

**NEW TRENDS IN TRANSLATION STUDIES**

---

**Vol. 6**

# **Translating Dialects and Languages of Minorities**

## **Challenges and Solutions**

---

Federico M. Federici (ed.)

Peter Lang

Bibliographic information published by Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek.  
Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche National-  
bibliografie; detailed bibliographic data is available on the Internet at  
<http://dnb.d-nb.de>.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data:

Translating dialects and languages of minorities : challenges and  
solutions / Federico M. Federici (ed).

p. cm. -- (New trends in Translation Studies; 6)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-3-0343-0178-7 (alk. paper)

1. Translating and interpreting. 2. Language and  
languages--Variation. 3. Dialectology. I. Federici, Federico M.

P306.2.T7356 2011

418'.02--dc23

2011023640

ISSN 1664-249X

ISBN 978-3-0343-0178-7

© Peter Lang AG, International Academic Publishers, Bern 2011  
Hochfeldstrasse 32, CH-3012 Bern, Switzerland  
[info@peterlang.com](mailto:info@peterlang.com), [www.peterlang.com](http://www.peterlang.com), [www.peterlang.net](http://www.peterlang.net)

All rights reserved.

All parts of this publication are protected by copyright.

Any utilisation outside the strict limits of the copyright law, without  
the permission of the publisher, is forbidden and liable to prosecution.

This applies in particular to reproductions, translations, microfilming,  
and storage and processing in electronic retrieval systems.

Printed in Germany

## Contents

Acknowledgements vii

List of Figures ix

List of Tables xi

FEDERICO M. FEDERICI

Introduction: Dialects, idiolects, sociolects:  
Translation problems or creative stimuli? i

HILAL ERKAZANCI-DURMUŞ

1 A critical sociolinguistic approach to translating  
marginal voices: The case of Turkish translations 21

GIOVANNI NADIANI

2 On the translation fallout of defeated languages:  
Translation and change of function of dialect in Romagna 31

SUSANNE GHASSEMPUR

3 Fuckin' Hell! Dublin soul goes German:  
A functional approach to the translation of  
'fuck' in Roddy Doyle's *The Commitments* 49

XOÀN MANUEL GARRIDO VILARIÑO

4 The paratranslation of the works of Primo Levi 65

## ESTHER MORILLAS

- 5 When dialect is a protagonist too:  
Erri de Luca's *Montedidio* in Spanish 89

## CATERINA BRIGUGLIA

- 6 Comparing two polysystems: The cases of Spanish and  
Catalan versions of Andrea Camilleri's *Il cane di terracotta* 109

## FEDERICO M. FEDERICI

- 7 'Anche questa l'ho in quel posto':  
Calvino translates Queneau's popular language 127

## ANNA FOCHI

- 8 The cultural issue in intersemiotic translation: The case of  
Francesco Rosi's *Cronaca di una morte annunciata* (1987) 153

## MARTA ORTEGA SÁEZ

- 9 The publication of *Mrs Dalloway* in Catalonia:  
Is it possible to reconcile commercial interests and culture? 171

## ANISSA DAOUDI

- 10 Translating e-Arabic: Challenges and issues 187

- Bibliography 205

- Notes on Contributors 223

- Index 227

## Acknowledgements

This volume is the result of several years of enriching collaboration between the editor and the contributors to the volume. Drafts were discussed, ideas shaped, reformulated, and developed over time. By collecting materials that discuss differences and diversity, one constant interrelation is the consideration of translation as a social, economical, cultural, linguistic, and aesthetic event in which the active agents play an incredibly variable number of roles. The contributors' diverse methodologies bring into the spotlight several questions: what can be profitably discussed from opposite sides? How do we establish what lies at the margins and at the centre? Do we discover that translational opposites are never too far apart?

Along the way friends and colleagues entered into a dialogue with this collective volume as well as with the theoretical messages of the contributions included here. A first draft of the book with its articles formatted was put together with great care by Elizabeth Alpass; later on Michael Whitehouse offered a substantial contribution to the revision of the proofs. My gratitude goes to Carlo Caruso, Delia Chiaro, Theresa Federici, Jeremy Munday, and Don Starr who read some of the contributions to be included in this collection with the interest and passion that distinguishes them.

Durham Translators Limited employed Rachel Stephenson to translate Xoàn Manuel Garrido Villariño's and Esther Morillas' contributions from Spanish into English; Caterina Briguglia's contribution was translated from Italian into English by the editor.

