Carner's Poesia: aspects of the internal history of the text
Jaume Coll

The majority of Carner’s poems which were published in Poesia, had already appeared in print as the first fruits offered to the reader. This fact allows us to establish, in a great number of poems, at least three moments in their public trajectory: the press, first book, and main book.

The poem, as a dynamic product, and not as a static work completed in a first draft, was submitted to a series of revisions and re-elaborations which modified and perfected it. These moments of the text, which explain its evolution, also demonstrate the expressive progression of the poet in the mastery of his art, and show us, as if through a powerful microscope, the enormous imaginative, verbal and metrical skill of Carner. This creative skill enabled him to vary, at a very high level, the reading of the text at each new printing. Each one of these three concrete moments is the conclusion of one stage of the text and the starting point for the following one. This can be seen with any poem whatsoever: a poem was published in 1916; incorporated in a book (La inútil ofrena) in 1924, and finally included in the section OFRENA of Poesia, the volume printed in 1957.

(The variant readings of the successive revisions of the poem appear in italics, and the English version corresponds to the last version.)
Canta l'ocell en l'arbre que degota,
un poc de sol en el brançam rellú;
l'ànima meva s'ha perduda tota,
ni jo la tinc ni l'ha trobat ningú.

L'ànima meva s'ha perduda tota:
¿vindrà la nit en el silenci bru?
Dels tells florits deu caminar dessota
i va a l'atzar per si et trobé a tu.

Per conhortar mon dol, de tes parpelles
les gotes estrafan el plor seguit;
i diuen els ocells amb cantarelles:
—Millor que no et retorni l'esperit.
No li badís portell ni finestrelles
que ella no et sigui arran mateix del pit.

Canta l'ocell en l'arbre que degota,
Mon esperit, misèrcodi, s'acota;
i fuig de mi mentre no el veu ningú.

Canta l'ocell en l'arbre que degota.
¿On és mon esperit, las i dejà?
Dels tells florits deu caminar dessota
i va a l'atzar per si et trobare a tu.

Per conhortar mon dol, de tes parpelles
les gotes estrafan el plor marrit;
i diuen els ocells amb cantarelles:
—Millor que no et retorni l'esperit.
No li badís portell ni finestrelles
que l'amada no et sigui rau del pit.

Canta l'ocell en l'arbre que degota,
i cap missatge no em sabria dur;
a un llibre inútil el meu cap s'acota;
ni veig qui passa ni em veurà ningú.

Canta l'ocell en l'arbre que degota.
Se'n va el meu seny, esquerp a cadascú.
Dels tells florits deu caminar dessota,
sempre a l'atzar, per si et trobes a tu.

El sol es mostra un poc i ja se'n cansa.
Els degotalls d'aquest brançam florit
estrafan el teu plany i ma enyorança.
—Val més que em deixi en vaga l'esperit.
No cap esma del món, no cap frisança
que ella no em sigui arrepennyada al pit.

[variants mcsP]
6 seny: no es vol mostrar importú.
13 cap obert cancell, no
The bird is singing in the dripping tree, / knowing no message to bring me; / over a useless book my head is bent; / I neither see who passes, nor does anyone see me. // The bird is singing in the dripping tree. / My wisdom is going, elusive to everyone. / It must walk under the flowering linden trees, / always in case it should happen to find you. // The sun shows itself slightly and tires of it. / The drops from this flowering branch / imitate your crying and my longing. // —I'd better leave the mind to wander. / No feeling for the world, and no desire, / except for her to lean upon my breast.

Only in the last stage of the poem, as in the text of Poesia, is there anything more than what is essential: as can be seen by comparing the three versions, the variants of msPoesia (the typed manuscript which is the documentary evidence of the laborious preparation from the book of 1957) fix a moment for the creative process (also transmitted by Antologia amorosa) before the final revision by the poet. In Poesia we find printed the two splendid substitutions of vv. 6 and 13 (with the typically Carnerian «esma»), made on the first or second galley proofs, and in fact incorporated into the text after the copy of the section OFRENA was sent by the poet to the publishers (from where Manent took the text published in the Antologia, in 1955).

If we observe carefully the innovations which the italics make clear, we realize two fundamental things: first, that each new stage of the poem improves the previous one; and

---

1 In 1955, a collection of texts in verse and in prose on the subject of love appeared in Editorial Selecta (the same that was to publish Poesia), with the title Antologia amorosa (tria i pròleg de Marià Manent). The small volume contains 16 poems by Carner, all belonging to the section OFRENA, of which there was no evidence of printing (in fact, there was none until November of 1956). The compiler followed the text of the typed manuscript of the section which the poet had already sent to the publisher: «In reproducing the texts of Josep Carner», writes Manent in a note to the prologue, «I have taken into account the revision made recently by the poet». The text of the poems is, therefore, revised with regard to the first books, and in some cases, as with the poem we have read, does not have the exact reading printed in Poesia.
second, that the important qualitative improvement is made in the third. The two first stages are much closer to each other than is the second to the third (even though the second, apart from the title, innovates a fundamental aspect which the third will preserve: the introduction of an anaphoric verse). In the third stage, in the Poesia text, «les petites masegadures, les tares semisecretes» have disappeared (expressions used by the poet, in the prologue of La inútil ofrena, to indicate slight alterations made to the majority of the poems in the book of 1924), and there is a drastic revision. If we compare it with the first, we see that only the first and the seventh lines are retained in their entirety; the fourth and the eighth are restored; and the tercets where, furthermore, the rhyme is modified (-elles for -ansa) are altogether reconstructed.

Any revision always means an improvement in quality. Whether it consists of small or modest alterations, or forms part of a process of meticulous revision or a complete reconstruction and rewriting of the poem.

1. THE STAGES OF THE POEM
(FROM PREHISTORY TO HISTORY)

Of all this trajectory of the poem, we have, then, the essential: the text that appeared in the press, and the books. But there is nothing else which allows us to follow the changes to the text in more detail.

