

## ALL ROADS LEAD TO COPD ... OR NOT?

Alvar Agusti<sup>1-4</sup> and Rosa Faner<sup>1,3-5</sup>

1. Cathedra Salut Respiratoria, University of Barcelona, Spain
2. Pulmonary Service, Respiratory Institute, Clinic Barcelona, Spain
3. Fundació Clinic, Institut d'Investigacions Biomèdiques August Pi i Sunyer (FCRB-IDIBAPS), Barcelona, Spain.
4. Centro de Investigación Biomédica en Red de Enfermedades Respiratorias (CIBER), Spain.
5. Immunology Unit, Department of Biomedicine, University of Barcelona, Spain.

**Corresponding author:** Prof. Alvar Agusti. Pulmonary Service, Respiratory Institute, Clinic Barcelona, C/Villarroel 170, 08036, Barcelona, Spain. Tel: +34 93 227 1701; e-mail: [aagusti@clinic.cat](mailto:aagusti@clinic.cat)

**Main text:** 1.643 words; **References:** 26; **Figures:** 1; **Tables:** 0.

**Short title:** Considerations on the SLIM risk calculator

**Key words:** Chronic bronchitis, Emphysema, Smoking, Lung function trajectories, PRISm

**Supported,** in part, by ISC-iii-FEDER (PI18/1008, PI21/00735, PMP21/00090), European Research Council (ERC, PredictCOPD, 101044387), SEPAR, Menarini and the Serra Hunter program.

23 Our understanding of the pathogenesis of Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease  
 24 (COPD) has changed very significantly over the past few years [1-4]. Since the seminal  
 25 description by Fletcher and Peto back in 1976, COPD was traditionally understood as a  
 26 self-inflicted disease by tobacco smoking occurring in old, “susceptible” males and  
 27 characterized by an accelerated decline of lung function with age [5, 6]. By contrast,  
 28 according to the 2023 Global Initiative for Chronic Obstructive Lung Disease (GOLD)  
 29 recommendations, COPD is now understood as a “*heterogeneous condition that results*  
 30 *from gene (G) - environment (E) interactions occurring over the lifetime (T) of the*  
 31 *individual (GETomics) that can damage the lungs and/or alter their normal*  
 32 *development/ageing process*” [7]. As a result of this new understanding, GOLD 2023  
 33 recognizes the existence of a *pre-COPD* condition that identifies “... *individuals of any*  
 34 *age with respiratory symptoms and/or other detectable structural (e.g., emphysema)*  
 35 *and/or functional abnormalities (e.g., hyperinflation, reduced lung diffusing capacity,*  
 36 *rapid FEV1 decline), in the absence of airflow obstruction on postbronchodilator*  
 37 *spirometry. These patients may (or may not) develop persistent airflow obstruction (i.e.,*  
 38 *COPD) over time*” [7]. GOLD 2023 also recognizes the category of *PRISm* (Preserved  
 39 Ratio (hence no airflow obstruction) with Impaired Spirometry) [8] which may (or not)  
 40 develop chronic airflow limitation (CAL) over time [7]. Understanding better what pre-  
 41 COPD patients eventually develop COPD or PRISm may allow better and earlier  
 42 preventive and management strategies [9-12].

43

44 In this issue of the *European Respiratory Journal*, Divo and coworkers report the  
 45 development and performance of a Simple, Low cost, and ease of IMplementation  
 46 (SLIM) calculator of the risk of developing incident CAL in middle-aged, ever-smokers  
 47 with normal spirometry [13]. To this end, they explored what combination of a number

