

15	Dual carbon - chlorine isotope fractionation during
16	dichloroelimination of 1,1,2-trichloroethane by an enrichment
17	culture containing Dehalogenimonas sp.
18	
19	Mònica Rosell <sup>1</sup> , Jordi Palau <sup>*1,2</sup> , Siti Hatijah Mortan <sup>3,a</sup> , Gloria Caminal <sup>4</sup> , Albert Soler <sup>1</sup> ,
20	Orfan Shouakar-Stash <sup>5,6</sup> , Ernest Marco-Urrea <sup>3</sup>
21	
22 22	<sup>1</sup> Grup MAiMA, Mineralogia Aplicada, Geoquímica i Geomicrobiologia, Departament de Mineralogia Petrologia i Geologia Aplicada Facultat de Ciències de la Terra
23	Universitat de Barcelona (UB), Martí Franquès s/n, 08028 Barcelona, Spain.
25 26	<sup>2</sup> Institute of Environmental Assessment and Water Research (IDAEA), CSIC, and Hydrogeology Group (UPC-CSIC), Jordi Girona 18-26, 08034 Barcelona, Spain
27 28	<sup>3</sup> Departament d'Enginyeria Química, Biològica i Ambiental, Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona (UAB), 08193 Bellaterra, Barcelona, Spain.
29 30	<sup>4</sup> Institut de Química Avançada de Catalunya (IQAC), CSIC, Jordi Girona 18-26, 08034 Barcelona, Spain
31 32	<sup>5</sup> Department of Earth and Environmental Sciences, University of Waterloo, Waterloo, Ontario N2L 3G1, Canada.
33	<sup>6</sup> Isotope Tracer Technologies Inc., Waterloo, Ontario N2 V 1Z5, Canada
34 35	<sup>a</sup> Current address: Faculty of Chemical and Natural Resources Engineering, Universiti Malaysia Pahang, Lebuhraya Tun Razak, Gambang, 26300 Kuantan, Pahang, Malaysia.
36	
37	*Corresponding author: jordi.palau@ub.edu
38	
39	

41

Chlorinated ethanes are frequent groundwater contaminants but compound specific 42 isotope analysis (CSIA) has been scarcely applied to investigate their degradation 43 pathways. In this study, dual carbon and chlorine isotope fractionation was used to 44 investigate for the first time the anoxic biodegradation of 1,1,2-trichloroethane (1,1,2-45 TCA) using a Dehalogenimonas-containing culture. The isotopic fractionation values 46 47 obtained for the biodegradation of 1,1,2-TCA were  $\varepsilon_C = -6.9 \pm 0.4\%$  and  $\varepsilon_{Cl} = -2.7 \pm$ 0.3‰. The detection of vinyl chloride (VC) as unique byproduct and a closed carbon 48 isotopic mass balance corroborated that dichloroelimination was the degradation 49 pathway used by this strain. Combining the values of  $\delta^{13}C$  and  $\delta^{37}Cl$  resulted in a dual 50 element C-Cl isotope slope of  $\Lambda$ =2.5 ± 0.2‰. Investigation of the apparent kinetic 51 52 isotope effects (AKIEs) expected for cleavage of a C-Cl bond showed an important masking of the intrinsic isotope fractionation. Theoretical calculation of  $\Lambda$  suggested 53 54 that dichloroelimination of 1,1,2-TCA was taking place via simultaneous cleavage of 55 two C-Cl bonds (concerted reaction mechanism). The isotope data obtained in this study can be useful to monitor natural attenuation of 1,1,2-TCA via dichloroelimination and 56 provide insights into the source and fate of VC in contaminated groundwaters. 57

58

- 59 Keywords: *Dehalogenimonas*; dual isotope fractionation; dichloroelimination;
  60 organohalide-respiring bacteria; 1,1,2-trichloroethane.
- 61

#### 63 **1. Introduction**

1,1,2-Trichloroethane (1,1,2-TCA) has been widely used as a solvent and chemical
intermediate in the industry (**Pankow and Cherry, 1996**). Improper storage and
accidental spills have contributed to 1,1,2-TCA being a frequent detected contaminant
in groundwater at industrial facilities (**ATSDR, 1989**). In the United States, it is ranked
166 out of 275 substances on the Priority List of Hazardous Substances based on a
combination of its frequency, toxicity, and potential for human exposure (**ATSDR, 2015**).

Quantification of the distribution and fate of chlorinated contaminants and 71 degradation products in the subsurface is a complex task since biological, chemical, and 72 physical processes may affect them (Němeček et al., 2017). Biological transformation 73 74 of 1,1,2-TCA is influenced by the intrinsic heterogeneity of natural environments that 75 allows for different redox conditions to occur either spatially or temporally separated. 76 Under anoxic conditions, reductive dechlorination is expected to be the prevailing 77 mechanism to transform 1,1,2-TCA by two different biodegradation pathways: hydrogenolysis and dichloroelimination. In the case of dichloroelimination, two vicinal 78 C-Cl bonds of 1,1,2-TCA are cleaved to produce vinyl chloride (VC), whereas during 79 hydrogenolysis 1,1,2-TCA is sequentially transformed by single C-Cl bond cleavage to 80 1,2-dichloroethane (1,2-DCA) and monochloroethane (Moe et al., 2016; Zhao et al., 81 2015) (Fig. 1). The key organisms catalyzing hydrogenolysis and dichloroelimination 82 are organohalide-respiring bacteria (OHRB), which can use 1,1,2-TCA as respiratory 83 84 electron acceptor (Leys et al., 2013). To date, dichloroelimination of 1,1,2-TCA has been described for OHRB belonging to the genus Dehalobacter and Dehalogenimonas 85 (Grostern and Edwards, 2006; Mortan et al., 2017; Yan et al., 2009), but 86 hydrogenolysis only for Desulfitobacterium (Zhao et al., 2015). Under oxic conditions, 87

no bacteria are currently known to use 1,1,2-TCA as growth substrate, but 88 cometabolism of 1,1,2-TCA can occur during aerobic oxidation of methane, propane, 89 butane, n-pentane, n-hexane or ammonia (Frascari et al., 2006, 2008, 2013; Vannelli 90 et al., 1990). The only byproducts identified for aerobic cometabolism of 1,1,2-TCA 91 92 include chloroacetic acid (which was sequentially oxidized to glyoxylic acid) and minor amounts of VC in microcosms containing a Pseudomonas sp. (Castro and Belser, 93 **1990**). Abiotic transformation of 1,1,2-TCA can produce a wide array of byproducts, 94 95 including VC (Patterson et al., 2016), ethane (Song and Carraway, 2005) or 1,1dichloroethene (1,1-DCE) (Pagana et al., 1998) (Fig.1). 96

Knowledge on degradation pathways occurring in an aquifer contaminated with 97 1,1,2-TCA is a key aspect to design suitable bioremediation strategies. However, this is 98 a challenge when the site contains multiple chlorinated aliphatic hydrocarbons because 99 100 the same daughter products of 1,1,2-TCA dechlorination can be formed from other 101 precursors (i.e., VC is produced from anaerobic reductive dechlorination of DCE 102 isomers or 1,2-DCA) (Hunkeler et al., 2002). It is important to note that VC, produced 103 during biotic or abiotic reductive dichloroelimination of 1,1,2-TCA, is even much more toxic than 1,1,2-TCA. 104

Compound-specific isotope analysis (CSIA) has emerged in recent years as a 105 106 technique with great potential to elucidate specific reaction pathways even if no products are detected (Elsner, 2010). The magnitude of carbon and chlorine kinetic 107 108 isotope effects (KIEs) during contaminant degradation relies on the observation that lighter stable isotopes (i.e., <sup>12</sup>C, <sup>35</sup>Cl) react at faster rates than the heavier ones (i.e., <sup>13</sup>C, 109 110 <sup>37</sup>Cl). For a given compound and reaction, single element isotope fractionation values (ɛ) are determined in laboratory degradation experiments according to the Rayleigh 111 112 equation. However,  $\varepsilon$  values associated to biodegradation cannot be accurately

measured in the field because other processes such as sorption or mixing throughdispersion also affect contaminant concentration.