In the formulation of these three public stages, a few characteristics could be admitted (a restrictive one and a widening one): restrictive because many poems have only one stage, being published in a book; widening in the case of poems assembled in a second volume. The whole thing, then, depends on the possible publication of a poem before its inclusion in a book, and the contingency of its appearance in a second volume. Rarely is it possible to detect a genetic
variation which goes further than the second characteristic. We do not possess either first drafts, copies of the poems sent to the press, manuscript or typed manuscript copies which served as an antigraph for the composition of the printing of the text of the book, or copies (whether manuscript or typed manuscript) of any book prior to *Arbres*. It is only after this volume of 1953 that a series of typed manuscripts of each new book are preserved. However I have never seen a complete writer’s copy (or the antigraph) of these books.  

A wonderful example of the multiplicity of versions and the survival of the same framework is offered by a poem which appeared in *La Veu de Catalunya* on 28.VII.1914. Here is the text, just as it appeared in the paper:

A L’AMOR

Fes que la trobi amb les parpelles closes
com si s’hagués dormida frec a frec,
alça-hi, Amor, l’encanyïçat amb roses:
tot perquè jo no sigui temorenc.

TO LOVE

Make me find her with her eyelids closed / as if she had slept close by, / build here, Love, the rose trellis: / all so that I am not afraid.

---

2 The only exception known to me is *Sons de lira i flabiol*: the manuscript of the five unpublished poems which are part of it, the galley proofs which, returned to the publisher because of censorship (the one responsible for the sessions «Els poetes i els músics»), were revised and corrected by the poet, and in addition, the documents relating to the public act which was the origin of the small book of 1927. In very different circumstances there is the example of *La paraula en el vent*, property (but not in the possession) of Alberto Blecua. Revised by the poet, this formed part of the revisory process of *La inútil ofrena*, and is surely the copy which Carner used to revise the poems of *La paraula en el vent*, collected in the anthology of 1924. This is the conclusion, or so it seems, that can be reached from the observation of the only facsimile page published by José Manuel Blecua, «Sobre el rigor poético en España», 1969. The valuable copy is now part of the ones which disappeared.
The next day, there appeared in the paper the following note as a clarification:

Prego a algú, que em consta que serva els meus rims, que posi en el d’ahir, darrera la paraula «dormida», un punt i coma. Aleshores serà efectivament un rim (La Veu de Catalunya, 29.vii.1914).

I ask someone, who I am certain keeps my poems, to put in yesterday’s a semicolon after the word «dormida». Then it will really be a poem.

Four years later, in 1918, there appeared again in the press the same framework of the preceding verses, which had as a title the last word of the last verse of the short poem of 1914 which we have just read.

**EL TEMOREC**

O cor meu, que et daleixes i no goses tement que el cor amat sia rebec!

Sota d’un bell encanyissat de roses, si la trobes dormida, sense plec als llavis, la cintura sense noses, i si frisessin ses parpelles closes com dient: —Et desitjo frec a frec,— i, al volt, no em fessin el posat les coses d’un esguard tot irònic i tot sec, llavores jo no fóra temorec.

**THE FEARFUL ONE**

Oh my heart, which desires and does not dare, / fearing that the heart loved should not obey! // Under a beautiful rose trellis, / if you find her sleeping, with no crease / in her lips, nothing hindering her waist, / and if her closed eyelids flutter / as if they said: —I desire you close by,— / and if, around me, things didn’t give me / a glance that’s ironical and dry, / then I wouldn’t be afraid.
This new version of the poem is a richer and more complex amplification of the short first poem. The lover who demanded the complicity of Love (and of his beloved) in order to overcome his shyness, imagines again the same appropriate setting, and a more favourable attitude of the loved one. He also imagines the things around him looking on with an inoffensive air. All this is in order to combat his own desire, and also the fear of a negative response from his beloved; both expressed in the first two lines of the poem. The author gave the poem an explicit title, and a new construction, still based on the same rhymes (-ec -oses) of 1914, even retaining a part of the end of each of the four verses:

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{ses parpelles closes} & / \text{les parpelles closes} \\
\text{frec a frec} & / \text{frec a frec} \\
\text{encanyissat de roses} & / \text{l'encanyïcat amb roses} \\
\text{jo no fora temorec} & / \text{jo no sigui temorec}
\end{align*}
\]

Two years later, in 1920, there appeared (as announced in the footnote of Vell i Nou reproduced here) in LA FONT ESQUERPA, which is the second of the two sections of L'Oreig entre les canyes, the poem «Oració al maig». In it Carner takes up again the subject of the lover who wants to approach the loved one, but dare not; and the desire which needs to imagine a magical scheme in order to overcome this fear. The month of May can weave a spell which will give him the courage he lacks. That first invocation of Love in 1914 becomes a prayer to the month of May, in which the song of the birds at sunset, the roses, the fountain, and God might take away—if only in his imagination—the lover's shyness. The poem starts with
the same imperative we saw in the previous one. This imperative will disappear giving place to the ellipsis in Llunyania (1952). But we shall find in all the versions the rhymes -oses (lines 12-3) and -ec (now transformed into -enc) in lines 11 and 14. The poem finishes with the same last line of the 1914 one, and in fact the first poem contained in nuce everything.

The structure of the composition of 1920 is that of a sonnet (which means another amplification of the poem), and this structure will remain unaltered until the last stage.

The sonnet is presented here, showing line by line, the text of the five versions we know: L'oreig entre les canyes, La inútil ofrena, Llunyania, the typed msPoesia (which contains susbtitutive and alternative lessons) and Poesia in order to show better the progress in expression of the poem: OrC and InO (1920 and 1924) differ very little. Llu (1952) marks the beginning of the final stage of the text, from which the typed msP starts, which incorporates—as evidence of the corrective work of the poet—readings fixed in P, which in their turn, bring new variants which, in the last revision, remodel the poem.