of risk factors readily available in clinical practice (dichotomized at specific threshold values based on clinical criteria) can best predict the occurrence of incident CAL, defined by a postbronchodilator FEV<sub>1</sub>/FVC ratio <0.7 [13]. They used a Least Absolute Shrinkage and Selection Operator (LASSO) to train the predictive model in 677 ever-smoker participants in the Lovelace Smokers' Cohort (LSC) with a mean age of 54 years and normal spirometry at baseline, who were followed for a median of 6 years with multiple spirometries (median 5, IQR 4-6) [13]; of note, SLIM was validated in an independent cohort (COPDgene) [13]. Main results in the LSC cohort showed that: (1) about half of participants (54%) were symptomatic at baseline (i.e., defined by having either chronic sputum production, cough, or a modified Medical Research Council score >2 points) and were categorized as pre-COPD. By design (all participants had normal spirometry), none had PRISm at baseline; (2) during follow-up most individuals (n=489; 72%) maintained normal spirometries, whereas a few (n=110; 16%) developed incident CAL, an "unstable" spirometric pattern (n=63; 9%) or PRISm (n=15; 2%); finally, (3) the combination of a cumulative smoking exposure ≥30 pack-years, presence of chronic bronchitis, a body mass index (BMI) value <25 kg.m<sup>2</sup>, and an FEV<sub>1</sub>/FVC ratio between 0.75-0.70 predicted the development of CAL (AUC=0.84, 95% CI 0.81-0.89) [13]. Although age did not enter the model, it is of note that those patients who developed CAL during follow-up were significantly older at baseline (58±9 vs. 53±9, p<0.0001) [13]. Importantly, although these observations in the LSC have been derived from a population of individuals with very specific characteristics (82% females, no African American subjects), the validation of the findings in the COPDgene cohort with a great majority of men, and which included a significant proportion of African Americans, support their validity. Collectively, these observations are important because they contribute to better understand what combination of risk factors better

73 explain the transition (or lack of) from pre-COPD to COPD. However, we believe that  
74 several issues need careful consideration to frame them properly.

75

76 On the one hand, there may be some issues regarding the generalizability of results. By  
77 study design, authors only included in this analysis ever-smokers individuals with  
78 normal spirometry at the age of 54 years [13]. This strongly suggests that their lung  
79 function in early adulthood (25 years of age or so) must have been normal too. If so, we  
80 have to consider that the population studied here did not include individuals with  
81 abnormal lung development during infancy and adolescence, one of the two main  
82 mechanisms of COPD [7], so we have to interpret these results as risk factors for  
83 enhanced lung function decline in adulthood. In fact, this is documented in the study  
84 since participants who developed incident CAO had a higher mean rate of FEV<sub>1</sub> decline  
85 than that of those who remained in the normal spirometry category ( $31 \pm 48$  vs.  $10 \pm 37$   
86 ml/year, respectively;  $p < 0.0001$ ). Also, as acknowledged by the authors [13], one  
87 concern limiting the generalizability of these results is that Pre-COPD was defined at  
88 baseline based exclusively on symptoms (which were present in 54% of participants) in  
89 the context of a normal spirometry, but other potentially defining variables of pre-  
90 COPD, such as the diffusing capacity of carbon monoxide and/or chest computed  
91 tomography findings, were not available and thus not tested in this study.

92

93 On the other, Divo *et al* showed that cumulative smoking exposure  $\geq 30$  pack-years was  
94 significantly associated with incident CAL in this population but, somewhat  
95 surprisingly, active smoking was not [13]. According to the traditional Fletcher and Peto  
96 paradigm [5, 6] and the more recent GETomics proposal [4], the development of COPD  
97 requires the interaction of environmental factors (e.g., smoking) with the appropriate

98 genetic background (now more than one hundred genetic polymorphisms that increase  
99 the risk of COPD or abnormal lung function have been identified [14]) over the entire  
100 life-time of the individual. The fact that the population studied here comprises ever-  
101 smoker with normal spirometry at 54 years suggests that it may include a substantial  
102 proportion of “genetically resistant smokers” who, despite having smoked for many  
103 years, still managed to maintain their spirometry within the normal range. This,  
104 however, opens the possibility of comparing the genetic/epigenetic background of  
105 individuals in the LSC who developed incident CAL vs. that of those who did not.  
106 Alternatively, as shown in Figure 1, the population studied here includes many  
107 individuals with supranormal FEV1 values (>100% ref) who, in theory, may have lost  
108 lung function since early adulthood and still show a pseudo-normal spirometry at age 54  
109 years [3, 15-17].

110  
111 Likewise, Divo *et al* also reported that a BMI <25 kg.m<sup>2</sup> was a significant risk factor for  
112 incident CAL in this population [13]. This is in keeping with several previous  
113 epidemiologic observations in the Baltimore Longitudinal Study of Aging [18], the  
114 Tucson Epidemiologic Study of Airways Obstructive Diseases [19], the LEAD study in  
115 Vienna (Austria) [20] and the BODE cohort in Spain and the COPDGene study in the  
116 US [21]. What is surprising here, and somewhat difficult to understand, is that the mean  
117 ( $\pm$ SD) BMI value of the group of participants who developed incident airflow limitation  
118 was  $25.9 \pm 4.3$  Kg/m<sup>2</sup>, which is fully within the normal healthy weight range (18.5 -  
119  $24.9$  Kg/m<sup>2</sup>). By contrast, BMI in participants who did not develop CAL was  $28.6 \pm 5.4$   
120 Kg/m<sup>2</sup> ( $p < 0.0001$ ), which is closer (or at) the obesity range (BMI >30 Kg/m<sup>2</sup>). This  
121 raises the possibility that a higher BMI may actually be protective for incident CAL, as  
122 suggested by a recent meta-analysis on the “obesity paradox” in COPD that showed that