Two-dimensional CSIA brings the potential to overcome the limitation of single 115 element isotope fractionation values to identify contaminant degradation pathways in 116 the field. Combined changes in isotope ratios of two elements (i.e.,  $\Delta\delta^{13}C$  and  $\Delta\delta^{37}Cl$ ) 117 for a given reactant generally correlate in a dual element isotope plot obtaining a slope 118  $(\Lambda = \Delta \delta^{13}C / \Delta \delta^{37}Cl)$  that reflects the isotope effects of both elements. Hence,  $\Lambda$  values 119 may act as direct indicator for different initial reaction mechanisms. To interpret dual 120 element CSIA data sets obtained from contaminated field sites, it is necessary to know 121 experimental carbon and chlorine isotope enrichment factors and A values derived from 122 microbial strains catalyzing known transformation reactions (Cretnik et al., 2013; 123 124 Kuntze et al., 2016). However, to our knowledge, chlorine isotope fractionation ( $\varepsilon_{Cl}$ ) 125 and  $\Lambda$  values are not available for 1,1,2-TCA. Hunkeler et al. (2002) showed that dichloroelimination of 1,1,2-TCA to VC in anaerobic microcosms inoculated with 126 127 contaminated groundwater was accompanied of a relatively weak carbon isotopic fractionation of 1,1,2-TCA ( $\varepsilon_{C} = -2.0 \pm 0.2\%$ ). Recently, in a laboratory flow-through 128 129 column experiment consisting of both biodegradable organic carbon and zero valent iron,  $\varepsilon_{\rm C}$  changed from -14.6±0.7‰ to -0.72±0.12‰, being this last value assigned to 130 131 anaerobic biodegradation (Patterson et al., 2016).

The main aims of this research were to measure for the first time dual C-Cl isotope fractionation and to determine the resultant  $\Lambda$  value during biodegradation of 1,1,2-TCA with an anaerobic bacterial culture containing a *Dehalogenimonas* sp. This is valuable information i) to investigate the fate of 1,1,2-TCA in future biodegradation field studies and ii) to get insight into the underlying reaction mechanism involved in the dechlorination of 1,1,2-TCA. In addition, carbon isotope values of VC weremeasured to determine the product isotope pattern during biodegradation of 1,1,2-TCA.

139

## 140 2. Materials and methods

## 141 **2.1. Biodegradation batch experiments**

A stable enrichment culture containing a *Dehalogenimonas* sp. described previously 142 that transforms 1,1,2-TCA to VC via dichloroelimination (Martín-González et al., 143 144 2015) was used in batch experiments. Each microcosm consisted of 100 mL glass serum bottles containing 65 mL of a sterilized anoxic synthetic medium previously used to 145 146 grow Dehalococcoides mccartyi strain CBDB1 (Adrian et al., 2000). This medium contained vitamins, trace elements,  $Na_2S \times 9 H_2O$  and L-cysteine (0.2 mM each) as 147 reducing agent, and as carbon source either sodium acetate (5 mM) or pyruvate (5 mM) 148 as indicated. The serum bottles were sealed with Teflon-coated butyl rubber septa and 149 150 aluminum crimp caps and gassed with  $N_2/CO_2$  (4:1, v/v, 0.2 bar overpressure) and H<sub>2</sub> 151 (added to an overpressure of 0.4 bar). 1,1,2-TCA was added with a syringe from a stock solution in acetone to give an initial aqueous phase concentration of ~ 20  $\mu$ mol L<sup>-1</sup>; 152 higher concentrations appeared to be inhibitory for this Dehalogenimonas-containing 153 culture. 154

A total of 16 parallel incubations from the same inoculum were prepared at the same time. Half of these cultures contained acetate and the other half pyruvate as carbon source. Cultures were incubated at 25°C in the dark without shaking. Samples were collected for isotopic and concentration analyses at different extents of 1,1,2-TCA dechlorination. In order to control losses, abiotic transformations, and the transfer of compounds with the inoculum (previous growth in 1,2-dichloropropane, 1,2-DCP) or potential impurities from the stock solution, two types of controls were included in triplicate: (i) live controls without 1,1,2-TCA and (ii) abiotic controls containing thegrowth medium with 1,1,2-TCA but without inoculum.

#### 164 **2.2. Analytical methods**

2.2.1. Concentration and isotopic measurements. 1,1,2-TCA and VC concentrations 165 166 in serum bottles were monitored along the experiment by taking 0.5 mL headspace (HS) samples with a 1.0 mL pressure-lock precision analytical syringe (Vici, U.S.) and 167 injecting them in a gas chromatograph (GC) model 6890N (Agilent Technologies) 168 169 equipped with a DB-624 column (30 m  $\times$  0.32 mm with 0.25 µm film thickness; Agilent Technologies) and a flame ionization detector (FID), as described elsewhere (Palau et 170 al., 2017). Depending on the measured concentrations (expressed in  $\mu$ mol L<sup>-1</sup> of liquid 171 172 volume) the bottles were sacrificed at different extent of degradation stopping biological 173 activity by adding 12 mL of an oxic, saturated H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>/Na<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> solution (pH=1).

174 Compound-specific carbon and chlorine isotope analyses were performed by HS-solid-phase micro-extraction (HS-SPME)-GC-isotope ratio mass spectrometry (GC-175 IRMS) as described elsewhere (**Palau et al., 2017**).  $\delta^{13}$ C analyses were performed in the 176 Centres Científics i Tecnològics de la Universitat de Barcelona (CCiT-UB), Spain, 177 while  $\delta^{37}$ Cl were carried out at *Isotope Tracer Technologies Inc.* (IT2), Canada. For 178 analyzing chlorine isotope ratios of 1,1,2-TCA, the two most abundant fragment ions 179 (m/z 97 and 99) were used, which correspond to isotopologue pairs (i.e.,  $[^{35}\text{Cl}_2^{12}\text{C}_2^{11}\text{H}_3]^+$ 180 and  $[{}^{37}Cl^{35}Cl^{12}C_{2}{}^{1}H_{4}]^{+}$ , respectively) that differ by one heavy chlorine isotope. For 181 1,1,2-TCA, the intensities of the most abundant fragment ion peaks are much higher 182 than those of the parent ion peaks. The raw  $\delta^{37}$ Cl values were calibrated to the standard 183 184 mean ocean chloride (SMOC) scale using a two-point linear calibration. The standards 185 were dissolved in water and measured similarly to the samples interspersed in the same sequence. Duplicate samples and standards were analyzed. The precision  $(1\sigma)$  on the analysis of standards was  $\leq 0.5\%$  for  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\leq 0.2\%$  for  $\delta^{37}$ Cl.