The lines ___________ indicate a phonic and topographical coincidence with the previous version. Between brackets are the two fragments (in v. 4 and 5) of the typed msP which the poet substituted in the same manuscript page, for other fragments. The sign * typed msP indicates alternative variants of the copy, in the margin of the verse affected. Only the P version is given in the English translation.
**ORACIÓ AL MAIG**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OrC</th>
<th>InO</th>
<th>Llu</th>
<th>msP</th>
<th>P</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fes, Maig (que potser jo no gosaria</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Com que jo tanmateix</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d'anar-li en seguiment pel corriol),</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>de seguir-la si va ___ corriol,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>per ___ per vall i muntitjol,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>que per grat de l'atzar la trobi un dia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>oh maig! que per atzar</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>oh, maig,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>oh maig!</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tot arran de mon cor, que vol i dol;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>en un jardí, quan defalleix el sol;</td>
<td></td>
<td>[quan defalleix el] ben sola i jo [tot-sol] ben sol.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>que hi hagi molts d'ocells damunt la via</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>prop de ___ via,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Que ___ canti al [sol] roig ponent l'ocelleria,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
(tots cantadissos, amagats del sol)

merla, pinsà, cardina i verderol,

que ofeguin mon batec, i a ma agonia

ofegant bé em plauria

ofegant-me el

mos batecs ofegant,

(mos batecs ofegant)

ofreni un glop de pau el fontinyol;

de trobar, per més fressa, un

que també hi fressegés el

que hi sigui a dur-hi fressa el

que, sense veure'm ella ni escapar-se,

i que ella, amb cor distret, gens fugisera,

ella

jo em trobi als dits sa cabellera esparsa,

em deixés caure als dits la cabellera,

deixi caure als meus
Because I would not dare to follow her / through valleys and through hills. Oh month of May, / see that I meet her by chance one day, / in a garden, both she and I alone. // And that the birds sing under a red sky, / the blackbird, the chaffinch, the goldfinch and greenfinch / muffling my heartbeats. I would be pleased / if there was a fountain to make a sound. // See that, with a distracted heart, / she lets her hair fall through my fingers, / and near my mouth her rosy lips, // and that we walk with our eyelids closed / and still towards a rose trellis / (all so that I fear no more).
The comparison of the six versions of the text (and the two poems sent to the press) makes us realize not only the improvement of the text at each rewriting, but also a fact which is intrinsic to Carner’s poetry: «l’assaig de néixer» of the poem, that is the «virtut» of the «mot inicial» or the line «donat pels déus» which, generally is invariable, and transcends all the stages of the text. In this poem, they are found at the very end of the sonnet (v.14):

\[ \text{tot perquè jo no sigui temorenc} \]

the word and line we have already found, also in the final position, of the two first versions:

\[ \text{tot perquè jo no sigui temorec} \]

\[ llavores jo no fora temorec \]

In the poem we have read in the previous section («Plou una mica i l’amada és lluny»), the line «cantat pels déus» was the first, also unchanged, as we have seen, in all three stages:

\[ \text{Canta l’ocell en l’arbre que degota} \]

Carner formulated his hypothesis of the «ratlla mervellosa» in «Teoria de l’ham poètic» (and, in the even more restrictive provision of the word «inicial», which generates the line in «Virtut d’una paraula»).  

Footnote:

3 «Teoria de l’ham poètic» begins by saying: «My first formulation of a definite hypothesis suited a ... northern city with the darkening dampness of the constant rain more than the brightness of light. In front of the balcony of my hotel room nothing could be seen except a uniform greyness, as if embedded, without any foreseeable lessening or weakening». The exordium does not form part only of the fiction imagined by the poet in the text, but rather it responds to a definite «formulation», as we shall see.

«Virtut d’una paraula» («The inspiration is not, then, but the verse which
More than thirty years earlier, however, in 1927, when the poet was acting as consul in the «ciutat septentrional» (Le Havre i.III.1927 — I.VIII.1932), he made his first formulation (see note 3), which was published in the magazine Ciutat of Manresa. Owing to the great interest of the document, it is presented here in its entirety:

SUGGESTIONS ENTORN D’UN POEMA

En el darrer llibre de poemes de J. M. López-Picó, al capdavall hi ha una cançó, dedicada a Clementina Arderiu, que és la que dóna nom al llibre. Ben encertada en l’endreça, i en el caràcter de protagonista. Guerau de Liost, que farà bellament, qualsevol istiu, sub termina [error del caixista per tegmine] jagis la seva suggerida tria dels més bells poemes de López-Picó, em penso que no bandearà pas aquelles esparces.

Jo, altrament, les trobo ben representatives de la fins qualitat lírica assolida per la sensibilitat catalana, a través d’una jove i escaient estilització del verb. En el llibre on es troba, hom podria multiplicar exemples d’eficiència, però potser en cap més poema del recull no s’hi ultrapassa aquell emprament de la virtuositat trobadoresca per a la fluida expressió d’una melangiota tota moderna, que hauria plagut hom s’imagina a Keats o a Verlaine. És lleu i no és frívola; és concirosa i els seus pensaments es refracten gentilment en la música. (En la poesia francesa, massa sovint, el pensament no hi apareix sinó brunyit per la retòrica, no pas, pròpiament, refractant-se en el medi comparativament inestable i sobretot suggerent; ni aqueixa error és evitable per agençaments de refinada elegància, per llur natura exterior.)

Paul Valéry escriu en son assaig Au sujet d’Adonis (que, si no ha estat traduït al català, convé que ens doni la Revista de Poesia): «El

a word ...as if by the art of enchantment») appeared in French in Revue de Métaphysique et de Moral, no 4, pp.473-476. Paris, 1961. The Catalan text was published in Teoria de l’ham poètic. (ed. A. Manent), Barcelona, Edicions 62, 1970, where there was also published the text which gave the volume its name and which had already appeared in the miscellaneous Studi in onore di Vittorio Lugli e Diego Valeri, pp.191-193. Venice, Neri Pozza Editori [not dated by Manent, nor by N. Nardi and I. Pelegrí (ed.) which they reproduced in Josep Carner, El reialme de la poesia; not dated certainly because Manent used the undated separata from the publication], 1961.
déus, graciosament, ens donen per no res tal primer vers; però ens pertoca a nosaltres de faisonar el segon que té de consonar amb l’altre, i no ésser indigne del seu sobrenatural germà gran. No basta pas amb tots els recursos de l’experiència i de l’esperit per a fer-lo comparable al vers que fou un do». De molt de temps abans que aquell assaig fos escrit (porta la data del 1920), em recordo d’haver-me entretingut, amb algun fraternal confrare, a recercar, com a punt inicial d’una valoració, el vers essencial, que pot ésser un ver començament:

Mon cor estima un arbre!