The choral attention to reading and rereading the contributions for their content has left the editor solely responsible for any remaining typographical slips.

Permission to republish the cover pages of Primo Levi's works has been granted by Einaudi Editore S.p.A; my thanks go to Dott.ssa Laura Passarolo of the Einaudi copyrights office, as well as Dott.ssa Irene Soave of the Centro Internazionale di Studi Primo Levi in Turin.

MARTA ORTEGA SÁEZ

9 The publication of *Mrs Dalloway* in Catalonia:  
Is it possible to reconcile commercial interests  
and culture?

Introduction

On 15 May 2003 the director and copy-editor of the Catalan publishing house Proa,<sup>1</sup> Isidor Cònsul (2003: 6), wrote a reply in the supplement of the journal *El País*, *Quadern* to the article by the writer and translator Carles Miró, which had appeared some weeks before in the same publication. Miró's observation, that the recently released translation of Virginia Woolf's *Mrs Dalloway* was simply a copy typed anew from the 1930 original translation of the text by Cèsar August Jordana with the hardcover of an image of the film *The Hours*, infuriated the publisher. The copy-editor and director of Proa, the late literary critic and writer Cònsul, assured in his article that 'it is not true that the edition in circulation [of *Mrs Dalloway*] is the one from 1930'.<sup>2</sup>

After offering a comparison of the first translation into Catalan of *Mrs Dalloway* with the 2003 translation of the same text, I will show to what extent Cònsul's claim is accurate. Furthermore, taking into account Lefevere's (1997) descriptive approach to Translation Studies, I will emphasize the evident reminiscences of the period in which the first Catalan translation was produced, namely, the Noucentisme, and the ideological positioning of the translator, Cèsar August Jordana.

1 Edicions Proa, founded in 1928, has been one of the leading publishing houses interested in promoting the Catalan language and culture.

2 Translations into English are mine unless otherwise stated.

## Descriptive approach to the translations

### *Descriptive Translation Studies*

In order to substantiate my analysis of the translations of *Mrs Dalloway*, it is pertinent to devote part of my writing to outlining the foundations of my theoretical approach, which is situated within Descriptive Translation Studies (DTS). DTS approaches require of the analyst some knowledge of the target culture context and highlight the importance of the figure of the translator as a key factor in the decision-making process in translation. Descriptivism is, according to Holmes's (1972/2000: 176) terminology, 'the branch of the discipline [within translation studies] which constantly maintains the closest contact with the empirical phenomena under study'. Therefore, it is derived from or relating to experiment and observation rather than theory and focuses on the function (Function-oriented DTS), the product or output (Product-oriented DTS), or the process of translation (Process-oriented DTS) – always following Holmes's terminology. Out of these three possible foci, I will focus on the function-oriented and the product-oriented perspectives. The former deals with the context in which a translation is produced and the latter attempts to map, describe, and explain the translation. I will not focus on the third, process-oriented DTS, as this approach deals with the mental operations carried out by the translator and it is beyond my field of study.

From the function-oriented point of view, we can deduce that the translation act is contextualized and culture-bound. Descriptivism shifts the focus of attention away from the source text (ST) and places it on the target pole, namely the receiving culture. The intended objective of the translation in its new environment is what determines the shape of the target text (TT). Therefore, in order to match the requirements of the target context, linguistic – which includes 'semantic content, [...] formal contour of the original, [...] aesthetic features' (Bassnett 1980: 6) – and conceptual modifications may take place in translation. In any event, the function of the translation is decided by the translator, or by whoever

commissions the translation, identified by Lefevere (1997: 29) as 'the professional' who is within the literary system, including 'critics, reviewers, teachers and translators'. Lefevere (ibid.) also talks about a second force, which can determine the function of translation:

The person who controls everything from outside the literary system; a patronage understood as something similar to the powers (people, institutions) which can promote or constrain the reading, writing or re-writing of literature.

Finally, the third factor that controls the function of literary translations is the 'dominant poetics of a period' within the target culture (ibid.: 34). Taking this view into consideration, Hermans (2002: 1) states that, 'This kind of translation studies stands to the practice of translation in essentially the same way as, say, [...] the way in which literary theory or literary history stand to literature'. Consequently, some equivalence can be established between descriptivism in Translation Studies and a cultural materialist approach to literature. Both approaches include an analysis of historical material – literature included – within a politicized framework, which includes gender studies.