123 a “lower” BMI was a risk factor for accelerated lung function decline whereas a  
124 “higher” BMI had a protective effect [22].

125

126 It is also of note that a proportion of participants in the study by Divo *et al.* (9%)  
127 showed an “unstable” spirometric pattern without a clear lung function trajectory [13].  
128 This is in keeping with the results of Aaron and coworkers who showed that “diagnostic  
129 instability” (i.e., how often patients initially met criteria for a spirometric diagnosis of  
130 COPD but then crossed the diagnostic threshold to normal or *vice versa*) occurred in  
131 19.5% of patients with already mild-moderate airflow limitation included in the Lung  
132 Health Study, and 6.4% of those studied in the Canadian Cohort of Obstructive Lung  
133 Disease (CanCOLD) [23]. Of note, the risk of diagnostic instability was greatest in  
134 subjects whose baseline FEV<sub>1</sub>/FVC value was closest to the diagnostic threshold, as it  
135 was the case in the study by Divo *et al* (Figure 1). Also of note, Divo *et al* also showed  
136 that only 2% of the patients studied in this particular subpopulation of the LSC  
137 developed PRISm [8], suggesting that this abnormal spirometric pattern in middle aged  
138 individuals may not be associated with cumulative smoking exposure causing enhanced  
139 lung function decline but to abnormal lung development which, as discussed above, was  
140 probably absent in the patients studied here.

141

142 Finally, despite the attractiveness of SLIM, its implementation in clinical practice  
143 remains to be determined. Although the type of patients studied here (middle age, ever-  
144 smoker with normal spirometry) are not frequently seen in the clinic, they represent the  
145 majority of subjects participating in lung cancer screening programs [24], a setting,  
146 where the SLIM could prove of use to better select subjects likely to develop COPD.

147 Importantly, the majority (72%) of the middle-age, ever-smokers with normal  
148 spirometry did not develop incident CAL during the 6 to 10 years of follow-up [13],  
149 thus raising the question on how should these individuals be managed beyond  
150 reinforcing quitting smoking as early as possible [25] and probably monitoring them  
151 more closely with periodic spirometries [26]. Yet, we should not ignore that, despite  
152 their normal spirometry, many of these individuals (54%) already had symptoms, thus a  
153 health problem, so what treatment should/can we offer to them is currently uncertain  
154 [12], but certainly most needed [10, 11].

155

156 In any case, with these caveats in mind, the data by Divo *et al* should be welcomed to  
157 better understand some of the risk factors that influence the transition (or not) from pre-  
158 COPD to COPD, as well as for providing an easy-to-use tool to help to assess the risk of  
159 incident CAL.

160

## 161 REFERENCES

- 162 1. Lange P, Celli B, Agusti A, Boje Jensen G, Divo M, Faner R, Guerra S, Marott  
 163 JL, Martinez FD, Martinez-Camblor P, Meek P, Owen CA, Petersen H, Pinto-Plata V,  
 164 Schnohr P, Sood A, Soriano JB, Tesfaigzi Y, Vestbo J. Lung-Function Trajectories  
 165 Leading to Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease. *New England Journal of Medicine*  
 166 2015; 373(2): 111-122.
  
- 167 2. Agusti A, Faner R. Lung function trajectories in health and disease. *Lancet*  
 168 *Respir Med* 2019; 7(4): 358-364.
  
- 169 3. Agusti A, Hogg JC. Update on the Pathogenesis of Chronic Obstructive  
 170 Pulmonary Disease. *N Engl J Med* 2019; 381(13): 1248-1256.
  
- 171 4. Agustí A, Melén E, DeMeo DL, Breyer-Kohansal R, Faner R. Pathogenesis of  
 172 chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: understanding the contributions of gene–  
 173 environment interactions across the lifespan. *The Lancet Respiratory Medicine* 2022;  
 174 10(5): 512-524.
  