O bé, com no freqüentment esdevé en els sonets, el desenllaç o àdhuc esdevenir el cor del poema, com a «La vaca cega»;

orfe de llum sota d’un sol que crema.

En el poema de López-Picó tot sembla indicar que el vers diví és abril coronat de rosada.

La rosada és exquisida i fugissera; tantost lluent, tantost fosa, tantost irreparable. Il·lusió d’amor, evanescència del goig, recançà de l’adolescència enmig d’aquella que l’any es refà. Cap emoció no supera en capacitats poètiques la que hom podria anomenar l’esperança de l’adult vora el corrent fressós de totes les coses nades. Escriu López-Picó, col·laborant amb els déus:

Abril coronat de rosada
amb roses al braç
i un xic d’enyorança oblidada,
ginesta i lilàs.

Hom pot sobretot qualificar-lo pel vers tercer, tan concordant, tan obligat (no sabríeu imaginar, no podríeu reinventar d’altra manera les coses perfectes), tan nostra, amb aquell diminutiu del concepte que s’avé extraordinàriament al geni de la llengua, amb aquell punt de mesura humana: «enyorança oblidada». Harmonitzar delicadament un vers d’epigrama amb un d’elegíac, entre un poc de decoració botticelliana,
i fer-ho d'esma, amb els ulls mig clucs: noble compliment d'un poeta.

He vingut a dir que aquest poema és expressiu d'una aptesa general de la nostra llengua i del nostre lirisme. Pot constituir, en efecte, una mena de rallying point de vocacions diverses de la nostra poesia. Això no vol dir que hi manqui el peculiar encuny de l'il·lustre poeta. El vers «de l'ombra que el goig deixa nua», equival a una signatura. Però la cançó, tanmateix, té d'ésser representativa, i ha de fer dringar, en una recançà d'adolescència, tota la divina adolescència de l'expressió altament recobrada (Ciutat. Manresa, x-xii.1927).

SUGGESTIONS FOR A POEM

In the last book of poems by J.M. López-Picó, at the end there is a song, dedicated to Clementina Arderiu, which gives the book its title. It is exactly right for the arrangement and the character of the heroine. I think that Guerau de Liost, who any summer will make, sub termina [typesetter's error for tegmine] fagis his choice of the most beautiful of López-Picó's poems, will not leave out that song.

I, on the other hand, find them well representative of the fine lyric quality achieved by the Catalan sensitivity, by means of a youthful and appropriate stylization of the word. In the book where this is found, there are many examples of efficiency, but perhaps no other poem of the collection exceeds that use of virtuosity typical of the troubadours to achieve the fluid expression of a modern mixture, which one imagines would have pleased Keats or Verlaine. It is light, but not frivolous; it is pensive, and its thoughts are reflected gracefully in the music. (Too often in French poetry, the thought is polished by rhetoric, and is not really reflected in the comparatively unstable and suggestive medium; nor is that mistake avoided by arrangements of refined elegance in their exterior nature.)

Paul Valéry wrote in his essay Au sujet d'Adonis (which, if it has not been translated into Catalan, should be done by the Revista de Poesia): «The gods graciously give us a first verse for nothing; but it is up to us to fashion the second which must harmonize with the other, and not be unworthy of its supernatural older brother. The resources of experience and the spirit are not enough to make it comparable to the verse which was a gift». Well before this essay was written (it bears the date 1920), I remember amusing myself, with a friend and colleague, by trying to find, as the initial point of an evaluation, the essential line, which can be an initial line:

My heart loves a tree!
Or, as not frequently happens in sonnets, the essential line can be at the end, or even in the middle of the poem, such as in «La vaca cega» (The blind cow);

orphan of light under a burning sun.

In the poem by López-Picó, everything seems to indicate that the divine verse is:

April crowned with dew.

The dew is delightful and fleeting; sometimes it glimmers, sometimes it vanishes, sometimes it is irrecoverable. The illusion of love, the evanescence of delight, the regret of the adolescent [... ] There is no emotion that can surpass, in its poetic capacities, what can be called the hope of the adult around the noisy current of all living things. In collaboration with the gods, López-Picó writes:

April crowned with dew
with roses on her arm
and a little forgotten longing,
broom and lilac.

It can be evaluated especially by its third line, so in keeping, so necessary (he could not imagine, could not re-invent perfect things any other way), so much ours, with that diminutive of the concept that goes extraordinarily well with the genius of the language, with that point of human measure: «forgotten longing». To be able to delicately harmonize a verse of an epigram with an elegiac verse, with a little Botticellian decoration, and do it instinctively, with one’s eyes half closed, is a noble accomplishment for a poet.

I have just said that this poem is expressive of a general aptitude for our language and our lyricism. In fact, it constitutes a kind of rallying point for the various vocations of our poetry. This does not mean that our illustrious poet is lacking his own particular stamp. The line «de l’ombra que el goig deixa nua» (from the shade that delight leaves bare), is equal to a signature. But the song, however, must be representative, and must make sound—in a longing of adolescence—all the divine adolescence of the expression highly recaptured.4

4 The poem by López-Picó (not always a good servant of the gods) is «L’oci de la paraula», the last one in opus xx, a collection with the title of the poem, L’oci de la paraula (1927). The transcription here is from: Josep M. López-Picó, Obres Completes. Barcelona, Editorial Selecta, 1948:
This was certainly not the first time Carner had concerned himself with the «given verse». In a «soliloqui» of 1905, the poet declared that from time to time «inspiration puts before dreaming eyes the strange splendour of an isolated verse». The article entitled «De re poetica» was written as a result of the homage the universal press had rendered to «Joseph María de Heredia». The homages to the «great Parnassian» made the author think «of the volume which gives Catalan literature, richness, elegance and authority», a work published on 14.X.1905, in the section «Soliloquis d’un bonhome», under

the pseudonym of Oleguer Recó. Here is the fragment which interests us:

Lenta y difícil es la tasca poetica. La orfebrería es exigent. De tart en tart la inspiració posa devant dels ulls somiadors la extranya resplandor d’un vers isolat. Aqueix dó misteriós de l’amethysta, la esmeragda, o el beryl, ens obliga a cisellar ab amor y paciencia un preuat cercle d’or, pera que la pedra preciosa, —la retenció de la qual fora egoisme iluminista,— vagi a enaltir divinament els bells dits blancs de las mans selectas (La Veu de Catalunya, 14.x.1905).