188 2.2.2. *Isotope data evaluation.* Carbon and chlorine isotope ratios of 1,1,2-TCA were 189 measured at natural abundance and were expressed using the δ-notation in per mil (eq. 190 1),

191

192 
$$\delta^{h} E_{sample} = \left(\frac{R({}^{h}E/{}^{l}E)_{sample}}{R({}^{h}E/{}^{l}E)_{standard}} - 1\right) \cdot 1000$$
(1)

193

where R is the isotope ratio of heavy (<sup>h</sup>E) to light (<sup>l</sup>E) isotopes of an element "E "(e.g.,  $^{13}C/^{12}C$  and  $^{37}Cl/^{35}Cl$ ). The relationship between isotope fractionation and the extent of 1,1,2-TCA biodegradation in laboratory experiments was evaluated by a modified form of the Rayleigh distillation equation (2)

198

199 
$$\ln\left(\frac{\delta^{h}E_{s}+1000}{\delta^{h}E_{s0}+1000}\right) = \frac{\varepsilon_{bulk}}{1000} \cdot \ln f$$
 (2)

200

where  $\delta^{h}E_{S0}$  is the initial isotopic composition of element "E" in a substrate "S" and 201  $\delta^{h}E_{s}$  is the isotopic composition at a remaining fraction "f" (f = C<sub>s</sub>/C<sub>s0</sub>). The 202 compound-average isotope fractionation values ( $\varepsilon_{\text{hulk}}$ ) were quantified by least squares 203 204 linear regression of eq. 2 without forcing the regression through the origin (Scott et al., 205 2004) and the uncertainty corresponds to the 95% confidence interval (C.I.) derived from the standard deviation of the regression slope. The Rayleigh equation can also be 206 applied to calculate the isotopic fractionation of chlorine despite the higher natural 207 abundance of <sup>37</sup>Cl compared to <sup>13</sup>C (Elsner and Hunkeler, 2008). 208

To evaluate the product carbon isotope fractionation pattern, the  $\delta^{13}$ C of VC that was produced was calculated using eq. 3, where  $\delta^{13}$ C<sub>P</sub> is the isotopic composition of the product "P" (i.e., VC) and  $\varepsilon_{\text{bulk}}$  is the estimated carbon isotopic fractionation of 1,1,2-TCA (eq. 2) (**Cretnik et al., 2014; Hunkeler et al., 2005**).

213

214 
$$\delta^{13}C_{P} = \delta^{13}C_{S0} - \frac{\varepsilon_{\text{bulk}} \cdot f \cdot \ln f}{1 - f}$$
(3)

215

For a given substrate, intrinsic KIEs during compound transformation are 216 position specific whereas  $\varepsilon_{bulk}$  values are calculated from compound-average isotope 217 218 data (eq. 2). Therefore, observable  $\varepsilon_{bulk}$  values must be converted into apparent KIEs (AKIEs) in order to obtain information about the underlying reaction mechanisms 219 220 (Elsner et al., 2005). For the calculation and interpretation of AKIEs a hypothesis about the reaction mechanism, or assumed reaction mechanism, is necessary. The effects of 221 non-reacting positions within the molecule, as well as of intramolecular competition, are 222 223 then taken into account using equations 4 and 5, respectively (Elsner et al., 2005),

224

225 
$$\varepsilon_{\rm rp} \approx \frac{n}{x} \cdot \varepsilon_{\rm bulk}$$
 (4)

226 
$$AKIE_{C,Cl} = \frac{1}{z \cdot (\frac{\varepsilon_{PD}}{1000}) + 1}$$
 (5)

227

where  $\varepsilon_{rp}$  is the isotopic fractionation at the reactive position, "n" is the number of atoms of the element considered, "x" is the number of these atoms at reactive sites (i.e., atoms that would experience isotope effects in the given reaction) and "z" the number of identical reactive sites undergoing intramolecular competition. These equations assume the absence of secondary isotope effects. For carbon, secondary isotope effects are 233 usually insignificant (Elsner et al., 2005). For dichloroelimination of 1,1,2-TCA to VC, if the two C-Cl bonds are broken in sequence (i.e., stepwise dichloroelimination, single 234 C-Cl bond cleavage at the first reaction step), assuming that the first bond cleavage is 235 the rate determining step, then n = x = z = 2 and n = x = z = 3 for C and Cl, respectively, 236 as all C and Cl atoms are in equivalent position and compete for reaction. On the other 237 hand, if the two C-Cl bonds are broken simultaneously (i.e., concerted 238 dichloroelimination), the average AKIE<sub>C</sub> and AKIE<sub>Cl</sub> for the two reacting positions 239 240 were calculated since there is no intramolecular competition between them, n = x = 2, z = 1 and n = 3, x = 2, z = 1 for C and Cl, respectively. AKIEs that were calculated 241 242 assuming stepwise or concerted dichloroelimination are referred hereafter as "AKIE<sub>stepwise</sub>" and "AKIE<sub>concerted</sub>" and their uncertainty was calculated by error 243 244 propagation.

For a given substrate and reaction, the dual C-Cl isotope slope ( $\Lambda$ ) obtained from  $\delta^{13}$ C vs  $\delta^{37}$ Cl isotope plots can be expressed as follows (**Elsner, 2010** and references herein):

248

249 
$$\Lambda_{\rm C-Cl} = \frac{\Delta \delta^{13} \rm C}{\Delta \delta^{37} \rm Cl} \approx \frac{\varepsilon_{\rm bulk}^{\rm C}}{\varepsilon_{\rm bulk}^{\rm Cl}} \approx \frac{\left(\frac{\rm x}{\rm n}\right)_{\rm C}}{\left(\frac{\rm x}{\rm n}\right)_{\rm Cl}} \cdot \frac{(\rm A) \rm KIE_{\rm C}-1}{(\rm A) \rm KIE_{\rm Cl}-1} \cdot \frac{1 + (\rm A) \rm KIE_{\rm C} \cdot (z_{\rm C}-1)}{1 + (\rm A) \rm KIE_{\rm Cl} \cdot (z_{\rm Cl}-1)}$$
(6)

250

### 251 **3. Results and discussion**

#### **3.1. Concentration and isotope patterns**

**3.1.1.** *Dechlorination of 1,1,2-TCA by a Dehalogenimonas-containing culture*. The anaerobic microcosms amended with pyruvate and acetate as carbon source lasted approximately 7 and 15 days, respectively, at which point the initial 1,1,2-TCA was transformed to VC via dichloroelimination. The concentration of 1,1,2-TCA in the

abiotic controls (19.0  $\pm$  0.5  $\mu$ mol L<sup>-1</sup>,  $\pm$  1 $\sigma$ , n = 5) remained at the initial concentration 257 along the experiments, which indicates that compound losses through the caps during 258 incubation were insignificant. The difference in the lag phase between acetate and 259 260 pyruvate amended microcosms is not probably associated with the carbon source but to the inoculum source that was more enriched in the microcosms with pyruvate. No other 261 volatile organic compounds were detected, especially 1,2-DCA was absent discarding 262 1,1,2-TCA hydrogenolysis. At different stages of 1,1,2-TCA degradation, isotope 263 signatures of 1,1,2-TCA ( $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{37}$ Cl) and VC ( $\delta^{13}$ C) were measured for all the 264 265 samples to determine the corresponding isotopic fractionation values of 1,1,2-TCA ( $\varepsilon_{\rm C}$ 266 and  $\varepsilon_{Cl}$ ) and the carbon isotope pattern of produced VC.

3.1.2. Carbon isotope pattern of 1,1,2-TCA. The  $\delta^{13}$ C of 1,1,2-TCA in the abiotic 267 268 controls remained constant through both experiments, with a total average value of - $36.3 \pm 0.6\%$ . In contrast, carbon isotopic composition of 1,1,2-TCA in the cultures 269 became progressively enriched in <sup>13</sup>C during its degradation reaching a  $\delta^{13}$ C value up to 270 271 -14.3‰ when 96% of 1.1.2-TCA was degraded in both acetate- and pyruvate-containing 272 media (Fig. 2). These results show that despite the differences in the lag phase and the 273 inoculum source, no statistical difference in concentrations and carbon isotope values was observed for the experiments prepared with either acetate or pyruvate as carbon 274 275 source. Isotopic data from both experiments were combined and the total carbon isotope composition of 1,1,2-TCA followed a Rayleigh trend ( $r^2$ =0.9901, Fig. 3A) with an  $\varepsilon_C$ 276 277 value of  $-6.9 \pm 0.4\%$  (95% C.I., n=16).

