a. Lütschine fan delta response to
 climate variability and land use in the Bernese Alps during the last 2400 years.
 Geomorphology, 108, 107-121.
- Schulte, L., Julià, R., Veit, H., Carvalho, F., 2009b. Do high-resolution fan delta records
 provide a useful tool for hazard assessment in mountain regions? International
 Journal of Climate Change Strategies and Management, 2, 197-210.
- Schulte, L., Peña, J.C., Carvalho, F., Schmidt, T., Julià, R., Llorca, J., Veit, H., 2015. A
 2600-year history of floods in the Bernese Alps, Switzerland: frequencies,
 mechanisms and climate forcing. Hydrology and Earth System Sciences 19,
 3047-3072.

- Schulte, L., Mudelsee, M., St George, S., Peña, J.C., 2017. Work Package WP2:
 Integrating and analyzing paleoflood data. In, PAGES Floods Working Group. For
 an improvement of our flood knowledge through paleodata. White paper of the
 PAGES Floods Working Group, Grenoble, 11-14 pp. <u>http://www.pages-</u>
 igbp.org/ini/wg/floods/intro
- Schulte, L., Wetter, O., Wilhelm, B., Peña, J.C., Amann, B., Wirth, S.B., Carvalho, F.,
 Gómez-Bolea, A. Integration of multi-archive datasets towards the development
 of a four-dimensional paleoflood model in alpine catchments. Global and
 Planetary Change [under review; this issue].
- Trouet, V., Esper, J., Graham, N.E., Baker, A., Scourse, J.D., Frank, D.C., 2009.
 Persistent Positive North Atlantic Oscillation Mode Dominated the Medieval
 Climate Anomaly. Science, 324, 78-80.
- 1035 UNISDR, 2015. Making Development Sustainable: The Future of Disaster Risk
 1036 Management. Global Assessment Report on Disaster Risk Reduction. Geneva,
 1037 Switzerland: United Nations Office for Disaster Risk Reduction (UNISDR),
 1038 314 pp.
- Usoskin, I.G., Hulot, G., Gallet, Y., Roth, R., Licht, A., Joos, F., Kovaltsov, G.A., Thébault,
 E., Khokhlov, A., 2014. Evidence for distinct modes of solar activity. Astronomy
 & Astrophysics, 562, L10. https://doi.org/10.1051/0004-6361/201423391
- Wetter, O., 2017. The potential of historical hydrology in Switzerland. Hydrology and
 Earth System Sciences 21(11), 5781-5803.
- Wetter, O., Pfister, C., Weingartner, R., Luterbacher, J., Reist, T., Trösch, J., 2011. The
 largest floods in the High Rhine basin since 1268 assessed from documentary
 and instrumental evidence. Hydrological Sciences Journal 56 (5), 733-758.
- Wilhelm, B., Arnaud, F., Sabatier, P., Crouzet, C., Brisset, E., Chaumillon, E., Disnar J.R., Guiter, F., Malet, E., Reyss, J.-L., Tachikawa, K., Bard, E., Delannoy, J.J.,
 2012. 1400 years of extreme precipitation patterns over the Mediterranean
 French Alps and possible forcing mechanisms. Quaternary Research 78(1), 1–
 12.
- Wilhelm B., Ballesteros Canovas J.A., Macdonald N., Toonen W., Baker V., Barriendos
 M., Benito G., Brauer A., Corella Aznar J.P., Denniston R., Glaser R., Ionita M.,
 Kahle M., Liu T., Luetscher M., Macklin M., Mudelsee M., Munoz S., Schulte L.,
 St George S., Stoffel M., Wetter O., 2019. Interpreting historical, botanical, and
 geological evidence to aid preparations for future floods. WIREs Water.
 2019;6:e1318.

- Wirth, S.B., Girardclos, S., Rellstab, C., Anselmetti, F.S., 2011. The sedimentary
 response to a pioneer geo-engineering project: Tracking the Kander River
 deviation in the sediments of Lake Thun (Switzerland). Sedimentology 58, 1737–
 1761.
- Wirth, S.B., Glur, L., Gilli, A., Anselmetti, F.S., 2013. Holocene flood frequency across
 the Central Alps solar forcing and evidence for variations in North Atlantic
 atmospheric circulation, Quaternary Science Reviews 80, 112-128.
- 1065 Wu, C.J., Krivova, N.A., Solanki, S.K., Usoskin, I.G., 2018. Solar total and spectral
 1066 irradiance reconstruction over the last 9000 years. Astronomy &
 1067 Astrophysics, 620, A120. <u>https://doi.org/10.1051/0004-6361/201832956</u>
- Yu, X., Wang, Y., Kang, Z., Yu, S. Synchronous droughts and floods in Southern Chinese
 Loess Plateau in phase with decadal solar activities [under review; this issue].
- Zaginaev, V., Petrakov, D., Erokhin, S., Meleshko, A., Stoffel, M., Ballesteros-Cánovas,
 J.A., 2019. Geomorphic control on regional glacier lake outburst flood and debris
 flow activity over northern Tien Shan. Global and Planetary Change 176 (2019)
 50–59 [this issue].