The poetic task is slow and difficult. The goldsmith work is demanding. Now and again inspiration puts before dreaming eyes the strange splendour of the isolated verse. This mysterious gift of amethyst, emerald or beryl obliges us to chip away with love and patience at a priceless circle of gold, so that the precious stone—the retention of which would be illuministic selfishness—goes on to embellish the beautiful white fingers of select hands.

This fragment reminds us strongly of «Sonets», which closes the Segon llibre de sonets (1907), and also the two rhetorical exercises. Carner puts into verse what this piece of prose expresses. The sonnet is dedicated to Guillem-August Tell, whom the speaker of the poem addresses in the first quatrains («Poet, how the fugitive grace escapes you!»). The two quatrains are quoted here so that they can be compared with the prose:

Poeta, com s’allunya la gracia fugitiva!
Ja l’ànima vetusta s’inclina ab pesantó.
Mes tu sonetisares al pas d’aquella esquiva
y de l’esgarrifança n’has tret la Perfecció.

Del bell instant efímer en tinch la gracia viva
lligada per un cercle de freda ostentació;
aixís dintre la baga d’or pur qui la captiva
sembla que hi mou la pedra sa fulgida clarô!
Com una cortesana, qui vella y dolorida
els dits qui s'estenúen amaga avergonyida
ab els anells preciosos de sos amors llunyans,

oculto així ab vosaltres l'eterna decadencia,
oblitto així la [llarga] tristor de l'existencia,
oh gotes de rosada qui us heu tornat diamants!

Poet, how the fugitive grace escapes you! / The old soul is bending under its weight. / But you wrote sonnets when she passed evasively / and from the shivering achieved Perfection. // Of the beautiful, ephemeral instant, I have kept the lively grace, / tied up by a circle of cold ostentation; / thus inside the pure gold ring which holds it captive, / the stone seems to move its dazzling light! / Like a courtesan, who, old and aching, / hides with shame her swollen fingers / with their precious rings from her old lovers, // so I hide from you the eternal decadence, / so I forget the [long?] sadness of existence, / oh drops of dew which are now diamonds!

The line appeared in print «oblito així la tristor de l'existencia», and there is no other evidence (manuscript, in the press, or in a book) which could amend the error, that could be the fault of the author, or of the typesetter which escaped the correction (by the same author), surely because, in spite of being hypometrical, the text makes sense. This is also the reason why it is so difficult to correct by conjecture. First of all, it is necessary to respect the resyllabification (by a synalepha or an elision) on the third syllable of the line, «oblito-així» (following the example of the first hemistich of the previous line «oculto-així-ab vosaltres»):

oblito-així la .... / tristor de l'existencia,

The adjective which must give the missing syllable to the line has to have two syllables, and the stress must fall on the first if it starts with a consonant; otherwise, it must have three syllables if it starts with a vowel; or it can even have four syllables if the second and third syllable form a synaeresis. The last two possibilities are the most improbable because of the form of the article «la», which we must believe is the form which appeared in the manuscript. The most probable then, is that the omission was an adjective such as vasta, fonda, rather than one like amarga, or immensa (because in the case of immensa, it would have been l'immensa). All of these are found in the book, and are capable of giving the meaning the line lacks. Perhaps the most suitable is an adjective which combined meaning and cause of error: as for instance l'ànguida (but being proparoxitonic, it would be the only one at the end of the first hemistich); or llarga, or laca, also used in the book with this spelling («lacies»). All of these seem acceptable possibilities because they allow us to explain the probable causes of error: maximum brevity and initial spelling common with the article.
Thus we are led towards another type of «suggestion»: the one used in his prose writings. His prose contains the germ of the poem. This is a previously unexplored aspect of Carner’s poetry, of which we have here is a curious example, very different from the previous one.

In the first paragraph of an article also published in *La Veu de Catalunya* (31. III.1923), and not included in *Les bonhomies*, or any other book of prose, entitled «Malhumors de la primavera», the poet describes the strange way in which the horse-chestnut trees come into leaf:

A cada punta de branquilló dels castanyers d’Índies hi ha sospesos dos o tres accents circumflexos, d’un verd profund: és una pedantesca manera de fullar.

At each point of the twig of the horse-chestnut trees, are suspended two or three circumflex accents, of a dark green: it is a pedantic way of coming into leaf.

A poem published four years later was to take up this subject once again. The poem is written with a verse model that is absolutely unique in all his poetry, and which might also be difficult to find in the work of any other poet. It consists of a decasyllabic verse with a caesura at the sixth syllable, according to the pattern \[6 (1)/(2) + 4\]. That is, a hexasyllable with a feminine ending (which in five cases appears with a stress on the antepenultimate syllable) + a tetrasyllable with a masculine ending, all of which are arranged in tercets of only one rhyme. Here are reproduced only the first stanzas of the three versions known to me: 1927 (*La Veu de Catalunya*, 14.v); 1933 (*El veire encantat*); and 1933 and 1957 (*Arbres* and *Poesia*) respectively, which have the same reading. It is an example of extraordinary adaptation between that «pedantesca manera de fullar» and this *pedantesca manera de versificar* (and in which the gift of the gods falls in the second verse):
La Veu, 14.V.1927: A UN CASTANYER D'ÍNDIES

Salut, oh el més magnífic de la ciutat,
salut, castanyer d'Índies emplomallat,
tendal de primavera blanc o rosat!

VeE: A UN CASTANYER D'ÍNDIA

Salut, oh primavera tot d'un plegat,
salut, castanyer d'Índies emplomallat
tendal de primavera blanc o rosat!

Arb P: A UN CASTANYER D'ÍNDIA QUE FLOREJAVA

Salut, oh primavera tot d'un plegat,
salut, castanyer d'Índia, l'emplomallat,
pel goig de les aurores aviciat!