Descriptivism also focuses on the product or output obtained after the translation process. It does not intend to judge or evaluate translations, but tries to draw conclusions regarding the particular decisions made by the translator. Translation scholars who work from this approach try to answer who translates what, when, how, for whom, in what context, and with what effect, as well as trying to explain why these aspects are all as they are. These explanations, of a hypothetical nature, can be found in the culture for which the translation was made, and do not attempt to be prescriptive, which implies that there is no attempt to interfere with the way in which translators go about their task. Descriptive scholars in translation try to discover the motivation of the choices made by a translator, or a generation of translators. This aim implies inquiring into the priorities and strategies which have determined the preference for certain options over others which were also available.

### *Contextualization of the Catalan translations*

Virginia Woolf's fourth novel, *Mrs Dalloway* (1925), promptly arrived in Spain in 1930. Only five years after the publication of *Mrs Dalloway* in Great Britain, Cèsar August Jordana, produced the Catalan translation of the text for the publishing house Proa, thus making the text available to the Catalan-speaking readership. The translation into Catalan was not only the first translation of a text by Virginia Woolf into Catalan but the first text by Woolf introduced in the Spanish State. The context in which the novel was translated is known as the Noucentisme. The Noucentisme is a cultural movement, with political repercussions, which began in Catalonia in around 1906 and came to an end with Primo de Rivera's coup d'état in 1923. The term 'Noucentisme' was coined by the writer and critic Eugeni d'Ors to designate the beginning of the twentieth century. The term is a playful reference to established literary periodization and it recalls the Italian Quattrocento and Cinquecento. Furthermore, 'nou' means 'new', the opposite of 'old', and refers to expectation that the recently begun century will bring freshness.

In terms of form, the Noucentistes rebuked the romanticism and the realism of the nineteenth century and were inspired by the features of classicism. Furthermore, Noucentisme encouraged a return to order and normality after the excesses of radicalism, bohemianism, and individualism that had characterized some of the major figures of modernism. In spite of their attempt to imitate the classics as regards simplicity, Noucentista literature bordered baroque because of its contrived use of language.

In terms of genres, the Noucentistes were not particularly interested in the narrative genre and they were against the form of a well-made novel. They considered the language used in novels dialectal and full of shortcomings, a premise totally unacceptable for such a group of authors who took a special care in creating a refined and polished Catalan language.

In terms of innovations, anti-novels became very important at the time of Noucentisme. In these anti-novels, the deconstruction of the narrative genre is remarkable in so far as writers decided to break with previously valid parameters (the fables written by Eugeni d'Ors in his *Glosari* or Carles Soldevila's *L'abrandament* of 1917 illustrate the effects of this phenomenon).

Thus, the novel became a minor genre during the time of Noucentisme, although Narcís Oller and Joaquim Ruyra were outstanding novelists of the period. The most important narrative genres were the short stories and the tales, which thrived in the literary panorama of this movement. Both genres are shorter and the ideas are more concentrated. In addition to these, other exploited genres were poetry, essays, and oratory.

The group of intellectuals and writers animating the Noucentisme attempted to reach perfection both linguistically and thematically. Literature was the outcome of an intellectual process, only available to minorities. Thus, art became elitist and classist.

The Noucentista period is characterized by introducing and promoting high numbers of translations into Catalan from different languages. Jordana (1938: 357–8) defines this period as 'the Golden Age of our translations'. During those years, many Catalan writers and professional translators translated 'canonical' authors from other literary systems: Josep Lleonart translated Goethe; Marià Manent translated Kipling; and Jordana translated Shakespeare, Woolf, and Dickens. Pericay and Toutain (1996: 258) affirm that:

The *Noucentisme* makes translation the privileged experimental field upon which the most influential literary Catalan prose of the twentieth century will be shaped. The noucentistes look towards the classics and towards the traditions of foreign cultures, enviably consolidated since many centuries ago, and the procedure employed to carry out their project is very similar to the one used during the Renaissance of the different European cultures: the recuperation of the Greek and Latin tradition and the interchange with the surrounding cultures through translation.

The authors continue by emphasizing that the forms of Noucentista prose are inherited from the type of prose used in the Noucentistes' translations. These translations, they go on to say, use a distorted and exaggerated language (ibid.: 260). The particular use they make of language characterizes the Noucentistes' writings. The search for 'purity, correctness and the refinement of the language' and the 'obsession for writing an aseptic Catalan of an immaculate and diaphanous academicism' (ibid.: 115) can be considered the key inspiring concepts embraced by this movement.