- 175 5. Fletcher C, Peto R, Tinker C, Speizer F. The natural history of chronic bronchitis  
 176 and emphysema. Oxford University Press, New York, 1976.
  
- 177 6. Fletcher C, Peto R. The natural history of chronic airflow obstruction. *Br Med J*  
 178 1977; 1(6077): 1645-1648.
  
- 179 7. Agustí A, Celli BR, Criner GJ, Halpin D, Anzueto A, Barnes P, Bourbeau J, Han  
 180 MK, Martinez FJ, de Oca MM, Mortimer K, Papi A, Pavord I, Roche N, Salvi S, Sin



- 181 DD, Singh D, Stockley R, López Varela MV, Wedzicha JA, Vogelmeier CF. Global  
 182 Initiative for Chronic Obstructive Lung Disease 2023 Report: GOLD Executive  
 183 Summary. *European Respiratory Journal* 2023: 2300239.
- 184 8. Wan ES. The Clinical Spectrum of PRISM. *American Journal of Respiratory and*  
 185 *Critical Care Medicine* 2022: 206(5): 524-525.
- 186 9. Agusti A, Alcazar B, Cosio B, Echave J, Faner R, izquierdo J, Marin J, Soler-  
 187 Cataluña J, Celli B. Time for a change: anticipating the diagnosis and treatment of  
 188 chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. *Eur Respir J* 2020: 56: 2002104.
- 189 10. Han MK, Agusti A, Celli BR, Criner GJ, Halpin DMG, Roche N, Papi A,  
 190 Stockley RA, Wedzicha J, Vogelmeier CF. From GOLD 0 to Pre-COPD. *American*  
 191 *Journal of Respiratory and Critical Care Medicine* 2021: 203(4): 414-423.
- 192 11. Martinez FJ, Agusti A, Celli BR, Han MK, Allinson J, Bhatt SP, Calverley P,  
 193 Chotirmall SH, Chowdhury B, Darken P, Silva CAD, Donaldson G, Dorinsky P,  
 194 Dransfield M, Faner R, Halpin DM, Jones P, Krishnan JA, Locantore N, Martinez FD,  
 195 Mullerova H, Price D, Rabe KF, Reisner C, Singh D, Vestbo J, Vogelmeier CF, Wise  
 196 RA, Tal-Singer R, Wedzicha JA. Treatment Trials in Young Patients with COPD and  
 197 Pre-COPD Patients: Time to Move Forward. *American Journal of Respiratory and*  
 198 *Critical Care Medicine* 2022: 205(3): 275-287.
- 199 12. Han MK, Ye W, Wang D, White E, Arjomandi M, Barjaktarevic IZ, Brown S-A,  
 200 Buhr RG, Comellas AP, Cooper CB, Criner GJ, Dransfield MT, Drescher F, Folz RJ,  
 201 Hansel NN, Kaner RJ, Kanner RE, Krishnan JA, Lazarus SC, Maddipati V, Martinez FJ,

- 202 Mathews A, Meldrum C, McEvoy C, Nyunoya T, Rogers L, Stringer WW, Wendt CH,  
 203 Wise RA, Wisniewski SR, Sciurba FC, Woodruff PG. Bronchodilators in Tobacco-  
 204 Exposed Persons with Symptoms and Preserved Lung Function. *New England Journal*  
 205 *of Medicine* 2022; 387: 1173-1184.
- 206 13. Divo MJ, Liu C, Polverino F, Castaldi P, Celli B, Tesfaigzi Y. From Pre-COPD  
 207 to COPD: a Simple, Low cost, and ease of IMplementation (SLIM) risk calculator. *Eur*  
 208 *Respir J* 2023: (in press).
- 209 14. Cho MH, Hobbs BD, Silverman EK. Genetics of chronic obstructive pulmonary  
 210 disease: understanding the pathobiology and heterogeneity of a complex disorder. *The*  
 211 *Lancet Respiratory Medicine* 2022.
- 212 15. Çolak Y, Nordestgaard BG, Vestbo J, Lange P, Afzal S. Relationship between  
 213 supernormal lung function and long-term risk of hospitalisations and mortality: a  
 214 population-based cohort study. *European Respiratory Journal* 2021: 2004055.
- 215 16. Çolak Y, Nordestgaard BG, Lange P, Vestbo J, Afzal S. Supernormal lung  
 216 function and risk of COPD: A contemporary population-based cohort study.  
 217 *EClinicalMedicine* 2021; 37: 100974-100974.
- 218 17. Schiffers C, Faner R, Ofenheimer A, Sunanta O, Puchhammer P, Mraz T, Breyer  
 219 M-K, Burghuber OC, Hartl S, Agustí A, Breyer-Kohansal R. Supranormal lung  
 220 function: Prevalence, associated factors and clinical manifestations across the lifespan.  
 221 *Respirology*: n/a(n/a).