TO A HORSE-CHESTNUT TREE IN FLOWER

Hail, oh spring that has come all at once, / hail, horse-chestnut tree, with plumes, / spoiled by the delight of the dawns! Arb P

2. THE CYCLES OF POEMS

The first stage of the textual transmission of Carner's poetry always projects some light on the text published in a book, and is the indispensable foundation for all its transformations. The form of the poem when published in the press, may have been changed when it became part of a book. Here is an example of this: on 2.IX.1913 there appeared in La Veu de Catalunya a «rim» entitled «De l'adveniment d'una certa canetenca», towards the end of which we read these verses:
If tomorrow I had time /—which I think I shall have—/ I would talk to you about the christening / as I have done of the birth.

And, sure enough, the next day there appeared «Del bateig de la dita canetenca», which began with these lines:

Amb allò que ahir quedàrem
altra volta comencem
que són moltes les persones
que no ho troben malament:

On what we agreed yesterday / we begin again, / for there are many people / who don’t find it wrong:

When the poem was incorporated into the book (in Auques i ventalls and in the homonymous section of Poesia), Carner accepted both passages. The two «rims» of 1913 took the form of songs under a new title, which is what, perhaps, gives them their full meaning «Romanç de l’aparició i bateig d’una canetenca» (Ballad of the apparition and christening of a girl from Canet).

To publish a poem in the press is, on the other hand, a way of giving it life (and a way for the poet to earn his living), and of detaching oneself from it for a time before considering its incorporation (thoroughly revised or only slightly polished) in the more defined structure of a book. The poem does not always appear isolated in it, but often forms part of a reduced group, or even of cycles with a greater number of poems.

An example of this is the journey Carner made to England in the summer of 1913. It brought about the writing of a cycle
of twenty poems (twenty «Rims de l'hora», his usual column in the paper, signed with his usual pseudonym of the «rims» Two) in La Veu during a whole month from the 23.VII until the 23.VIII.1913. The majority of these are dated by the poet (in London, Edinburgh, Brussels, Anvers and Boulogne). The first, in «London, 20 of July». The titles of the twenty poems are the following (those marked with an asterisk have not appeared in a book, the initials of the first volume which incorporated the others are given—Auques i ventalls; La paraula en el vent; Bella terra bella gent; El cor quiet—and those with no separate title are underlined):

* Hi há unes esglesies com uns panteons
PaV Infidelitat
* —¿Sents la paraula nova? Trepida, oh Albió!
PaV ¿Qui és mai voltat de rara gent novella
* Aquesta lleu «dactilo» d’aquarel·la
AuV Ja la nocturna gloria ciutadana
* Paisatge escocès
* Nit, sobre l Tàmesi
PaV Un dia més
* En el museu de Brusel·les
* Posta plujosa
* Quan mor el sol en els jardins de França
* Un exèrcit desfet que en la pluja rellisca
BTBG Pluja d’istiu
* De l’Anglaterra
* El diumenge al camp
PaV Fidelitat
* El bon Jesús del Beguinatge de Malines
CoQ Els pollancs de França
BTBG Retorn

They form an authentic cycle of poems. Of the twenty, only eight have been included, revised, in a later book. Leaving aside their essential contribution, that of forming the first stage of a text, they provide some relevant information, facts
that the poems could not give if they were outside the context of the cycle, such as that the «ópera» of «L’anunci Iluminós» from AuV (Ja la nocturna gloria ciutadana, London, 29 July) is that of Covent Garden, and not the Liceu. As far as their essential contribution is concerned, there are poems which are the germ of those which appear in a book. A good example is this short poem which closes the cycle:

RETURN

Ja veig damunt la coma de foc el nostre pi.—
Un sò vivent allunya d’avora mon camí
aquella estran[y]a goja que’l somni dolç comana.—
Es fort com la ginesta i com el blau marí
el teu escarafall, oh noia catalana.

(La Veu de Catalunya, 23.VIII.1913)

RETURN

I see above the fiery mountain our pine.— / A lively sound puts out of my way / that strange fairy who brings sweet dreams.— / The expression of your feelings, oh Catalan girl, / is as strong as broom, and the deep blue.

This poem is the first stanza of «Retorn a Catalunya», published (in successive revisions) in the two editions of Bella terra bella gent and Poesia, where it is transcribed:

Ja veig damunt la serra de foc el nostre pi.
Oh gent que per les feixes daurades feu camí!
Em sobta com un vi
la força tota vella i humil que ens agermana.
(És viu com la ginesta i com el blau marí
el teu escarafall, oh noia catalana.)

(vv.1-6)

I see above the fiery mountain range our pine. / Oh those who walk through golden terraces! / The old and humble force which makes us brothers / surprises
me like a wine. / (The expression of your feelings, oh Catalan girl, / is as bright as broom and the deep blue).

The same day this last poem of his journey appeared in the paper, Carner gave to the magazine *Catalunya* (23.VIII. 1913) a set of five sonnets (dedicated to Miquel Costa i Llobera) under the general title «La paraula vers Déu»:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Divendres Sant</th>
<th>PaV</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>L’Ars</td>
<td>PaV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suavitat d’olor</td>
<td>PaV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>El viatge</td>
<td>PaV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senyor, quan jo pecava...</td>
<td>OrC</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The collection is of great importance, not only because the title insinuates that of the next book, but also because the first four poems are the *paraula vers Déu* of the *paraula en el vent* (of the «història planyívola d’amor» made into a novel, as the poet says in the prologue, which is *La paraula en el vent*). In it the speaker of one of the poems («Divendres Sant») asks «perdó d’haver sentit avui el desconsol / d’un poc d’amor humà, Senyor, que’s torna cendres».

The short collection of poems has still another surprise in store. The last poem («Senyor, quan jo pecava...»), incorporated first in *L’oreig entre les canyes*, afterwards was to be the central poem of the section VERB (see in this volume: Richard Schreiber, «VERB: anàlisi i intent d’interpretació»).

In another collection of possibilities offered by the publication in the press there are two moving letters, which appeared that same summer of 1913, also belonging to the «Rim de l’hora», and also signed by *Two* (*La Veu de...