Hitherto I have been dealing with the context in which the first translation of *Mrs Dalloway* into Catalan was produced. The second context to bear in mind for the subsequent analysis is the one in which the fourth edition of *Mrs Dalloway* was released (2003). This last, and still the current, edition was published after the success of the film *The Hours*. Directed by Stephen Daldry and released in 2002, *The Hours* was itself based on the novel of the same name by Michael Cunningham, published in 1998 and receiver of the 1999 Pulitzer Prize for fiction.

*The translator: Cèsar August Jordana i Mayans*

Cèsar August Jordana i Mayans (Barcelona, 1893 – Buenos Aires, 1958) studied engineering, although he only exercised his profession for three years. Afterwards, he worked in different fields of the arts: as a contributor to journals such as *La Publicidad*, *Revista de Catalunya*, and *Opinió*; as an employee of the Generalitat de Catalunya (the autonomous Catalan government), where he was the Director of the Oficina de Correcció de Textos (the Office of Correction of Texts, dealing mainly with administrative language), as well as a writer. Among his writings, his most relevant publications are: *Quatre venjances* (*Four Revenges*, 1923), *El collar de la Núria* (*Núria's Necklace*, 1927), *Una mena d'amor* (*A Kind of Love*, 1931) – considered his true masterpiece – *Resum de literatura anglesa* (*A Summary of English Literature*, 1934), *Tres a la reraguarda* (*Three at the Rearguard*, 1940), and *El Rusio i el Pelao* (*Rusio and Pelao*, 1950). Furthermore, he translated widely from English into Catalan the works of well-known authors such as Aldous Huxley (*The Perennial Philosophy*, 1947; *Ape and Essence*, 1951), William Shakespeare (*Macbeth*, 1928; *Julius Caesar*, 1930; *Anthony and Cleopatra*, 1930; *Romeo and Juliet*, 1932; *Othello*, 1932), Thomas Hardy (*Tess of the d'Urbervilles*, 1929), H. G. Wells (*Love and Mr Lewisham*, 1930), George Meredith (*The Tragic Comedians*, 1934), Walter Scott (*Ivanhoe*, 1936 [s.d.]; *The Black Dwarf*, 1936), Mark Twain (*Tom Sawyer*, 1934; *Detective*, 1934), and R. L. Stevenson (*The Master of Ballantrae: A Winter's Tale*, 1953). He also translated from French, producing renderings of some of Voltaire's philosophical short stories, in collaboration with Carles Soldevila

and Pere Gimferrer. Additionally, he translated into Basque and Galician. He also knew Spanish, German, and some Esperanto.

He was particularly interested and active, as were the other writers in the Noucentisme, in making the Catalan language a tool that dignified the autochthonous literary genres in order to open the Catalan culture up to European standards. His commitment to the recovery of the Catalan language and culture is evident if we take into account that he was involved in different groups and institutions designated to promote the Catalan culture. In 1936, with the outbreak of the Spanish Civil War, he became the president of the Agrupació d'Escriptors Catalans (Society of Catalan Writers) and a member of the Institució de les Lletres Catalanes (Institution of the Catalan Arts).

At the end of the Spanish Civil War in 1939, before the nationalist troops reached Barcelona, Jordana, like many other Catalan writers, went into exile. He never returned to Catalonia and died in Buenos Aires.

*The publishing house: Edicions Proa*

The publishing house Proa, created in 1928 by Marcel·lí Antich and Josep Queralt, was a driving force behind the increase of Catalan translations. According to Hurtley (2001: 297):

Proa (Prow) was designed to promote a rise of the novel in Catalan following its low ebb during the Noucentista period when the novel was frowned upon. [...] As the Noucentista movement declined, then, the novel rose and Proa was a product, in 1928, of the new surge of interest in the novel on the part of writers and readers. Proa took on the publication of Catalan authors, both canonical and emerging, as well as the translation of established nineteenth-century foreign classics.