The similar isotope fractionation of 1,1,2-TCA for the microcosms amended with either acetate or pyruvate agrees with recent studies investigating isotopic fractionation of trichloroethene (TCE) under different growth conditions. **Harding et al. (2013)** showed that carbon isotope fractionation during TCE degradation by

Dehalococcoides-containing cultures remained consistent despite a variety of 282 temperature, nutrient, and cofactor-limiting conditions investigated. In addition, 283 Buchner et al. (2015) studied the potential effects of metabolic adaptation on carbon 284 and chlorine isotope fractionation of TCE during biodegradation by Desulfitobacterium 285 hafniesne Y51. These authors reported similar  $\varepsilon_{bulk}$  values for C and Cl isotopes under 286 different growth conditions (i.e., cultures pre-grown with fumarate or TCE as electron 287 288 acceptors) and enzyme quantity per cell and suggested that isotope fractionation was not affected. 289

3.1.3. Carbon isotope pattern of VC. In parallel to 1,1,2-TCA transformation, the  $\delta^{13}$ C 290 of its degradation product (i.e., VC) was monitored. The  $\delta^{13}C$  of VC was initially 291 depleted in <sup>13</sup>C, in agreement with the normal isotope effect of 1,1,2-TCA, and shifted 292 293 toward more positive values during the course of reaction reaching the initial value of 294 1,1,2-TCA once this was completely degraded (Fig. 2). As observed for 1,1,2-TCA, the 295 carbon isotope data of VC from the experiments with acetate and pyruvate showed similar values (Fig. 2). This figure also shows that  $\delta^{13}$ C values of VC fitted very well 296 with the expected product isotope trend determined according to eq. 3. The closed 297 298 isotopic mass balance confirmed the absence of other relevant degradation products. Moreover,  $\delta^{13}C$  of VC never overpass the initial  $\delta^{13}C$  of 1,1,2-TCA suggesting that VC 299 is not further degraded to non-chlorinated compounds such as ethene or ethane, which is 300 301 consistent to its accumulation.

A different product isotope pattern was observed for degradation of 1,1,2-TCA in a previous study with microcosms constructed with aquifer material and groundwater (**Hunkeler et al., 2002**). These authors observed  $\delta^{13}$ C values of VC very enriched in  $^{13}$ C compared to those of 1,1,2-TCA towards the end of reaction, which was indicative of further degradation of VC to ethene via reductive dechlorination. Therefore, the results

307 of the present study and Hunkeler et al., 2002 illustrate the potential of the product carbon isotope pattern to investigate the fate of VC in sites impacted with 1,1,2-TCA. 308 309 Analysis of ethene concentration can be used to evaluate the fate of VC in groundwater, provided that other potential precursors of ethene such as 1,2-DCA are not present at the 310 311 site. However, assessing the fate of VC based solely on ethene concentration can be 312 difficult because ethene can be transformed under both oxic and anoxic conditions to carbon dioxide and ethane, respectively (Mundle et al., 2012), highlighting the benefit 313 314 of VC isotope analysis as complementary data.

3.1.4. Chlorine isotope pattern of 1,1,2-TCA and dual C-Cl isotope approach. 315 Chlorine isotope data of 1,1,2-TCA ( $\delta^{37}$ Cl) were obtained from the pyruvate amended 316 microcosms. The  $\delta^{37}$ Cl of 1,1,2-TCA in the abiotic controls (-0.88 ± 0.2‰) did not 317 change significantly during the experiment, while an enrichment in the heavy isotope 318 (<sup>37</sup>Cl) during 1,1,2-TCA degradation following a Rayleigh trend ( $\varepsilon_{Cl} = -2.7 \pm 0.3\%$ ), 319 320 n=8, 95% C.I., Fig. 3B) was observed in the cultures. Chlorine isotope fractionation was 321 much lower than for carbon, in agreement with the large primary carbon isotope effects expected for C-Cl bond cleavage (Elsner et al., 2005). The measurement of chlorine 322 isotope ratios enabled for the first time a dual C-Cl isotope approach for biodegradation 323 of 1,1,2-TCA. A very good linear correlation ( $r^2 = 0.994$ ) was obtained when  $\delta^{13}C$  and 324 325  $\delta^{37}$ Cl were combined in a dual element isotope plot showing a slope (A) of 2.5 ± 0.2 (95% C.I., Fig. 4). 326

study on 1,2-DCA showed different 327 A recent Λ values during dichloroelimination by Dehalogenimonas- and Dehalococcoides-containing cultures, 328 329 suggesting that a dual C-Cl isotope approach could help to identify the microbial taxa 330 responsible for anaerobic biodegradation of 1,2-DCA in the field (Palau et al., 2017). This information is particularly important for 1,1,2-TCA given that, in contrast to 331

332 *Desulfitobacterium* (**Zhao et al., 2015**) (Fig. 1), its degradation by *Dehalogenimonas* 333 can result in an accumulation of the highly toxic VC in groundwater. Therefore, 334 comparison of the  $\Lambda$  value obtained for *Dehalogenimonas* in the present study with 335 those obtained for 1,1,2-TCA degradation by other bacteria in future studies might help 336 to investigate the fate of 1,1,2-TCA and to predict potential accumulation of VC in 337 contaminated sites.

#### 338 3.2. Isotope effects and insight into dichloroelimination mechanisms of 1,1,2-TCA

339 Significant variation on reported bulk carbon isotope fractionation during biodegradation of 1,1,2-TCA is observed (Table 1). The  $\varepsilon_{\rm C}$  value of -6.9  $\pm$  0.4‰ 340 determined in this study is significantly larger than that previously reported,  $-2.0 \pm$ 341 0.2‰ from microcosms constructed with anaerobic aquifer material and groundwater 342 (Hunkeler et al., 2002). In addition, a much lower  $\varepsilon_{\rm C}$  value of -0.7  $\pm$  0.1‰ was 343 344 determined by Patterson et al. 2016, which was attributed to biodegradation in a 345 laboratory column consisted of both zero valent iron Fe(0) and biodegradable organic 346 carbon. Interestingly, microbiological data from this laboratory column suggested that a 347 co-culture composed by Desulfitobacterium and Dehalococcoides was responsible for the sequential degradation of 1,1,2-TCA to ethene. The enzymatic mechanism of 348 Desulfitobacterium sp. strain PR to transform 1,1,2-TCA to 1,2-DCA via 349 350 hydrogenolysis differs from the production of VC via dichloroelimination in our Dehalogenimonas-containing culture which could explain the difference on carbon 351 isotope fractionation observed in both studies (Fig. 1). A simultaneous cleavage of two 352 353 C-Cl bonds via *concerted* dichloroelimination of 1,1,2-TCA might result theoretically in 354 a larger bulk  $\varepsilon_{\rm C}$  value compared to hydrogenolysis, where a single C-Cl bond is broken at the initial reaction step. However, the occurrence of isotope-masking leading to 355 smaller  $\varepsilon_{\rm C}$  values cannot be excluded. In this case, if preceding (rate-limiting) steps 356

exhibit small or no isotope fractionation, the observable isotope effect will be smaller(i.e., masked) than the intrinsic isotope effect.

To address in more detail whether dichloroelimination of 1,1,2-TCA by 359 Dehalogenimonas proceeds via a stepwise or concerted mode, AKIE values were 360 calculated according to eq. 4 and 5 as it was previously done with the same 361 Dehalogenimonas containing enrichment for 1,2-DCP (Martín-González et al., 2015) 362 or 1,2-DCA (Palau et al., 2017, see also Table 1). Assuming stepwise or concerted 363 364 mode, carbon AKIEs obtained for 1,1,2-TCA (AKIE<sup>C</sup><sub>stepwise</sub> =  $1.0138 \pm 0.0008$  and  $AKIE^{C}_{concerted} = 1.0069 \pm 0.0004$ , respectively) were much below the Streitweiser limit 365 366 of KIE<sub>C</sub> for complete C-Cl bond cleavage (1.057) and the realistic value of 50% bond cleavage (1.029) (Elsner et al., 2005), making both modes feasible, but showing 367 important masking of intrinsic isotope fractionation. For chlorine, AKIEs determined 368 for both mechanisms (AKIE<sup>Cl</sup><sub>stepwise</sub> =  $1.0082 \pm 0.0009$  and AKIE<sup>Cl</sup><sub>concerted</sub> =  $1.0041 \pm$ 369 370 0.0005), were also below the Streitweiser limit for C-Cl bond cleavage (1.013).