---

6 Only one of these four poems of the collection of *Catalunya* incorporated in the next book went into *Poesia* («L’arc» PaV). Probably it was because of biographical reasons which could also have caused the non-inclusion of other poems coming from other volumes, for example, from *Segon libre de sonets*, from *Verger de les galanies* and from *L’oreig entre les canyes*.
Ja no’t veuré aquest any, oh casa bruna del vell Montseny, plena de gracies: no arribaré de sobte al clar de lluna entre’l camí de les acacies.

Rés den Tristany, que’l món acovardia, don Joaquim podrà contar-me; ni perquè a vila no l’escometia es picarà la tía Carme.

No veuré pas el masovè immutable, i de sa pipa la foguera: no’m bordaran els cans vora l’estable encara ronces de la caceria.

Ni l’endemà retornaré de missa per un tirany que m’acontenta on hi ha un safareig que s’esclariça i abelles d’or entre la menta.

No us trobaré resant com cada dia el Sant Rosari al vol de taula, ni acabarem junt la lleternia abans de dir-nos cap paraula.

Ni en la famosa galeria, vora tenint les copes d’aigua fresca, oh amic, de rimes parlarem un'hora; ni'ns menjarem com una bresca el moscatell d’una rossió infinita veient davant, entre la pau serena, del gloriós Sant Segímen l’hermita que fa l’ullet darrera la carena.

Ni Marguerida, que és imperativa, de mes amors farà riota; ni jo veuré de la tenebra esquiva, rosa de neu, eixir Carlota.

Ni l’endemà retornaré de missa, que'l món acovardia, don Joaquim podrà contar-me; ni perquè a vila no l’escometia és picarà la tia Carme.

Ja no’t veuré aquest any, oh casa bruna del vell Montseny, plena de gracies: no arribaré de sobte al clar de lluna entre’l camí de les acacies.

No veuré pas el masovè immutable, i de sa pipa la foguera: no’m bordaran els cans vora l’estable encara ronces de la caceria.

Rés den Tristany, que’l món acovardia, don Joaquim podrà contar-me; ni perquè a vila no l’escometia és picarà la tia Carme.

No us trobaré resant com cada dia el Sant Rosari al vol de taula, ni acabarem junt la lleternia abans de dir-nos cap paraula.

Ni Marguerida, que és imperativa, de mes amors farà riota; ni jo veuré de la tenebra esquiva, rosa de neu, eixir Carlota.

Four days later (13.IX.1913), in the same column, his friend Jaume Bofill (One) published the «Resposta a Two»

(En secret): ¡la blanca causa del refus
es una galvana que no't deixa pus;
Aquesta es la rosa
mentres una esposa
no desligui el nús.

¡Amic: sigues dòcil
car jo no't vull mal
¡Vols romandre fòssil
ciutadà estival
i de Barcelona
raure en la pregona
fogor que no’t cal?

Deixa les follies
i escolta el meu reny,
s’escurisen els dies...
Arbora el teu seny
i branda'l com falla
en plena batalla
i vina al Montseny.
All these examples, chosen exclusively from the year that saw the configuration of the first two important books by Carner (the second of which is the true spartiacque of his previous poetry and of contemporary Catalan poetry), are sufficient to emphasize the fact that these first nuclei are not going to be found in a book. The second stage undoes these cycles and inserts the poems in a new order. The third fixes them again in an order which represents the last wish of the poet, as far as the words of the poems are concerned.

In a way, the set of synchronies of the first stage is the more complete one. The other two, on the other hand, are restrictive because of his growing exigency.

Once we have realized all this, it is not be difficult to see the usefulness of a critical edition not only of all Carner’s books of poetry, but also a separate critical edition of the poems in the stage previous to their appearance in a book. In this way the constellation of the text in its respective synchronic sets is completed in its public appearance: the continuum of published stages.

3. «UN FULL DE PAPER MALCONTENT»
(THE DRASTIC REVISION)

I em criden el llum a la taula
i algun voleiant pensament,
la vella cadira malmesa
i un full de paper malcontent.
«A hora foscant» (vv 13-16)

I am called to the work table / by the light, by some fleeting thought, / by the worn old chair / and a sheet of discontented paper.

Any poem with instaurative or destitutive variants is a new poem which has in the first an antecedent, sometimes a remote
one. Substitutive variants are the authentic ones, as it is said
in the essay which constitutes the foundation document of

The simultaneous analysis of the synchronic aspects of the
last stage of the text with the internal diachrony (its successive
synchronies) has become strong practice in textual criti-
cism.

Carner's poetry is an inexhaustible source for the study
of variants. This study has to deal with two different periods.
The first is concerned with the changes between the first
appearance of the poem and its publication in a book (and
also between its publication in a book and in an anthology,
La inútil ofrena, or homonyms, Auques i ventalls, Bella terra
bella gent'). It goes from 1904 (Llibre dels poetas) to 1936
(Bella terra bella gent'). The second, which shows drastic
revisions, can be found in Poesia (and in the three previous
books, Paliers, 1950, Llunyania, 1952, Arbres, 1953, and, after

In this second period, the variants are usually substantial,
and sometimes transform the whole structure of the poem to
create a new structural order.

Destitutive variants: there are a large number of poems
with lines, stanzas, and cantos which are eliminated in the
new version. Here are some examples: the most dramatic case
is «Fi» (Poesia), which consists of eight lines compared to its
seventy-six original lines. The previous title was «Romanç de
la lluna clara» in La paraula en el vent. Another example is
«La més perfecta» (Poesia), which has forty-eight lines,
compared to the one hundred and forty-eight its previous
version had in Les monjoies. «Somni» (Poesia) is a sonnet
made out of three previous ones in La paraula en el vent,
etc.

Substitutive variants: these affect practically all the poems
that have a previous version. They are not always substitutives
in the sense Contini gives to this concept. Very often the text
of 1956 is the rewriting of a poem which respects the same number of lines as the previous one (sonnets, for instance); but «Un clavell», or «Al fons d’un corriol» are sonnets in the previous versions, but the first becomes a poem of four lines, and the second, one of eight. In Poesia, there are only thirty poems out of the seven hundred and ninety-three (without counting those unpublished) which are exactly the same as the previous versions. All of these thirty are very brief: the longest one has twelve lines; eighteen of them are couplets, and the remaining four are quatrains.