Along the same lines, Coll-Vincent (1999: 117) assures that 'the range of novels which appeared in the early years of the fiction series "A Tot Vent" (Editorial Proa) constitutes a remarkable achievement'. Proa's catalogue included translations of works by such authors as Honoré de Balzac, Charles Dickens, Thomas Hardy, George Meredith, Fyodor Dostoevsky, Leo Tolstoy, Aldous Huxley, Frank Swinnerton, Maurice Baring, Virginia Woolf, and Margaret Kennedy.

After the stagnation that the Catalan novel had undergone during the Noucentisme, the fundamental mission of Edicions Proa, as with other publishing houses such as Editorial Alfa, Editorial Catalana, and Editorial Barcino, went beyond commercial purposes. Although it is undeniable that Proa was interested in selling books, their purpose was, above all, to forge a tradition of novels in Catalan in order to put them on a par with the European narrative.

### Comparative analysis of the first and the last editions of *Mrs Dalloway* in Catalan

My interest does not lie in comparing the ST in English with a translation into Catalan, in so far as studies on the subject already exist.<sup>3</sup> What follows is an exhaustive comparison between the first translation of *Mrs Dalloway* into Catalan in 1930 (MD1) and the last edition from 2003 (MD2). The aim is to reveal whether Isidor Cònsul's statement, that the 2003 version is not the same as the one from 1930, may be considered accurate.

In the article previously alluded to, the publisher of MD2, Cònsul (2003: 6) declared that:

Cyclically, *Mrs Dalloway* has been published in the series A tot vent by Proa, and the different editions have sold out regularly. *Mrs Dalloway* was reprinted in 1970, in 1985 and since the last years of the decade of the 1980s it has been published in diverse pocket editions. Before that, the characteristic elements of *Noucentistes* translations were slightly polished up from the text due to the fact that in their attempt to domesticate the text, to make it more Catalan, [Noucentiste translators] domesticated everything including cultural references.

3 For more information, see Hurlley (2001) in which she rigorously compares some sections of the first translation into Catalan of *Mrs Dalloway* with the original by Woolf.

As a matter of fact, the first translation (MD1) presents a recurrent domestication of most of the proper names that appear in the ST. Perhaps this phenomenon, very common in the Noucentista movement, could be labelled as 'Catalanization', a calque on the Catalan term 'catalanització'. In *El malentès del Noucentisme. Tradició i plagi a la prosa catalana moderna*, Pericay and Toutain (1996: 277) consider this 'Catalanization' in translations during the Noucentisme 'a typical feature of this generation of translators'. Therefore, Lucy becomes Lúcia; Peter Walsh is now Pere Walsh; John is Joan; Elizabeth is Elisabet; Georges, Jordis; Hugh, Huc; and so on. However, the 2003 Catalan edition of *Mrs Dalloway* (MD2) restores the terms used in the ST, adding to the text a foreignizing element in most of the cases, although with some exceptions. For example, in the case of two references to someone called Wickam that we find on the very same page of MD1 (p. 81), the 2003 edition uses both, Wickam and Vickam (p. 61), the latter being a spelling more characteristic of the Catalan language which rarely employs the letter 'w'. It is highly probable that the reason for this inconsistency is due to a misspelling of the word and thus has no particular purpose. Despite the fact that it is easily recognizable as a typographic error, this lack of cohesion in the criteria of domestication may cause confusion in the readers, who could think that the text is referring to two different people.

Similarly, references to English culture have been given a Catalan translation in MD1 but are left in English in MD2: the Big Ben is the Gros Ben (MD1: 6) 'gros' meaning 'big'; and the Broad Walk becomes the literal 'Passeig Ample' (MD1: 29). Likewise, titles of books appear in English in the revised version of 2003 but were translated into Catalan in the 1930 text: '*Jaunts and Jollities* de Jorrocks; [...] *Soapy Sponge, Memoirs* de Mrs Asquith [...] *Big Game Shooting in Nigeria*' (MD2: 15) and '*Sortides i Joliveses* de Jorrocks; [...] *Esponja Sabonosa, les Memòries* de Mrs Asquith [...] *Casa Major a Nigèria*' (MD1: 13-14).