371 Apart from theoretical Streitweiser limits, isotopic fractionation values and 372 derived AKIEs from abiotic reactions are often considered closest to the intrinsic isotope effects. Abiotic reductive dechlorination of 1,1,2-TCA was suggested in the 373 same above-mentioned Fe(0) column study but without the organic carbon amendment 374 375 (Patterson et al. 2016). In that case, an AKIE for stepwise mode of 1.0246 can be calculated from the reported  $\varepsilon_{\rm C}$  value (-12 ± 5‰). This AKIE value is within the range 376  $(AKIE^{C}_{stepwise} = 1.0158$  to 1.0326) previously available for abiotic reductive 377 378 dechlorination of 1,1,1-TCA and other polychlorinated ethanes, 1,1,2,2tetrachloroethane (1,1,2,2-TeCA), pentachloroethane (PCA) and hexachloroethane 379 380 (HCA) by Cr(II), Fe(0) and Cu and Fe mixtures (Elsner et al., 2007; Hofstetter et al., 2007; Palau et al., 2014). Chlorine isotope effects (AKIE<sup>Cl</sup><sub>stepwise</sub> = 1.0125 to 1.0207) 381

were also reported by Hofstetter et al., 2007 and Palau et al., 2014. The reported 382 carbon and chlorine AKIEs for abiotic reductive dechlorination of chlorinated ethanes 383 (via single C-Cl bond cleavage at the first reaction step) are higher than those 384 determined for 1,1,2-TCA dichloroelimination in this study assuming either stepwise or 385 concerted scenarios. Therefore, mechanistic interpretations are challenged by the 386 relatively low observable bulk isotope effects of 1,1,2-TCA. The occurrence of isotope-387 masking effects can sometimes complicate the identification of the underlaying reaction 388 389 mechanism since derived AKIEs may then be no longer characteristic of a certain reaction (Elsner et al., 2005). However, an improved interpretation might be possible 390 391 by comparing dual C-Cl isotope slopes (see below).

A large isotope fractionation masking such that of 1,1,2-TCA during degradation 392 393 by Dehalogenimonas in this study was also observed for Dehalobacter-containing 394 mixed culture degrading 1,1,1-TCA versus 1,1-DCA (Sherwood Lollar et al., 2010). In 395 particular, the large intrinsic kinetic isotope effect expected for cleavage of a C-Cl bond 396 was almost completely masked during 1,1,1-TCA biodegradation by both whole cells 397 and cell-free extracts, while for 1,1-DCA the reduction was only roughly 50%. These effects were not attributable to transport effects across the cell membrane, rather than to 398 significant differences in the kinetics of the enzymes catalyzing chlorinated ethane 399 400 degradation.

# 401 **3.3. Reaction mechanism insight from dual C-Cl plot.**

402 An important advantage of  $\Lambda$  values compared to  $\varepsilon_{bulk}$  values (and derived AKIEs) is 403 that the magnitude of the latter can be significantly affected by isotope-masking 404 processes. Since isotope-masking affect both elements to a similar extent, the dual 405 element isotope slopes remain largely unaltered (**Elsner, 2010**). For 1,1,2-TCA, the lack 406 of degradation studies including both carbon and chlorine isotope data makes not 407 possible a comparison of the  $\Lambda$  value determined for *Dehalogenimonas* in this study 408 with  $\Lambda$  values for different reactions (biotic and abiotic) and microbial strains. However, 409  $\Lambda$  values for a new compound like 1,1,2-TCA can be predicted based on the expected 410 KIEs for carbon and chlorine according to eq 6, and it can be then compared to the 411 experimentally determined  $\Lambda$  value for *Dehalogenimonas*.

Assuming *concerted* dichloroelimination of 1,1,2-TCA (n = x = 2, z = 1 and n = 412 3, x = 2, z = 1 for C and Cl, respectively, see above), the carbon and chlorine isotope 413 414 effects determined in a recent study (Palau et al., 2017) for reductive dichloroelimination of 1,2-DCA by *Dehalogenimonas* were used in eq. 6 (AKIE<sup>C</sup><sub>concerted</sub> 415 =  $1.024 \pm 0.003$  and AKIE<sup>Cl</sup><sub>concerted</sub> =  $1.0121 \pm 0.0008$ , see Table 1). These authors 416 postulated a concerted character of the reaction based on determined carbon isotope 417 effects. As a result, a  $\Lambda$  value of 2.98 was obtained, which is similar to the experimental 418 value of  $2.5 \pm 0.2$  (Fig. 4). In contrast, if a *stepwise* dichloroelimination of 1,1,2-TCA is 419 assumed (n = x = z = 2 and n = x = z = 3 for C and Cl, respectively), a very different 420 421 A value of 1.01 is obtained. In this case, the average carbon and chlorine isotope effects 422 for 1,1,2,2-TeCA, PCA and HCA during abiotic dichloroelimination by Cr(II) via sequential  $\beta$ -elimination of two chlorine atoms were considered (AKIE<sup>C</sup><sub>stepwise</sub> = 1.026 ± 423 424 0.005 and  $AKIE^{Cl}_{stepwise} = 1.017 \pm 0.004$ , see Table 1) (Hofstetter et al., 2007). In 425 addition, a smaller  $\Lambda$  value of 0.66 was obtained in case the AKIEs estimated for reduction of 1,1,1-TCA by Fe(0) via single electron transfer are used in the calculations 426 (AKIE<sup>C</sup><sub>stepwise</sub> =  $1.0158 \pm 0.0008$  and AKIE<sup>Cl</sup><sub>stepwise</sub> =  $1.0160 \pm 0.0006$ , see Table 1). 427 Therefore, the comparison of the experimental  $\Lambda$  value of 1,1,2-TCA with those 428 429 expected for stepwise and concerted mechanisms according to eq. 6 suggests that a concerted dichloroelimination is more likely, highlighting the benefit of using a dual 430 C-Cl isotope approach. This result is in agreement with previous studies of 1,2-DCP 431

1,2-DCA biodegradation by Dehalogenimonas suggesting a concerted 432 and dichloroelimination pathway (Martín-González et al., 2015; Palau et al., 2017). 433 Identification of the underlying transformation mechanism controlling isotope 434 fractionation can be valuable information to improve the characterization of reductive 435 dehalogenases. In addition, an eventual identification of different dichloroelimination 436 mechanisms of 1,1,2-TCA (i.e., concerted vs stepwise) by distinct microbial strains 437 might indicate the existence of diverse reductive dehalogenases with similar function 438 439 but likely different structure. For 1,2-DCA, the isotopic differences observed by Palau et al. (2017) between Dehalogenimonas and Dehalococcoides containing cultures on 440 the concerted dichloroelimination mechanism were associated to a distinct interaction 441 mode between cobalamin dependent enzymes rather than two different reaction 442 pathways (i.e., stepwise vs concerted). The same isotopic results and conclusions were 443 444 validated by Franke et al. (2017) with two pure Dehalococcoides mccartyi strains (195 445 and BTF08).

446

### 447 **4.** Conclusions

1,1,2-TCA is a frequent groundwater contaminant but surprisingly only few studies 448 applying CSIA have been reported so far. Our work provides the first application of 449 450 dual isotope fractionation to investigate the anaerobic biodegradation of 1,1,2-TCA. The stable isotope data obtained in this study during the dichloroelimination of 1,1,2-TCA 451 can be potentially helpful in monitoring the fate of this pollutant in contaminated 452 453 environments. In addition, the carbon isotope pattern of VC obtained in our enrichment 454 enlightens its potential use to identify the dominant VC production mechanism and 455 predict further transformation of this toxic compound. The single element kinetic isotope effects could not provide conclusive information about the reaction mechanism 456

involved in 1,1,2-TCA dichloroelimination (concerted or stepwise); however, the dualelement approach can reduce interpretation bias due to isotope-masking effects
overcoming this limitation and pointing to more likely concerted mechanism. Further
investigations on carbon and chlorine isotope fractionation with bacteria catalyzing
alternate degradation pathways (i.e., hydrogenolysis) will allow the comparison
between microbial dechlorination reactions of 1,1,2-TCA.