*Instaurative variants* are not as numerous. Some of them present a final conclusion which gives the poem a new dimension: «Cançó del goig perdut» (vv. 19-24); «Fi de setembre» (vv. 13-16); «Vencedor de la mort» (vv. 5-6):

Oh Mort, ¿qué hi fa si gradual ocultes
goig, esperança, ardir?
Mon cor és un jardí
i les ombres hi canten, insepultes.

5 (Altrament, feina incerta la que fas.
6 Tu que ens destries, ens ajuntarás.)

Oh Death, what do I care if you gradually hide / pleasure, hope, daring? / My heart is a garden / and the shadows, unburied, sing in it. // (On the other hand, your task is uncertain. / You that separate us will reunite us.)

The text of *La inútil ofrena* (although the poem comes from *Verger de les galanies*) is as follows:

Oh Mort, ¿qué hi fa si en el teu vas ocultes
la clara dona que tot temps amí?
Mon cor no és cementiri, és un jardí
i les ombres hi canten, insepultes.

The last two verses of «Retorn d’un vell» (vv. 8-9) also
form a couplet which does not appear in the lesson of *El veire encantat*:

Tornant amb l’esperança
banderejant al cim, la nau avança:
el delit, en la proa és un instint.
I tanmateix a popa fa un vell emmantellant-se,
contra qui sap quina futura esgarrifança:
—Hom troba tot sovint
els cors banyats d’absència i les ciutats dormint;
8 fins en aquell indret que vostre fou,
9 passeu i ja no us veuen, mireu i ja no hi sou.

Coming back with hope / like a flag on the top, the boat advances: / pleasure at the bow is an instinct. / But at the stern, an old man covers himself / against who knows what future shudder: / —One often finds / hearts bathed with absence and cities asleep; / even in that place that was yours, / you pass and are not seen, you look and you are gone.

4. VARIATIONS ON AN IDEA

The typed msP contains a small provisional list of poems from the section OFRENA. Beside fifteen of these titles there appears the number «2». This must indicate the existence of two different versions of the poem, one of which had to be chosen for its inclusion in *Poesia.*

In the papers relating to *Poesia*, there are only two remaining versions with a complete text of this important revision which Carner called a «terrible lesson of modesty». These poems do not contain substitutions, but maintain their structure. Neither are they poems modified to the point that

---

7 The existence of a multiplicity of titles for one poem is useful for confirming the constant variations on the preparatory versions of *Poesia*: one of the titles that figure in the brief typed list, entitled «Passada» (but in OFRENA «Mor una rosa»), and in *La inútil ofrena* and *L'oreig entre les canyes «Elegia», and previously in the press without a title) has the following note: (See *Complanta*: it is the good [version]).
one cannot recognize the previous version, except as a remote antecedent. In fact two poems originate from a single poem. This is «Amor nat en aquesta primavera», which appeared first in Verger de les galanies and La inútil ofrena. Carner revised it before incorporating it in the new book. However from the drastic process of revision, two variations on a single theme appeared. Some lines disappeared in the text finally published in Poesia, and only four of those that were already in the versions of Verger de les galanies and La inútil ofrena, remained. The reading is, however, the same as that of the first book. The second poem is entitled «Epitafi» and has the same poetical idea as the first one. The title word, that appears in a substituted line of the text from Verger de les galanies and La inútil ofrena, was the starting point of the double version: «...vull posar-te un epitafi».

Here are both poems. The lines at the same level show similar readings, and the blank spaces show different ones. Under the poem incorporated into Poesia, there are the variants corresponding to the typed msP.

P: AMOR, NAT EN AQUESTA PRIMAVERA

Amor—nat en aquesta primavera,
amor finat entre un revolt de fulles
de la tardor, pels davallants de l'ombra—,
vas néixer del caient d'unes pestanyes,
d'un mot suau o d'un tremor de seda.
Tan a pletes, tan cautament venies,
que tot just t'endevino quan t'allunyes,
incapaç de retret com d'esperança,
inaudible sospir i trànsit d'ombra.
Tu fores com el vers que flota lliure
sens caure al filat de les esparses,
ara que ets mort, inútilment t'enyoro:
vana em fas judicar ma poesia.

msP: EPITAFI

Amor, nat en aquesta primavera,
presso en la tardor, d'aquesta vida:
vas néixer del caient d'unes pestanyes
d'una sola paraula i un silenci.
Lleugerament dis el meu cor venies
per a només al comiat nuar-lo.

Incert, vas ésser com un vers que flota
sense caure al filat de les esparses.

Poc t'hauria creudd de ta natura,
veient-te anar, com una flor ventissa,
de l'insabat a l'irrecuperable;
però sé prou que en retornar a les esmes
de cada dia, les parets, el llibre,
la tasca i el camí, tot va mirar-me
com sense cap avés de ma presència:
The poet, then, «chose» one of the two poems to be included in *Poesia*.

And to conclude this sample of aspects of the internal history of the text of *Poesia*, here is a poem from his main book which we shall find rewritten in a later one. Near the end of *COR QUIET* there is a *recent* poem, given as «previously unpublished,» entitled «Vall suïssa»:

Every hill rises sharply: / there are windows in three houses, shining in waiting; / Fir trees in procession tower above the cliff, / the lake sees and copies—the road goes away.

The 1957 text represents the first public appearance of the poem which *reappears* with the same title («Vall suïssa») in the autumn section of the 1966 book (*El tomb de l’any*). In this reappearance (a new *variation* of the same theme) each verse becomes two. The decasyllable and the three alexandrines of the *Poesia* poem become heptasyllables. Here is the last version:
Hom veu penyals que s’estiren
amb arrogància dels cims;
els vidres de cada casa
s’encomanen de cel gris;
els avets, escalonant-se,
protegeixen dels abims;
el llac retrata qui el mira,
sins que s’escampa la nit.

One can see cliffs rising / with the arrogance of the heights; / the windows of
each house / take on the colour of a grey sky; / the fir trees, climbing upwards,
/ protect from the abyss; / the lake reflects who looks in it, / until night spreads.

JAUME COLL
Universitat de Barcelona

(Translated by Marguerite Hartland)