Apart from the 'Catalanization' of proper names and cultural references in MD1, the second modification that regularly recurs in the comparison between MD1 and MD2 lies in the use of miscellaneous vocabulary and expressions. There are numerous archaic expressions in MD1 which have been modernized in MD2. Table 6 below presents some of the changes introduced in MD2:



EX no.	SOURCE TEXT (1925)	TARGET TEXT 1 MD1 (1930)	TARGET TEXT 2 MD2 (2003)
1	Stood looking ahead of them (58)	Miraven fit davant <i>llur</i> (68)	miraven fit davant <i>seu</i> (54)
2	a presentiment of something that was bound to part them (39)	d'un pressentiment de <i>quelcom</i> que les separaria (46)	d'un pressentiment d'alguna cosa que les separaria (38)
3	he rapidly endows them with womanhood (64)	ràpidament els dota de <i>donia</i> (76)	ràpidament els dota de <i>condició de dona</i> (59)
4	He could see Clarissa (66)	Li semblava de veure Clarissa (78)	Li semblava veure Clarissa (61)
5	Water-closets (80)	water-closets (95)	wàters (73)
6	snob (82)	snob (97)	Esnob (74)
7	envelopes (28)	envelops (33)	sobres (29)
8	Pity she asked of Maisie Johnson, standing by the hyacinth beds (31)	Compassió demanava de Maisie Johnson, dreta vora el parterre dels jacints. (37)	Demanava compassió a Maisie Johnson, dreta vora el parterre dels jacints. (31)
9	thought how the entry love (34)	pensà com el senyors s'estimen (40)	Pensà com s'estimen els senyors (33-4)
10	Give out what the frank daylight fails to transmit (27)	lliuren allò que la claror franca del dia falleix a transmetre (32)	Lliuren allò que la claror franca del dia <i>no pot transmetre</i> (28)
11	The country reverts to its ancient shape (28)	el país <i>reverteix</i> a la seva forma antiga (32)	el país <i>torna</i> a la seva forma antiga (28)
12	She wrote reams of poetry those days (84)	escrivia <i>raimes</i> de poesia en aquell temps (100)	escrivia <i>molta</i> poesia en aquell temps (76)
13	Huddled up in Bath chairs (27)	arraulits en <i>cadirals</i> de rodes (31)	arraulits en <i>cadires</i> de rodes (28)
14	Not this way... (30)	No per aci... (35)	No per aquí... (30)
15	Regent's Park Tube Station (91)	l'estació de Regent's Park del subterrani (108)	l'estació de <i>metro</i> de Regent's Park (82)
16	smoking-room (82)	fumador (97)	sala dels fumadors (74)
17	she would give him everything (172)	li ho donaria tot (207)	li ho <i>donaria</i> tot (151)

Table 6 Sample of compared passages of the 1930 and the 2003 editions

Table 6 presents a small scale yet representative sample of the modifications that can be found between MD1 and MD2. Needless to say, there are others, but the ones selected above are particularly worth commenting on, as they are changes in which some of the characteristic features of the Noucentisme have been replaced by other expressions. To begin with, there have been some morphological modifications. In example 1, the possessive 'llur', which can only be used to refer to 'their' in Catalan, appears largely in translations during the Noucentisme whilst it has been substituted in some occasions by 'seu' in MD2, a much more common use of the possessive in standard Catalan. A similar thing occurs in example 2 with 'quelcom', which means 'something' in English and has been modified by 'alguna cosa' in the 2003 translation. A further morphological feature of Noucentisme consists of using loans and calquing morphological structures from other languages. In the texts we are dealing with, there are calques from the English language, such as the tendency to nominalize, which is quite contrary to the Catalan tradition. Thus, in example 3 we find the translation 'donia' in MD1 as a loan translation of 'womanhood', whereas in MD2 'condició de dona' has been used more along the lines of Catalan language. Another loan, this time from French, appears in the use of the preposition 'de' [of] before infinitives. A case in point is example 4, where 'li semblava de veure Clarissa' (MD1) becomes 'li semblava veure Clarissa' in MD2, which for the current reader sounds more appropriate than the first translation from 1930.

Another difference that can be found when comparing the two translations is the lexical modifications, found in the substitutions of the foreign terms which appeared in MD1 for Catalan ones in MD2. In the 1930 Catalan TT the use of foreign terms does not seem to be coherent throughout the translation. As I have already mentioned, all the proper names and cultural references were translated into Catalan, given the Noucentista eagerness to 'Catalanize' everything; nonetheless some terms were kept in English but later translated into Catalan in the 2003 version. In the examples 5, 6, and 7 we find clear illustrations of this phenomenon: 'water-closets' has been replaced by 'wàters', adapting the term to the Catalan language; 'snob' has been substituted for 'esnob' in so far as Catalan words do not tend to begin with a 's'; and 'envelops' is a loan from English which has been changed in the 2003 translation by the Catalan term 'sobres'. In addition to these