463

# 464 **5. Acknowledgements**

This research has been supported by the Spanish Ministry of Economy and 465 466 Competitiveness, MINECO (CTM2013-48545-C2-1-R, CTM2016-75587-C2-1-R, 467 CGL2014-57215-C4-1-R and CGL2017-87216-C4-1-R projects) co-financed by the 468 European Union through the European Regional Development Fund (ERDF). This work was also partly supported by the Generalitat de Catalunya through the consolidate 469 470 research groups (2017-SGR-14 and 2017SGR-1733). M. Rosell acknowledges a Ramón 471 y Cajal contract (RYC-2012-11920) from MINECO and S.H. Mortan support from the 472 Ministry of Education Malaysia (SLAI-UMP Scholarship) for a predoctoral fellowship. The Departament d'Enginyeria Química, Biològica i Ambiental of the Universitat 473 474 Autònoma de Barcelona is a member of the Xarxa de Referència en Biotecnologia de la 475 Generalitat de Catalunya. We thank technical support from CCiT-UB.

476

Figure 1. Degradation pathways of 1,1,2-TCA: (a) dehydrochlorination, (b) 478 hydrogenolysis, (c) dichloroelimination, (d) hydrolysis. Numbers indicate the 479 dechlorinating agent: (1) base mediated abiotic reaction in aqueous solution (Pagana et 480 al. 1998); (2) Desulfitobacterium sp. strain PR (Zhao et al. 2015); (3) Dehalobacter and 481 482 Dehalogenimonas spp (Grostern and Edwards, 2006; Mortan et al. 2017, Yan et al. 2009); (4) nanosized zero-valent iron (Song and Carraway, 2005); (5) zero valent iron 483 and zinc (Patterson et al. 2016); (6) Pseudomonas sp. (Castro and Belser, 1990). Bold 484 485 arrow: biotic reaction; dashed arrow: abiotic reaction.

486



487

**Figure 2.** Concentration and carbon isotope patterns of 1,1,2-TCA (circles) and VC (triangles) during dichloroelimination of 1,1,2-TCA in a *Dehalogenimonas*-enrichment culture prepared with either acetate (empty symbols) or pyruvate (filled symbols) as carbon source. The error bars show the one standard deviation (1 $\sigma$ ) for duplicate measurements. For isotope values the error bars are smaller than the symbols. The average  $\delta^{13}$ C of 1,1,2-TCA in the controls (dashed line) and models fit to isotope data from the substrate (eq 2, black solid line) and product (eq 3, grey solid line) are shown.

496

497



498

**Figure 3.** Double logarithmic plot according to the Rayleigh equation (eq 2) of the carbon (A) and chlorine (B) isotope ratios versus the residual concentration of 1,1,2-TCA during dichloroelimination by a *Dehalogenimonas*-containing culture prepared with either acetate (empty symbols) or pyruvate (filled symbols) as carbon source. The error bars show the one standard deviation  $(1\sigma)$  for duplicate measurements and doted lines represent the 95% C.I. of the linear regression determined by SigmaPlot.

506



507

**Figure 4.** Dual C-Cl isotope plot during dichloroelimination of 1,1,2-TCA in a *Dehalogenimonas*-containing enrichment culture. The error bars show the one standard deviation  $(1\sigma)$  for duplicate measurements. For C isotope values the error bars are smaller than the symbols. Doted lines represent the 95% C.I. of the linear regression determined by SigmaPlot.

514



515

			AKIE <sub>C</sub>			AKIE <sub>CI</sub>			
Compound	Degradation experiment	єC (‰)	Stepwise	Concerted	εCl (‰)	Stepwise	Concerted	Λ	Reference
1,1,2-TCA	Dehalogenimonas -containing culture	$-6.9 \pm 0.4$	$1.0138 \pm 0.0008$	$1.0069 \pm 0.0004$	$-2.7 \pm 0.3$	$1.0082 \pm 0.0009$	$1.0041 \pm 0.0005$	$2.5 \pm 0.2$	This study
1,1,2-TCA	Anoxic microcosms	$-2.0 \pm 0.2$	1.0040*	1.0020*	n.m.			n.m.	Hunkeler et al. (2002)
112 764	Laboratory column 20% (w/w) Fe(0)/organic carbon amendment	$-14.6 \pm 0.7$	1.0301	1.0148					D. # 1 (2016)
1,1,2-1CA		$-0.7 \pm 0.1$	to 1.0014*	to 1.0007*	n.m			n.m	Patterson et al. (2016)
1,1,2-TCA	Abiotic laboratory column with Fe(0) without organic carbon amendment	$-12 \pm 5$	1.0246*	1.0121*	n.m			n.m	Patterson et al. (2016)
1,1,1-TCA	abiotic by Cr(II), Fe(0) and Cu and Fe mix	$-13.6 \pm 0.5$ to $-15.8 \pm 0.6$	$1.028 \pm 0.001$ to $1.033 \pm 0.001$	n.a	n.m.			n.m.	Elsner et al. (2007)
1,1,1-TCA	abiotic by Fe(0)	$-7.8 \pm 0.4$	$1.0158 \pm 0.0008$	n.a	$-5.2 \pm 0.2$	$1.0160 \pm 0.0006$		$1.5\pm0.1$	Palau et al. (2014)
1,1,1-TCA	abiotic degradation mediated by biotic FeS formation in bioaugmented microcosms	-10.3 to -14.0			n.m.			n.m.	Broholm et al. (2014)
1,1,1-TCA	<i>Dehalobacter</i> -containing culture (whole cell and cell-free extracts)	$-1.8 \pm 0.3$ $-0.8 \pm 0.3$	$\begin{array}{c} 1.0036 \pm 0.0006 \\ 1.0016 \pm 0.0006 \end{array}$	n.a	n.m.			n.m.	Sherwood Lollar et al. (2010)
1,2-DCA	Dehalococcoides mccartyi strains (195 and BTF08)	$-28.4 \pm 3.7$ $-30.9 \pm 3.6$	$\begin{array}{c} 1.059 \pm 0.008 \\ 1.066 \pm 0.008 \end{array}$	1.029 1.031	$-4.6 \pm 0.7$ $-4.2 \pm 0.5$	$\begin{array}{c} 1.009 \pm 0.001 \\ 1.009 \pm 0.001 \end{array}$	1.005 1.004	$\begin{array}{c} 6.9 \pm 1.2 \\ 7.1 \pm 0.2 \end{array}$	Franke et al. (2017)
1,2-DCA	<i>Dehalococcoides mccartyi</i> strains (195 and BTF08)	$-29.0 \pm 3.0$ $-30.8 \pm 1.3$	1.062 1.066	1.030 1.033	n.m			n.m	Schmidt et al. (2014)
1,2-DCA	Dehalococcoides-containing culture	$-33.0 \pm 0.4$	$1.0707 \pm 0.0009$	$1.0341 \pm 0.0004$	$-5.1 \pm 0.1$		$1.0051 \pm 0.0001*$	$6.8 \pm 0.2$	Palau et al. (2017)
1,2-DCA	Dehalogenimonas-containing culture	$-23 \pm 2$	$1.048 \pm 0.004$	$1.024 \pm 0.003$	$-12.0 \pm 0.8$		$1.0121 \pm 0.0008*$	$1.89\pm0.02$	Palau et al. (2017)
1,2-DCA	Anoxic microcosms	$-32 \pm 1$	$1.069 \pm 0.002*$	$1.033 \pm 0.001*$	n.m			n.m	Hunkeler et al. (2002)
1,2-DCA	abiotic by Zn(0)	$-29.7 \pm 1.5$	1.06 - 1.07	1.03	n.m.			n.m.	Vanstone et al. (2008)
1,1-DCA	<i>Dehalobacter</i> -containing culture (whole cell and cell-free extracts)	$\begin{array}{c} -10.5\pm0.6\\ \text{and}\\ -7.9\pm0.9\end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 1.021 \pm 0.002 \\ and \\ 1.016 \pm 0.002 \end{array}$		n.m.			n.m.	Sherwood Lollar et al. (2010)
1,1,2,2-TeCA	abiotic by Cr(II), Fe(0) and Cu and Fe mix	$\begin{array}{c} -17.0\pm0.6\\ \text{to}\\ -19.3\pm0.7\end{array}$	$1.035 \pm 0.001$ to $1.040 \pm 0.001$	$\begin{array}{c} 1.0173 \pm 0.0006 \\ to \\ 1.0196 \pm 0.0008 \end{array}$	n.m.			n.m.	Elsner et al. (2007)
1,1,2,2-TeCA	Abiotic by Cr(II)	$-12.7 \pm 1.2$	$1.026\pm0.001$	1.013*	n.m			n.m	Hofstetter et al. (2007)
PCA	Abiotic by Cr(II)	$-14.7 \pm 0.6$	$1.0303 \pm 0.0006$	1.0149*	n.m			n.m	Hofstetter et al. (2007)
HCA	Abiotic by Cr(II)	$-10.4 \pm 0.5$	$1.0212 \pm 0.0005$	1.0105*	n.m			n.m	Hofstetter et al. (2007)
1,2-DCP	Culture RC containing Dehalococcoides	$-10.8\pm0.9$	$1.033 \pm 0.003$	$1.016\pm0.001$	n.m			n.m	Fletcher et al. (2009)
1,2-DCP	Culture KS containing Dehalococcoides	$-11.3 \pm 0.8$	$1.033 \pm 0.003$	$1.017 \pm 0.001$	n.m			n.m	Fletcher et al. (2009)
1,2-DCP	Culture BR containing Dehalogenimonas	$-15.0 \pm 0.7$	$1.045 \pm 0.002$	$1.023 \pm 0.001$	n.m			n.m	Martín-González et al. (2015)