- 222 18. Harik-Khan RI, Fleg JL, Wise RA. Body mass index and the risk of COPD.  
223 *Chest* 2002; 121(2): 370-376.
- 224 19. Guerra S, Sherrill DL, Bobadilla A, Martinez FD, Barbee RA. The relation of  
225 body mass index to asthma, chronic bronchitis, and emphysema. *Chest* 2002; 122(4):  
226 1256-1263.
- 227 20. Breyer-Kohansal R, Faner R, Breyer M-K, Ofenheimer A, Schrott A, Studnicka  
228 M, Wouters EFM, Burghuber OC, Hartl S, Agusti A. Factors Associated with Low Lung  
229 Function in Different Age Bins in the General Population. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med*  
230 2020; 202 (2): 292-296.
- 231 21. Divo MJ, Marin Oto M, Casanova Macario C, Cabrera Lopez C, de-Torres JP,  
232 Marin Trigo JM, Hersh CP, Ezponda Casajus A, Maguire C, Pinto-Plata VM, Polverino  
233 F, Ross JC, DeMeo D, Bastarrika G, Silverman EK, Celli BR. Somatotypes trajectories  
234 during adulthood and their association with COPD phenotypes. *ERJ Open Res* 2020;  
235 6(3).
- 236 22. Sun Y, Milne S, Jaw JE, Yang CX, Xu F, Li X, Obeidat M, Sin DD. BMI is  
237 associated with FEV(1) decline in chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: a meta-  
238 analysis of clinical trials. *Respir Res* 2019; 20(1): 236.
- 239 23. Aaron SD, Tan WC, Bourbeau J, Sin DD, Loves RH, MacNeil J, Whitmore GA,  
240 Canadian Respiratory Research N. Diagnostic Instability and Reversals of Chronic  
241 Obstructive Pulmonary Disease Diagnosis in Individuals with Mild to Moderate Airflow  
242 Obstruction. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2017; 196(3): 306-314.

- 243 24. Bradley C, Alexandris P, Baldwin DR, Booton R, Darby M, Eckert CJ, Gabe R,  
244 Hancock N, Janes S, Kennedy M, Lindop J, Neal RD, Rogerson S, Shinkins B,  
245 Simmonds I, Upperton S, Vestbo J, Crosbie PAJ, Callister MEJ. Measuring spirometry  
246 in a lung cancer screening cohort highlights possible underdiagnosis and misdiagnosis  
247 of COPD. *ERJ Open Res* 2023; 9(4).
- 248 25. Kohansal R, Martinez-Camblor P, Agusti A, Buist AS, Mannino DM, Soriano  
249 JB. The Natural History of Chronic Airflow Obstruction Revisited: An Analysis of the  
250 Framingham Offspring Cohort. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2009; 180: 3-10.
- 251 26. Agusti A, Fabbri LM, Baraldi E, Celli B, Corradi M, Faner R, Martinez FD,  
252 Melén E, Papi A. Spirometry: A practical lifespan predictor of global health and chronic  
253 respiratory and non-respiratory diseases. *European Journal of Internal Medicine* 2021:  
254 89: 3-9.
- 255

## 256 FIGURE LEGEND

257 **Figure 1.** This figure is a modification of the original Figure E3 in the paper by Divo *et*  
 258 *al* [13]. It presents a scatterplot of the baseline FEV<sub>1</sub> (% predicted) vs. FEV<sub>1</sub>/FVC ratio  
 259 of the 677 subjects studied in the LSC study. By design, all of them had normal  
 260 spirometry at baseline (FEV<sub>1</sub>/FVC>0.7 and FEV<sub>1</sub>>80% ref). Of note, many of them had  
 261 supranormal FEV<sub>1</sub> values (>100% ref; vertical dashed blue line). The red dots represent  
 262 the 110 participants who developed incident CAL by the end of the observation period  
 263 (6 years). For further explanation, see text. Reproduced with permission from reference  
 264 [13].