features, we find an attempt to use terms that are as different from their Spanish counterparts as possible. Examples 11 and 12 are obvious displays of this. One last remark on lexicon regards the substitution of archaisms; MD2 abandons forms in disuse and dated terms for more up-to-date ones, as visible in examples 13 to 17. 'Cadirals', 'ací', 'subterrani', 'fumador' and 'daria', from MD1, are terms which are no longer used in standard Catalan, whereas in MD2 the terms employed are much more common for the current reader: 'cadires', 'aquí', 'metro', 'sala dels fumadors' and 'donaria'.

Syntactically, translations made during the Noucentisme attempt to reproduce the word order of the source text. The result of this tendency is that target texts derived from this approach sound bizarre and far from the current use of Standard Catalan. Examples 8 and 9 in MD1 reproduce word by word, in the exact same order, the expressions and terms used in English: 'Compassió demanava de Maisie Johnson, dreta vora el parterre dels jacints'. MD1 adopts here an inversion of the position of the direct object and its verb; in Catalan they usually go in the reverse order as one can see in MD2. In example 9, there is again an inversion in MD1, which might have resulted unfamiliar to the current Catalan reader had there not been a modification in MD2.

Notwithstanding the number of changes mentioned above, there are many instances in the 2003 text that have been left exactly the same as in the 1930 translation, which, needless to say, lends the 2003 text a style that is artificial, superseded, and on many occasions hard to follow. As Miró (2003: 6) points out, MD2 is written in 'an orthopaedic Catalan [...] in a language preposterously incomprehensible', and goes on to affirm that:

Whether the reader accepts that he/she is dim and does not know enough Catalan to access that wonder [of *Mrs Dalloway*] as if he/she suspects that he/she is being laughed at, the result is exactly the same: the feeling – the certainty – that he/she is being driven out of the sacred field of Catalan literature, including Catalan translations, which are a very important part of the books which come out in the Catalan language.

First of all, the common use of the full verbal form 'ésser', instead of 'ser', is characteristic of the Noucentisme. This form appears on several occasions in MD1 and it has remained untouched in MD2, even though, currently, this is not a frequently used form of the verb.

Expressions that were not modified in the 2003 translation and maintain dated terms instead of using more current words in Catalan also deserve some attention. For example, the term for 'glass' in Catalan, 'vas', (MD1: 197; MD2: 144) does appear in dictionaries but it is not of current and frequent use nowadays. The term generally employed is 'got'. A similar pattern of leaving the revised version untouched can be found in the example synoptically presented in Table 7 below.

MD1	MD2	English	Current Catalan
cap a mercat (p. 12)	cap a mercat (p. 14)	past the market	Cap al mercat
una deu de llàgrimes, (p. 13)	una deu de llàgrimes (p. 15)	a well of tears	un munt de llàgrimes; moltes llàgrimes'
miraven fit davant ells (p. 67)	miraven fit davant ells (p. 53)	marched with their eyes looking ahead of them	miraven fixament davant ells
va enviar-li na nota per conducte de Sally (p. 85)	va enviar-li na nota per conducte de Sally (p. 65)	He sent a note to her via Sally	va enviar-li una nota a través de Sally
onsevulla (p. 91)	onsevulla (p. 70)	wherever	en qualsevol banda
comsevulla (p. 94)	comsevulla (p. 72)	somehow	de qualsevol manera
de mena simbòlica (p. 127)	de mena simbòlica (p. 95)	interrogatively	de forma simbòlica

Table 7 Obsolete Catalan expressions used in the 2003 *Mrs Dalloway* edition

The list of obsolete Catalan expressions still present in the MD2 given in Table 7 could have continued for pages. Just to demonstrate the extreme resemblance of the 2003 version to the first one produced seventy years before, I reproduce the opening paragraphs of both translations in parallel:

MD<sub>1</sub>

Mrs. Dalloway va dir que ella mateixa compraria les flors.

Perquè *Llúcia* ja tenia proa feina. Els homes de *can* Rumpelmayer havien de venir a treure les portes. I després, pensava Clarissa Dalloway, quin matí més fresc! – com fet expressament per a nens a la platja.