# **Table 1.** Comparison of $\varepsilon$ and AKIE values for C and Cl isotopes assuming either stepwise or concerted reductive dechlorination of chlorinated ethanes and propanes.

n.m. not measured, n.a. not applicable. \* Approximated values calculated from epsilon according to Elsner et al., 2005.

## References

Adrian, L., Szewzyk, U., Wecke, J., Görisch, H., 2000. Bacterial dehalorespiration with chlorinated benzenes. Nature 408, 580-583. DOI:10.1038/35046063

ATDSR, 1989. Toxicological Profile for 1,1,2-trichloroethane, Agency for Toxic Substances and Disease Registry. U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Public Health Service., Atlanta, GA.

ATSDR, Agency for Toxic Substances and Disease Registry. 2015 Substance Priority List Resource Page. <u>https://www.atsdr.cdc.gov/spl/resources/index.html</u> (accessed on 23.05.2018).

Broholm, M. M., Hunkeler, D., Tuxen, N., Jeannottat, S., Scheutz, C., 2014. Stable carbon isotope analysis to distinguish biotic and abiotic degradation of 1,1,1-trichloroethane in groundwater sediments. Chemosphere 108, 265–273. DOI: 10.1016/j.chemosphere.2014.01.051

Buchner, D., Behrens, S., Laskov, C., Haderlein, S. B., 2015. Resiliency of stable isotope fractionation ( $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{37}$ Cl) of trichloroethene to bacterial growth physiology and expression of key enzymes. Environ. Sci. Technol. 49, 13230-13237. DOI: 10.1021/acs.est.5b02918.

Castro, E., Belser, N.O., 1990. Biodehalogenation: Oxidative and reductive metabolism of 1,1,2-trichloroethane by *Pseudomonas Putida*—Biogeneration of vinyl chloride. Environ. Toxicol. Chem. 9, 707-714. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1002/etc.5620090603

Cretnik, S., Thoreson, K.A., Bernstein, A., Ebert, K., Buchner, D., Laskov, C., Haderlein, S., Shouakar-Stash, O., Kliegman, S., McNeill, K., Elsner, M., 2013. Reductive dechlorination of TCE by chemical model systems in comparison to dehalogenating bacteria: insights from dual element isotope analysis (C-13/C-12, Cl-37/Cl-35). Environ. Sci. Technol. 47, 6855-6863. DOI: 10.1021/es400107n

Cretnik, S., Bernstein, A., Shouakar-Stash, O., Loffler, F., Elsner, M., 2014. Chlorine isotope effects from isotope ratio mass spectrometry suggest intramolecular C-Cl bond competition in trichloroethene (TCE) reductive dehalogenation. Molecules 19, 6450-6473. DOI: 10.3390/molecules19056450.

Elsner, M., Zwank, L., Hunkeler, D., Schwarzenbach, R.P., 2005. A new concept linking observable stable isotope fractionation to transformation pathways of organic pollutants. Environ. Sci. Technol. 39, 6896-6916. DOI: 10.1021/es0504587

Elsner, M., Cwiertny, D.M., Roberts, A.L., Lollar, B.S., 2007. 1,1,2,2-tetrachloroethane reactions with OH-, Cr(II), granular iron, and a copper-iron bimetal: Insights from product formation and associated carbon isotope fractionation. Environ. Sci. Technol. 41, 4111-4117. DOI: 10.1021/es063040x

Elsner, M., Hunkeler, D., 2008. Evaluating chlorine isotope effects from isotope ratios and mass spectra of polychlorinated molecules. Anal. Chem. 80, 4731-4740. DOI: 10.1021/ac702543y

Elsner, M., 2010. Stable isotope fractionation to investigate natural transformation mechanisms of organic contaminants: principles, prospects and limitations. J. Environ. Monit. 12, 2005-2031. DOI: 10.1039/c0em00277a

Fletcher, K.E., Löffler, F.E., Richnow, H.H., Nijenhuis, I., 2009. Stable carbon isotope fractionation of 1,2-dichloropropane during dichloroelimination by *Dehalococcoides* populations. Environ. Sci. Technol. 43, 6915–6919. DOI: 10.1021/es900365x

Franke, S., Lihl, C., Renpenning, J., Elsner, M., Nijenhuis, I., 2017. Triple-element compound-specific stable isotope analysis of 1,2-dichloroethane for characterization of the underlying dehalogenation reaction in two *Dehalococcoides mccartyi* strains. FEMS Microbiol. Ecol. 93, fix137. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1093/femsec/fix137

Frascari, D., Fraraccio, S., Nocentini, M., Pinelli, D., 2013. Aerobic/anaerobic/aerobic
sequenced biodegradation of a mixture of chlorinated ethenes, ethanes and methanes in
batch bioreactors. Bioresour Technol. 128, 479-486. DOI:
https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2012.10.026

Frascari, D., Pinelli, D., Nocentini, M., Baleani, E., Cappelletti, M., Fedi, S., 2008. A kinetic study of chlorinated solvent cometabolic biodegradation by propane-grown *Rhodococcus* sp PB1. Biochem. Engin. J. 42, 139-147. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bej.2008.06.011

Frascari, D., Pinelli, D., Nocentini, M., Fedi, S., Pii, Y., Zannoni, D., 2006. Chloroform degradation by butane-grown cells of *Rhodococcus aetherovorans* BCP1. Appl. Microbiol. Biotechnol. 73, 421-428. DOI: 10.1007/s00253-006-0433-3.

Grostern A., Edwards EA. 2006. Growth of *Dehalobacter* and *Dehalococcoides* spp. during degradation of chlorinated ethanes. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 72:428-436. DOI: 10.1128/AEM.72.1.428-436.2006

Harding, K.C., Lee, P.K., Bill, M., Buscheck, T.E., Conrad, M.E., Alvarez-Cohen, L., 2013. Effects of varying growth conditions on stable carbon isotope fractionation of

trichloroethene (TCE) by tceA-containing *Dehalococcoides mccartyi* strains. Environ. Sci. Technol. 47, 12342-12350. DOI: 10.1021/es402617q

Hofstetter, T.B., Reddy, C.M., Heraty, L.J., Berg, M., Sturchio, N.C., 2007. Carbon and chlorine isotope effects during abiotic reductive dechlorination of polychlorinated ethanes. Environ. Sci. Technol. 41, 4662-4668. DOI: 10.1021/es0704028

Hunkeler, D., Aravena, R., Berry-Spark, K., Cox, E., 2005. Assessment of degradation pathways in an aquifer with mixed chlorinated hydrocarbon contamination using stable isotope analysis. Environ. Sci. Technol. 39, 5975-5981. DOI: 10.1021/es048464a

Hunkeler, D., Aravena, R., Cox, E., 2002. Carbon isotopes as a tool to evaluate the origin and fate of vinyl chloride: laboratory experiments and modeling of isotope evolution. Environ. Sci. Technol. 36, 3378-3384. DOI: 10.1021/es011479d

Kuntze, K., Kozell, A., Richnow, H.H., Halicz, L., Nijenhuis, I., Gelman, F., 2016. Dual carbon–bromine stable isotope analysis allows distinguishing transformation pathways of ethylene dibromide. Environ. Sci. Technol. 50, 9855-9863. DOI: 10.1021/acs.est.6b01692

Leys, D., Adrian, L., Smidt, H., 2013. Organohalide respiration: microbes breathing chlorinated molecules. Phil. Trans. R. Soc. B. 368 20120316. DOI: 10.1098/rstb.2012.0316

Martín-González, M., Mortan, S.H., Rosell, M., Parladé, E., Martínez-Alonso, M., Gaju, N., Caminal, G., Adrian, L., Marco-Urrea, E., 2015. Stable carbon isotope fractionation during 1,2-dichloropropane-to-propene transformation by an enrichment culture containing *Dehalogenimonas* strains and a *dcpA* gene. Environ. Sci. Technol. 49, 8666-8674. DOI: 10.1021/acs.est.5b00929

Moe, W.M., Rainey, F.A., Yan, J., 2016. The genus *Dehalogenimonas*, in: Adrian, L., Löffler, F.E. (Eds.), Organohalide-respiring bacteria. Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg. DOI 10.1007/978-3-662-49875-0\_7

Mortan, S.H., Martín-González, L., Vicent, T., Caminal, G., Nijenhuis, I., Adrian, L., Marco-Urrea, E., 2017. Detoxification of 1,1,2-trichloroethane to ethene in a bioreactor co-culture of *Dehalogenimonas* and *Dehalococcoides mccartyi* strains. J. Hazard. Mater. 331, 218-225. DOI: 10.1016/j.jhazmat.2017.02.043

Mundle, S.O.C., Johnson, T., Lacrampe-Couloume, G., Perez-de-Mora, A., Duhamel, M., Edwards, E.A., McMaster, M.L., Cox, E., Revesz, K., Lollar, B.S., 2012. Monitoring biodegradation of ethene and bioremediation of chlorinated ethenes at a contaminated site using compound-specific isotope analysis (CSIA). Environ. Sci. Technol. 46, 1731-1738. DOI: 10.1021/es202792x

Němeček, J., Dolinová, I., Macháčková, J., Špánek, R., Ševců, A., Lederen, T., Černík, M., 2017. Stratification of chlorinated ethenes natural attenuation in an alluvial aquifer assessed by hydrochemical and biomolecular tools. Chemophere 184, 1157-1167. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2017.06.100

Pagana, M., Cooperab, W.J., Joensa, J.A., 1998. Kinetic studies of the homogeneous abiotic reactions of several chlorinated aliphatic compounds in aqueous solution. Appl. Geochem. 13, 779–785. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/S0883-2927(98)00005-5

Palau, J., Shouakar-Stash, O., Hunkeler, D., 2014. Carbon and chlorine isotope analysis
to identify abiotic degradation pathways of 1,1,1-trichloroethane. Environ. Sci. Technol.
48, 14400-14408. DOI: 10.1021/es504252z

Palau, J., Yu, R., Hatijah Mortan, S., Shouakar-Stash, O., Rosell, M., Freedman, D.L., Sbarbati, C., Fiorenza, S., Aravena, R., Marco-Urrea, E., Elsner, M., Soler, A., Hunkeler, D., 2017. Distinct dual C-Cl isotope fractionation patterns during anaerobic biodegradation of 1,2-dichloroethane: potential to characterize microbial degradation in the field. Environ Sci Technol. 51, 2685-2694. DOI: 10.1021/acs.est.6b04998

Pankow J.F., Cherry J.A. Dense chlorinated solvents and other DNAPLs in groundwater: history, behavior, and remediation. Portland, OR: Waterloo Press; 1996.

Patterson, B.M., Lee, M., Bastow, T.P., Wilson, J.T., Donn, M.J., Furness, A., Goodwin, B., Manefield, M., 2016. Concentration effects on biotic and abiotic processes in the removal of 1,1,2-trichloroethane and vinyl chloride using carbon-amended ZVI. J. Contam. Hydrol. 188, 1-11. DOI: 10.1016/j.jconhyd.2016.02.004

Sherwood Lollar, B., Hirschorn, S., Mundle, S.O., Grostern, A., Edwards, E.A., Lacrampe-Couloume, G., 2010. Insights into enzyme kinetics of chloroethane biodegradation using compound specific stable isotopes. Environ. Sci. Technol. 44, 7498–7503. DOI: 10.1021/es101330r

Schmidt, M., Lege, S., Nijenhuis, I., 2014. Comparison of 1,2-dichloroethane, dichloroethene and vinyl chloride carbon stable isotope fractionation during dechlorination by two *Dehalococcoides* strains. Water Res. 52, 146-154. DOI: 10.1016/j.watres.2013.12.042.

Scott, K.M., Lu, X., Cavanaugh, C.M., Liu, J.S., 2004. Optimal methods for estimating kinetic isotope effects from different forms of the Rayleigh distillation equation. Geochim. Cosmochim. Ac. 68, 433-442. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/S0016-7037(03)00459-9

Song, H., Carraway, E.R., 2005. Reduction of chlorinated ethanes by nanosized zerovalent iron: kinetics, pathways, and effects of reaction conditions. Environ. Sci. Technol. 39, 6237-6245. DOI: 10.1021/es048262e

Vannelli, T., Logan, M., Arciero, D.M., Hopper, A.B., 1990. Degradation of halogenated aliphatic compounds by the ammonia-oxidizing bacterium *Nitrosomonas europaea*. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 56, 1169-1171.

Vanstone, N., Elsner, M., Lacrampe-Couloume, G., Mabury, S., Sherwood Lollar, B., 2008. Potential for identifying abiotic chloroalkane degradation mechanisms using carbon isotopic fractionation. Environ. Sci. Technol. 42, 126–132. DOI: 10.1021/es0711819

Yan, J., Rash, B.A., Rainey, F.A., Moe, W.M., 2009. Isolation of novel bacteria within the Chloroflexi capable of reductive dechlorination of 1,2,3-trichloropropane. Environ. Microbiol. 11, 833-843. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1462-2920.2008.01804.x

Zhao, S., Ding, C., He, J., 2015. Detoxification of 1,1,2-Trichloroethane to ethene by *Desulfitobacterium* and identification of its functional reductase gene. PLoS ONE 10, e0119507. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0119507