Quina delícia! Quin cabussó! *Vet ací* la impressió que tenia sempre quan, amb un petit grinyol de frontisses, que ara estava sentint, obria de bat a bat la porta balconera i es llançava vers Bourton i l'aire lliure. Que fresc, que tranquil, més quiet que ara, és clar, que era l'aire de bon matí; com el toc d'una onada; *com el bes d'una onada*; fred i esgarriador i tanmateix (per a una noia de divuit anys com ella era aleshores) solemnia, sentint com ella sentia, dreta allí al balcó obert, que alguna cosa terrible era a punt d'esdevenir-se; mirant les flors, els arbres que es deseixien de la broma, les cornelles que pujaven, baixaven; dreta allí mirant fins que *Pere* Walsh va dir: 'Rumiant entre vegetals?' – era això? – o bé això: 'Prefereixo els homes a les coliflors'? Devia dir-ho un dia després d'esmorzar, en sortir ella a la terrassa – *Pere* Walsh. (Woolf 1930: 5)

MD<sub>2</sub>

Mrs. Dalloway va dir que ella mateixa compraria les flors.

Perquè Lucy ja tenia proa feina. Els homes de Rumpelmayer havien de venir a treure les portes. I després, pensava Clarissa Dalloway, quin matí més fresc! – com fet expressament per a nens a la platja.

Quina delícia! Quin cabussó! *Vet ací* la impressió que tenia sempre quan, amb un petit grinyol de frontisses, que ara estava sentint, obria de bat a bat la porta balconera i es llançava vers Bourton i l'aire lliure. Que fresc, que tranquil, més quiet que ara, és clar, que era l'aire de bon matí; com el toc d'una onada; fred i esgarriador i tanmateix (per a una noia de divuit anys com ella era aleshores) solemnia, sentint com ella sentia, dreta allí al balcó obert, que alguna cosa terrible era a punt d'esdevenir-se; mirant les flors, els arbres que es deseixien de la broma, les cornelles que pujaven, baixaven; dreta allí mirant fins que Peter Walsh va dir: 'Rumiant entre vegetals?' – era això? – o bé això: 'Prefereixo els homes a les col·li-flors.' Devia dir-ho un dia després d'esmorzar, en sortir ella a la terrassa – Peter Walsh. (Woolf 2003: 9)

## Concluding remarks

After having compared the first translation into Catalan of *Mrs Dalloway* from 1930 with the 2003 edition, I can conclude that the 2003 translation is roughly a mere copy of the translation produced during the Noucentisme. This finding contradicts the comments of Proa's late director and copy-

editor, Isidor Cònsul. I have showed the modifications and lack of modifications made by the reviser – not translator, as there is lack of evidence to show that a new translation was produced – to the 2003 text in order to see whether the affirmations by the publisher of MD<sub>2</sub> are accurate.

Furthermore, my analysis leads me to the conclusion that, firstly, MD<sub>2</sub> is not a new translation; secondly, that MD<sub>2</sub> has not been well revised; and, finally, that Edicions Proa must have been only motivated by commercial interests in publishing MD<sub>2</sub>. MD<sub>2</sub> is almost the same text as the 1930 translation with a new cover that reproduces a shot from the film *The Hours*, showing the popular actresses Nicole Kidman and Julianne Moore. All things considered, I dare to say that Cònsul's categorical defence of the 2003 edition was inappropriate. Such editorial practices may be common, as they are also in other languages including hegemonic languages like English, but the efforts to blindly defend them against all visible evidence are debatable. They are also debatable for the unwanted, potential negative impact they could have on the development and spread of common and frequently used forms of minority languages, such as Catalan, when translations with obsolete expressions clash with current linguistic norms based on frequency of use among the speakers.

By privileging commercial interests over the truth, publishing houses such as Proa, once known for its efforts in defence and support of the Catalan language, may eventually also risk undermining their own pioneering work in support of the lingua-cultural system of Catalonia. With this shift of policy, Proa has dented the trust of its customers and seems to be trying to make fools of the readers by using a new and glamorous cover to attract a wider audience and, at the same time, offering a text written seventy years previously and stating that it is a new translation.

Were the 2003 edition to be promoted and publicized as a reprinted and revised version of Jordana's original rendering, the commercial interest might be reconciled with its original cultural objectives. However, when the editorial policy seems to be a cover-up – in Cònsul's words: 'it is not true' that Proa was reprinting – then, there are other issues at stake because leading cultural promoters appear to be giving in to mere commercial interest.